PAKISTAN IMPACT REPORT

The World Citizens Panel:
Insights in Oxfam’s contribution to changes in people’s lives

JULY 2016
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 PAKISTAN’S CONTEXT</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 OXFAM STRATEGY FOR PAKISTAN</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 RIGHTS BASED APPROACH</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 IMPACT MEASUREMENT APPROACH IN BRIEF</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 STUDY OBJECTIVE</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 SURVEY PROCESS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 QUESTIONNAIRE</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 PARTNERS AND RESPONDENTS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 ANALYSES</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 STORIES OF CHANGE</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 DOMAINS</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 STORY COLLECTION</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3 CHARACTERISTICS OF STORYTELLERS</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.4 ANALYSIS</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. RESULTS OF THE SURVEY</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOOD</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 ESSENTIAL SERVICES</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 LIFE AND SECURITY</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 SOCIAL AND POLITICAL PARTICIPATION</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 GENDER AND EMPOWERMENT</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. RESULTS OF THE STORIES OF CHANGE</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 CHANGES IN SEXUAL AND REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH AND RIGHTS (GENDER JUSTICE): FAMILY PLANNING</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2 BARRIERS TO FAMILY PLANNING</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3 HOW CAN PEOPLE BE ENCOURAGED TO ADOPT FAMILY PLANNING METHODS?</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 CHANGES IN LIVELIHOOD</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.2 HELPING PEOPLE TO IMPROVE THEIR CROP AND LIVESTOCK YIELD .................................................. 39
4.2.3 HELP PEOPLE TO SELL THEIR YIELD FOR A HIGHER PRICE ..................................................... 43
4.2.4 HELP PEOPLE TO STRENGTHEN THEIR FOOD SECURITY DURING AND IN THE AFTERMATH OF FLOODS . 44
4.3 CHANGES IN DISASTER RISK REDUCTION .......................................................... 46
4.3.1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 46
4.3.2. BARRIERS TO PARTICIPATION IN THE PROJECT ACTIVITIES ............................................. 46
4.3.3. SKILLS TRAINING ................................................................................................................. 46
4.3.4. IMPROVING LIVELIHOODS ................................................................................................. 47
4.3.5 COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION AND SOCIAL BONDING ..................................................... 48
5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................................................... 49
ANNEXES .......................................................................................................................... 52
A.1 PAKISTAN QUESTIONNAIRE 2014 ................................................................................ 52
A.2 PAKISTAN INTERVIEW FORMAT STORIES OF CHANGE .................................................. 58
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This impact report is based on the combined efforts of the staff of Oxfam Novib and partners in Pakistan. Each local partner had a survey coordinator, who trained and guided interviewers to collect the data.

Key players for this exercise were of course the interviewers, who put great effort in obtaining reliable data from respondents in often insecure and harsh circumstances, and the respondents themselves, whose perceptions and insights form the basis of this impact report.

The overall quantitative data collection process was coordinated by Seher Afsheen of the Oxfam Pakistan office. The overall qualitative data collection and reflection process was coordinated and supported by Asim Saqlain. Statistical analysis was done by Tigist Mekuria, student at Wageningen University under the supervision of Peter Huisman, project leader of the World Citizens Panel. Analysis of the qualitative information was done by Kimberley Wallaart, qualitative researcher of the WCP team.
SUMMARY

An impact study was carried out by Oxfam Novib and partners in Pakistan in 2013/2014/2015 to determine the impact of their programmes on the lives of people in Pakistan. The study included a broad set of indicators, covering the major dimensions of poverty and injustice that Oxfam and partners were working on. Data was collected by partners in their own working areas with the help of a smart phone app, which transferred data into a central data base, managed and analysed by the Oxfam Novib World Citizens Panel team in The Hague. Qualitative data were obtained through collecting stories of change, which were also uploaded in the World Citizens Panel database and analysed by the WCP specialists in The Hague. This report presents the major findings of the impact analysis.

MAIN FEATURES OF THE PAKISTAN IMPACT STUDY

- About 80 interviewers carried out a total of 4,160 interviews
- Respondents were randomly selected and form a representative sample of the primary stakeholders (the total number of people participating in the projects) of Oxfam and partners in Pakistan
- Data collection for the survey took place in November, December 2013 and January 2014, whereby 14 partners carried out the surveys in their own operational areas; 8 of them included a control group in their surveys
- A reflection session was held with all partners to discuss the outcomes of the survey. Based on the results and these reflections three domains were selected for further research, using the qualitative stories of change approach.
- 54 Stories of Change were collected by 9 partners in 2015.
- The average number of years that respondents had participated in the activities of partner organizations varies a lot between partners (from a few months to 7 years, with averages around 2-3 year).
- Major project activities the respondents participated in were: sustainable livelihoods, health and natural disaster reduction and also many participated in humanitarian aid, access to information and gender justice.

MAIN OUTCOMES

Livelihoods

- The activities of Oxfam’s partners in Pakistan increased income and the value of assets of the target population (such as land, livestock, labour, productive assets and savings)
- Generally food security among the population is low. There is a positive impact, however, of the project activities on the number of months of food sufficiency, but a negative impact on the number of meals per day consumed
- The stories of change show that to improve the livelihoods of people that live in communities that are heavily reliant on agriculture and prone to flooding, it can be useful to undertake activities that help people improve their crop and livestock yield by combining the provision of agricultural inputs (e.g. improved/drought resistant seeds and livestock) with trainings on easier, cheaper, healthier, and more sustainable methods of production (e.g. organic farming methods, and livestock management). Income from agriculture can be further increased by helping people to secure a better price for their produce through collectively selling their produce.
- Food security can be strengthened by helping people to safely store and preserve a proportion of their produce to use for food and sowing (e.g. by training them how to dry and preserve vegetables and providing processing and storage facilities), and by helping them to acquire a second source of income in addition to farming.
Health and Education

- Oxfam’s projects have not had an impact on school enrollment rates, and little on health.
- The quality of the education children receive is rated higher by members of the target group of Oxfam’s partners than the control group, possibly showing a positive influence of partners’ educational work on schools in their working areas.

Disaster risk reduction

- Natural disasters are a major cause of damage to personal belongings with no significant difference between the target group and the control group. The target group of Oxfam’s partners feel more threatened by natural disasters and civil unrest than the control group (or are more aware of it)
- The target group has not taken more measures to cope with future disasters than the control group, neither do they feel more capable to do so
- The Stories of Change show that increasing people’s income, as well as their knowledge about and skills in dealing with the (after-)effects of a disaster, can result in people feeling more self-reliant and confident in their ability to cope and act in case of a disaster. Strengthening social ties by uniting people in community organizations for disaster risk management can further decrease people’s feelings of vulnerability.

Access to information and collective action

- Access to information on public issues is generally low
- The survey shows that members of the target group are more involved in community decision making and in collective actions against injustice

Women’s empowerment

- Women in the target group are economically empowered by the activities of Oxfam’s partners as indicated by their higher levels of involvement in decision making about household expenses than women in the control group
- Women participating in the activities of Oxfam’s partners report significantly less acts of violence against them
- The outcomes with regard to sexual and reproductive rights are rather ambiguous. Women from the target group report better access to contraceptives and the ability to talk with their husbands/partners about safe sex, but are less able to talk with their husbands about family planning
- The most important lesson learned from the Stories of Change about sexual and reproductive health and rights is that, in order to promote family planning and healthy reproductive behaviour among Pakistani women, it is of paramount importance that not only the women themselves are targeted, but that the knowledge, awareness, and attitudes of all the people that have the power to influence or make decisions about the reproductive behaviour of these women (in particular husbands and mothers-in-law) need to be improved simultaneously. Also, intra-marital communication needs to be improved. This is necessary to create an environment in which women are able to voice and assert their wishes for family planning, without (fearing) negative repercussions.
1. INTRODUCTION

The World Citizens Panel is an impact measurement method developed by Oxfam Novib. We combine quantitative research (impact surveys) with qualitative research (stories of change) to give participants in our programmes a voice, to learn how our programmes can be improved, and to contribute to the public debate on effectiveness of development cooperation. The method was introduced and implemented in Pakistan in 2014. This chapter describes the impact measurement approach and provides first a general overview of the Pakistan context and Oxfam’s approach and strategy in Pakistan. Chapter 2 describes the methodology, where after chapter 3 presents the results of the impact survey. The results of the stories of change are presented in chapter 4. The conclusions and discussion are then presented in chapter 5.

1.1 PAKISTAN’S CONTEXT

Over the last ten years, social development indicators of Pakistan show a deteriorating picture. According to the UN Human Development Index 2012, Pakistan is ranked 146th among 189 countries in terms of human development. Deteriorating law and order, ongoing conflicts, and threats of terrorism and instability in various parts of Pakistan mean that national resources are diverted to non developmental expenditures, such as military, para-military, police and associated judicial costs, increased investment in weaponry production etc. This is taking its toll on the quality and provision of social services. The lower and the lower middle classes are hit hard because of narrow and indirect taxation and the state’s failure to directly tax the rich and influential. As a result, the government is forced to seek external resources on exploitative terms and conditions, remove its’ economic fences to attract Foreign Direct Investment (FDI), resort to International Aid (read loan), indirect taxations and other tariff and non-tariff measures resulting in huge burdens for ordinary citizens, especially the poor. Under its Public Sector Development Programme (PSD) 2010-2011, the government hardly allocated 20% funds for the new projects. Poor governance, inefficient planning, lack of transparency and limited access of citizens to information regarding the State’s operations, management and implementation problems cause the expenditure far below from whatever minimum resources are allocated in the annual budget.

Governance

The state is characterised by poor governance, lack of accountability and transparency in governance, political instability and declining resources for basic services. However the emerging role of parliament, judiciary, media and civil society groups recently has increased public debate on government accountability. The regional situation is the reason for donor attention to Pakistan. Some important shifts in allied forces’ policy are expected, however, that may cause shift of the donor attention as well. In addition, due to corruption perceived nationally and internationally, supported by poor governance and delivery track record, the international community is reluctant to contribute in United Nation’s appeal for Flood Relief or to the financial needs emerging to address any other similar disasters. International donors have informed National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA) for its reluctance to contribute in UN appeal because gaps in reports by NDMA.

Conflict and fragility

Increasing security concerns and conflict in the region are enhancing the vulnerability of the civil society, ordinary citizens and the poor men and women in particular. Civil society interventions are becoming increasingly difficult and constrained under the rising extremism, law and order situation, intimidation, insecurities and problems associated. Security advice to Oxfam staff based at times creates challenges for field visits and mobility.

Natural disasters

Emerging trends include the impact of climate change. Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC) published data that provide scientific evidence about the impact of climate change in Pakistan. The simulated data set

---

shows that the temperature is rising and will rise further, leading to erratic climate pattern and devastating impact on the glaciers\(^3\). The recent floods (2010 and 2011) have shown the “abnormal” pattern of rains in terms of timing, duration and quantity of water. Thus, hazards associated with shortage or surplus of water has increased in its impact on the lives of people and this will continue to increase in future.

**Food, land and water**

Pakistan is facing the worst water management and supply crises in South Asia. The conflicts around Indus basin water management, mega water structures, dikes, barrages and drainage layouts, have all become part of the problem rather than a solution to water shortages, particularly for the most vulnerable.

Agriculture is the mainstay of Pakistan’s economy, accounting for 25 percent of the GDP, 60 percent of export earnings and 48 percent of employment. The National Nutrition Survey 2011 (NNS 2011) reported that 62 percent of Pakistan’s population is food insecure, while the International Food Policy Research Institute’s (IFPRI’s) Global Hunger Index (GHI) 2014 states that Pakistan is one of the most food insecure countries in Asia. The country has been ranked at number 57 on the GHI after Uganda, which is at number 56. “Over six million families in Pakistan own 50 million acres of land and around 94 percent of its farmers fall into the subsistence category. They cultivate less than 12.5 acres of land. Around 20 million people work in the grossly over-employed agriculture sector. Even if a fraction of farmers is thrown out, there is no sector strong enough to absorb it. It only proves the magnitude of social vulnerability and the country needs to be careful in trading a risky path.

**Education**

Pakistan has the largest number of illiterate people (approximately 100 million) in South Asian region, skipping Afghanistan. Women share the highest percentage i.e. approximately 70% of the total illiterate population. The absence of universal literacy presents a challenging situation for the country and supplements the already existing poverty. Incapability, morbidity, poor reproductive health, lack of productivity and inefficiencies are some of the key vulnerabilities mainly caused by lack of literacy and education. Young women and girls are unable to read, discuss, and understand reproductive health issues and adopt better and safe practices of child spacing and family planning. Of the total illiterate population in South Asia, 63 per cent are women and of the total out-of-primary school children, 71 per cent are girls. Pakistan and Nepal have the worst female adult literacy rates at 25 and 21 per cent respectively. Moreover, while the gender gap in education in South Asia as a region is the largest in the world, this gap is particularly glaring in these two countries.

**Women’s empowerment**

Women play an important role in all spheres of lives in Pakistan. However, despite their paid & unpaid labour contribution and their wealth of knowledge and capacity as an active member of the society, women are neglected by policy makers, and often not recognized as productive force. With current food inflation, poverty levels and climatic changes, the demand for social safety nets as a process of social development has increased manifold, and it is immensely important the women are inclusively targeted for all the development programmes.

**Civil Society**

The role and composition of civil society in Pakistan has significantly evolved in Pakistan over the last five years. In Pakistan, today, NGOs cannot claim to be the only civil society organisations. There are number of actors constituting the civil society of Pakistan, which has fundamentally altered the processes of bringing change at the grassroots level. These actors are media, lawyer groups, CBOs, trade unions etc. Change and empowerment at the grass root level is substantially changing the process and outcomes of civil society initiatives in general. For example, social and political movements and alliances around key and focused issues gained more attention and influence over the past years. The explosion of media, especially the social media and its ever expanding outreach to the youth is now playing a visible role in today’s Pakistan. Unfortunately, there is a growing dissatisfaction and systematic campaign and at times a hostile attitude of media against NGOs and CSOs of the country. There is a mounting pressure to change the hegemonies and power hierarchies in the country and a demand from the NGOs and CSOs for greater transparency and accountability from the society at large. There are hardly any examples in Pakistan where local NGOs are able to convert their work in social movements for change in favour of poor people.

---

\(^3\) Global Change impact Study 2010 - [http://www.gcisc.org.pk/climate.aspx](http://www.gcisc.org.pk/climate.aspx)
1.2 OXFAM STRATEGY FOR PAKISTAN

Vision of the Oxfam in Pakistan Programme
A society where everyone, particularly women, are exercising their rights, through effective citizenship and responsive governance.

Oxfam aims for “effective” citizenship rather than “active” citizenship as it is more dynamic and purposeful, going beyond active involvement toward demonstrable effectiveness in influencing the decisions and processes that affect people’s lives. The relationship with responsive governance — used in its broadest sense — is critically important. Given that violence and insecurity complicate and undermine Oxfam’s wider work, as well as represent a development issue in their own right, a conflict and social resilience lens will be applied throughout Oxfam’s work. Finally, whilst “everyone” obviously includes women, there is a deliberate emphasis on women’s rights, given Oxfam’s core values and the critical need to place gender equity at the heart of Oxfam’s work within the Pakistani context.

Overall Programme Goals

The Oxfam strategy for Pakistan is arranged in six Programme Pillars. There are strong inter-linkages between these Pillars with improved, more responsive governance (an overarching goal for the programme in many ways) and women’s empowerment as cross cutting themes. Initial work has begun with Youth, and targeting the unrealised potential of this large and vital group in development processes is another emergent theme.

There is a further emphasis on building resilience across the programme. While there are convincing arguments for placing work on DRR, climate change and adaptation under both the Humanitarian and Livelihoods pillars, Oxfam recognizes that work on DRR, climate change and adaptation are essential bridges between responding to humanitarian crises and longer term work helping people avoid losing hard won gains due to external shocks (whether occurring slowly or rapidly). This area is therefore placed in its own Pillar to ensure it receives sufficient attention and emphasis.

Pakistan has multiple and evolving conflict dynamics along with conflict management capacities that are of varying effectiveness. The resulting violence and insecurity both undermine and complicate Oxfam’s wider work and present a development issue in themselves. Insecurity may put staff, partners and beneficiaries at risk, hamper access and complicate effective programme management. Violence creates IDPs and other humanitarian needs. Rising extremism threatens gains made around women’s rights. Oxfam will work to develop and mainstream a cross cutting ‘conflict and social resilience’ lens throughout its work in Pakistan, developing a clearer understanding of what drives these dynamics and the implications for Oxfam’s programming and operations.

The overall Programme Pillars and associated goals are:
1. Gender Justice and Ending Violence Against Women
2. Education and Sexual & Reproductive Health Rights
3. Sustainable Livelihoods and Food Security
4. Disaster Risk Reduction, Adaptation and Climate Change
5. Humanitarian and Conflict transformation
6. Working in Urban contexts (an emergent theme)

1.3 RIGHTS BASED APPROACH

Oxfam has adopted a rights based approach to development and fights against poverty and injustice by empowering people to actively take part in social, economic and political processes, hold the powerful accountable for their actions and have an influence on decision making. Basic rights for every individual include aspects of economic and social well being, vulnerability and resilience to cope with external shocks, as well as rights to be heard and have an identity. Beyond the individual level, the rights based approach involves increasing the degree to which people are able to organise themselves in social and political organisations, and thus be able to hold their governments accountable and to influence political decision making.

The rights based approach has been operationalized by Oxfam in 5 fundamental rights:
1. the right to a sustainable livelihood
2. the right to basic social services
3. the right to life and security
4. the right to be heard (social and political participation)
5. the right to an identity (gender justice and diversity)

These five rights address the main dimensions of poverty. They have strong interrelations and are therefore considered as a whole. Activities that contribute to one of these rights may affect other rights as well. There are especially strong links between rights 4 and 5 on the one hand and rights 1, 2 and 3 on the other: empowerment of individuals is a precondition for their participation in social and political processes and decision making (right 4) about economic (right 1) and social (right 2) development, as well as to ensure their security (right 3). This needs to be the case for all individuals irrespective of the sex, ethnic or other group in society to which they belong (right 5). The work on education (as part of access to basic social services – right 2) is often done with the objective to capacitate people to improve their livelihoods (right 1) or to empower people, so that they can take part in political processes (right 4). The work on health (right 2) is also needed to ensure food and income security (right 1). These are just a few examples. Many other linkages between the five rights exist.

Oxfam’s goal is to have impact by changing the lives of people living in poverty and injustice. Its rights based approach focuses on shifting power relations, so that people can work on improvements in their own life. Impact will then be visible in the lives of people. As a result of a particular programme’s focus it is likely that more impact will be achieved on indicators directly linked to the particular programme. Because of the linkages between the five rights, as described above, impact may also be seen on indicators that are less directly related to the programme. It therefore makes sense to measure changes related to all five rights, irrespective of the focus of the interventions of a particular programme.

1.4 IMPACT MEASUREMENT APPROACH IN BRIEF

Oxfam Novib measures changes in peoples’ lives related to the programme over a longer period of time. The strategy involves a good balance of rigorous quantitative analysis on basis of predefined indicators (both general rights based poverty indicators and programme specific indicators defined by programme partners) and qualitative information through the collection and analysis of project participant’s stories of perceived changes in their lives. The strength is in the combination of both quantitative and qualitative approaches so that they reinforce each other.

Oxfam Novib has adapted the household surveys approach and the most significant change methodology for this purpose in order to make them relatively easy to use (and inexpensive), while still ensuring reliability of data. The approach makes use of mobile phone technology (an impact survey app), online automatic statistical reporting, video recording of stories of change etc.) for a cost effective and efficient evaluation.

Measuring impact in this way will contribute to improved strategic and financial resources management that enhances the cost-efficiency and cost-effectiveness of programmes and investments aimed to improve the lives of people living in poverty.

Oxfam Novib and 14 partners in Pakistan carried out an impact survey in 2013/2014. The survey started with an introductory workshop in Islamabad for all partners in July 2013. A toolkit with guidelines and (ICT based) tools was introduced and practiced during the workshop in order to facilitate data collection and reporting. Partners trained their own staff or external interviewers and took a random sample of beneficiaries and non beneficiaries to be interviewed for the impact survey.

This impact report on Pakistan presents the findings of the survey based on the data collected by the 14 partner organizations. Besides this country impact report, all partners have access to their own organisation’s results in the form of statistical tables and graphs.
1.5 STUDY OBJECTIVE

This impact report presents the results of the survey on a number of key indicators, derived from Oxfam’s rights based approach, in order to determine whether Oxfam’s programmes have an impact on the lives of people living in poverty. The study has done this by analysing specifically for the selected indicators:

- Whether there are significant differences between the target group and a comparable control group
- Whether there are significant differences between people who participated longer in project activities and people who participated for a shorter period of time
- Whether there are significant differences between people who participated in different types of activities and campaigns

2. METHODOLOGY

2.1 SURVEY PROCESS

In order to obtain reliable data, staff of partners were trained in all steps of the survey process. Key attention points were random sampling, the composition of a control group and ensuring data reliability. The following eight steps were followed:

- Partners defined the size of their target group (the number of beneficiaries/project participants that they work with directly)
- (Where possible) partners also identified a comparable control group of the same size as the target group and with the same characteristics as the target group, but without having benefitted from project activities.
- The required sample size was determined with an online sample size calculator. (www.surveysystem.com)
- A random sample of participants and members of the control group was drawn with the help of an online tool for random sampling (www.random.org)
- Survey coordinators in all partner organizations made lists of people to be interviewed, indicating the unique respondent’s code and the code of the programme they were part of.
- Interviewers were trained by staff of the partner organizations. Interviewers were preferably staff of the partners with good knowledge of the beneficiaries and their context. This makes it possible for them to ask also sensitive questions and judge whether the answers are a true reflection of the reality. They were trained in interviewing techniques aimed at reducing socially desirable, exaggerated, or other inaccurate answers. A successful interview would obtain reliable answers, whether positive or negative.
- Respondents were interviewed using an survey app on a smart phone or a paper-and-pencil questionnaire
- Data were uploaded from smart phones or entered into an online system (in case of paper-and-pencil questionnaires).

2.2 QUESTIONNAIRE

The standard questionnaire developed by the World Citizens Panel (in collaboration with partners from various countries\(^4\)) was discussed with Oxfam staff and partners in Islamabad. The full questionnaire can be found in

\(^4\) The basis for the standard questionnaire dates back to 2008, when Oxfam Novib staff and partners from India, Philippines, Ethiopia, Kenya, Bolivia, Pakistan, Senegal, Occupied Palestinian Territories and South Africa met in a series of workshops to define dimensions of poverty, key indicators and questions for measuring the impact of their work. The system was tested and
2.3 PARTNERS AND RESPONDENTS

Data from 14 partners that conducted interviews among their target (all 14) and a control group (8 partners) were included in the overall impact analysis.

In tables 1 and 2 the number of respondents per partner and the overall general characteristics of the respondents are presented.

Table 1. Partner organizations in Pakistan and their sample sizes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Partner organisations</th>
<th>Sample sizes (# of respondents)</th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lok Sanjh Foundation (LSF)</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td></td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia Partnership Pakistan (SAP-PK)</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>184</td>
<td></td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sojhla for Social Change</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>228</td>
<td></td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participatory Development Initiatives (PDI)</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>161</td>
<td></td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laar Humanitarian and Development Programme (LHDP)</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>167</td>
<td></td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rozan</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>186</td>
<td></td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help Foundation</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>159</td>
<td></td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rahnuna –FPAP</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>162</td>
<td></td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Fisherfolk Forum (PFF)</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research and Development Foundation (RDF)</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doaba Foundation</td>
<td>324</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indus Consortium</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Organisation for Working Communities (NOWC)</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2804</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td></td>
<td>4160</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. General characteristics of the respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education: finished grade 5 or higher</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working in primary sector</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban location</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The major activities that these respondents participated in were related to livelihoods (41%), health (39%), natural disaster reduction (35%), access to information (33%) and gender (30%).

---

revised and introduced in a large scale pilot in Uganda in 2012 together with online and offline data entry tools.
2.4 ANALYSES

Data cleaning
At the start of the analysis process, a data cleaning exercise was carried out. Since this was the first time for almost all partners and their interviewers to collect data with a smart phone, some data entry errors were found, especially for questions that had not been pre-coded, but required entering a number with the keyboard. With the help of the survey coordinators some of the mistakes could be corrected, especially mistakes in coding for participants and programmes. Some inconsistencies were found in the number of children going to school. In cases where this number was higher than the actual number of children in the school age, all data for that respondent were removed from the analysis.

Descriptives
Automated statistical reports were made for organisations after they finalised their survey. The data of these organisations has been aggregated into a country report, which shows the main frequencies for all questions in the survey and where applicable the mean (average). For a selection of indicators, a more in depth impact analysis was conducted by the World Citizens Panel team of Oxfam Novib. The analysis focused on determining whether there are significant differences in the outcomes for the target group respondents as compared to the respondents in the control group.

The main challenge in different types of impact evaluations is to find a good counterfactual – the situation a particular subject would be in had he or she not been exposed to the intervention (Hulme, 2000; Karlan, 2001; Khandker et al., 2010). You must therefore determine what would have happened to the beneficiaries had the intervention not existed. However, it is not possible to study an individual twice in the same time frame, with and without the intervention.

Without information on the counterfactual, the next best alternative is to compare the outcomes of participating respondents with those of a comparison group that did not participate. In doing so, it is important to select such a control group that is very similar to the beneficiary group; such that the beneficiaries would have had outcomes similar to those in the control group in absence of inclusion in the intervention. To prevent a bias in the outcomes, the selected control group should be identical to the beneficiary group and be exposed to the same set of externalities as the beneficiary group (Karlan, 2001; Lensink, 2014).
The control groups of eight organisations have been used as control group for all partners. In the analysis, therefore, first of all, the comparability of the target group and the control group was tested, using a selection of general characteristics: Sex, Age, Literacy, Education, Location and Occupation. In case of more than two possible response categories, variables were recoded to dummy variables (see Table 3.)

Table 3. Results of chi2 test for comparing independent variables of target and control group samples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Results of chi2 test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex (Female=1)</td>
<td>1,301</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>590</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy (Literate=1)</td>
<td>1,235</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>555</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education (grade 5 and higher =1)</td>
<td>1,066</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation (primary sector=1)</td>
<td>1,392</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location (Urban=1)</td>
<td>776</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>384</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (age=1 if in working age)</td>
<td>2,705</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>1,322</td>
<td>98%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* means p < .05: there is a 5% chance that the value is found “by chance” and 95% confidence that there is significant difference
** means p < .01: there is a 1% chance that the value is found “by chance” and 99% confidence that there is significant difference.

Table 3 shows that there is a significant difference between the control group and target group for education and occupation. In order to compensate for the difference between the target and control group, the propensity score matching (PSM) method was used to assess the impact. PSM is a statistical technique that attempts to reduce the bias due to confounding variables (external variables, such as the general characteristics, that may have caused the difference instead of the assumed influence of the treatment). PSM matches the respondents of the target group with their nearest equivalent within the control group and thus allows for a better comparison between the target group and the control group. In chapter 3 the results of PSM will be presented. Throughout this report the impact is shown in terms of the average treatment effect, which is the difference between the “matched” means of the target group and the control group. The descriptive tables in this report show the means of target group and control group as such, while the PSM tables show the means that result from the matching method. The statistical significance of the differences between the matched means is expressed with one or two stars (depending on the level of confidence).

2.5 STORIES OF CHANGE

The Stories of Change methodology aims at discovering the unexpected, intangible results achieved by a certain program but which have not been captured by the impact survey. In addition, it is used to obtain an in-depth understanding of how change has taken place and what the role of Oxfam and the partner organization was in the process. This information helps us to test the assumptions of our theories of change and to analyze how we could improve our strategies to become more effective.

2.5.1 DOMAINS

The two components of the World Citizens Panel, the impact survey and the Stories of Change, are closely linked. During the joint reflection on the outcomes of the survey (at a workshop in Islamabad in January 2015) partners and Oxfam identified the survey results that did not show clear insights on a topic of high relevance to them. The participants decided on three domains (see table 4) that needed further in-depth qualitative research to be able to obtain a better understanding of the results obtained by the different projects.

During the Stories of Change start-up workshop in February 2015, partners were trained on interviewing techniques and in collecting Stories of Change. In addition, they agreed on the criteria on the basis of which
storytellers would be selected. These criteria were based on the already identified ‘puzzles’, i.e. the outcomes of the survey that could not be interpreted without additional qualitative information.

Partners could opt in on the Stories of Change track, depending on their interest in the identified domain. All partner organizations that participated in the process collected stories on one single domain of change, i.e. the domain deemed most relevant to their work:

### Table 4. Domains of change and participating partner organisations per domain:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DOMAIN</th>
<th>ORGANISATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Livelihoods</td>
<td>HELP FOUNDATION, LOK SANJH, PFF, RDF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Risk Reduction</td>
<td>DOABA, LHDP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights (gender justice)</td>
<td>RAHNUMA, SAP-PK, SHOJLA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 2.5.2 STORY COLLECTION

Partner organizations conducted in-depth interviews with participants of their projects. The latter were asked to tell their personal ‘Story of Change’. This is a story about the most significant change that they perceived in their own lives or in their community, with regard to the selected domain of change (i.e. livelihoods, disaster risk reduction or sexual and reproductive health and rights), in recent years. This included describing in short the most important changes experienced within the domain in recent years, and for the change that was most significant to them a more detailed description of how this change came about. Partners used an interview form to conduct the interview (see annex 2). This form has a limited number of open questions to leave room for probing based on the answers given by the storyteller. At the start of each interview, the interviewer asks for consent to conduct the interview and at the end asks for consent to use of the stories (and pictures or movies) for other purposes than learning within the WCP study.

The organizations collected one test story and received feedback on these from the WCP researcher before they continued the collection of the rest of the stories. They registered the stories on paper and complemented these with a few pictures of the storyteller and his environment. The stories were uploaded and stored in an online database, using Fluid Surveys. After the upload in the online database, the WCP researcher provided feedback on the story after which the partner organizations revisited the storyteller to get the additional information that was needed.

A total of 54 stories were collected by the partner organizations. 45 of the stories have been reviewed and completed with additional information from the storyteller a second time (or even a third time, in some cases).
2.5.3 CHARACTERISTICS OF STORYTELLERS

The below table shows the main characteristics of the people who have shared their Story of Change.

Table 5. Characteristics of storytellers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>PER ORGANISATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RDF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GENDER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROVINCE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARITAL STATUS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 - 30</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 - 40</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51+</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.5.4 ANALYSIS

The analysis of the stories has been done in two complementary ways:
1) Participatory analysis by story collectors, project managers and Oxfam staff
2) Qualitative analysis by the WCP researcher

During workshops in Islamabad in November 2015, the participating partner organizations and Oxfam jointly reflected on a number of stories in order to analyze – in a participatory manner – how the reported changes had been achieved. This joint reflection was organized following some principles of ‘participatory narrative inquiry’.5 During the workshop, partner organizations and Oxfam formulated recommendations on how to incorporate the

5 More information on participatory narrative inquiry can be found in “Working with Stories” by Cynthia Kurtz. Available on http://www.workingwithstories.org/
After this, the WCP researcher analyzed all stories in order to describe all changes mentioned and to analyze the links between changes. Stories were coded using MAXQDA, a qualitative data analysis software package. After coding, stories with different changes and patterns of change were compared to uncover recurrent pathways of change.
3. RESULTS OF THE SURVEY

This chapter describes the results of the impact survey per dimension. Each dimension/thematic section presents a short description of the indicators and the major differences that were observed between the target group and the control group.

3.1 SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS

Change in income

Income is the most widely used indicator for measuring changes in people’s wealth situation. Universally the poverty line has been established at $1.90 per capita per day at purchasing power parity (latest update by the World Bank in 2015 based on 2011 prices), while various countries also work with national poverty lines expressed in US$ or local currency equivalents. Although widely used at national levels (by calculating aggregated figures), it is hard to measure income at an individual level. First of all, it needs a clear definition on what is included (monetary income, production value etc.) and people are usually not eager to provide exact information on what they earn. An interesting approach is Save the Children’s household economy approach⁶. This approach, however, requires substantive time and resources. The use of these resources may be justified in certain projects, especially for planning and close monitoring purposes, but is impossible at a nation- or worldwide scale. Therefore, people participating in the activities of Oxfam Novib’s partner organisations were asked whether they have observed a change in income. Within a set of multidimensional indicators, people’s perception of their income change is also a very powerful indicator. One might even argue that people’s perception of improvement is even more important than the actual improvement itself.

The indicator we therefore used is perceived change in income. Income is defined as monetary income received in a respective period through various sources (work, interest, remittances, gifts etc.) plus the value of goods produced and used for own consumption in the same period. The respondents were asked whether they have observed a positive or negative change in their income over the previous 12 months.

The survey results (summarized in figure 2) show, that 40-45% of the respondents in the target group and control group have not observed a change in their income. In the target group 33% have observed an increase and in the control group this percentage was 22%.

The result of Propensity Score Matching (PSM) in table 6 shows that the difference between the target and control group regarding perceived increase in income is significant. See also chapter 2 for a description of the statistical method to measure the impact.

Table 6. PSM analysis for increase in income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceived change in income</th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N° obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>N° obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived change in income (1 if an increase in income and 0 if no change or a decrease)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* means p < .05; there is a 5% chance that the value is found "by chance" and 95% confidence that there is significant difference.

** means p < .01; there is a 1% chance that the value is found "by chance" and 99% confidence that there is significant difference.

Value of assets

Increase in income alone is not sufficient as an indication of economic well-being. The income may be used for other purposes than the well-being of the family (e.g. payment of debts, social obligations, and individual pleasure). Therefore the value of assets has been added as an indicator. For each of these assets, an analysis was made to measure whether there is a positive or negative change or no change at all in its value. It is assumed that the following assets will show whether increased income has resulted in investments and increased value of people’s possessions, thereby indicating increased wealth.

The perceived change in the value of assets provides – broadly speaking – a similar pattern to that of perceived income: for those possessing a certain asset (land, labour, livestock etc.) a proportion of the target groups perceives an increase in its value (although considerably lower than the perceived change in income), while this is less for the control group. The exceptions are house quality, other assets (no impact) and loans (the members of the control group have taken more loans (in value) than the target group).

The results of Propensity Score Matching show that the target and control group significantly differ on most assets, indicating that the activities of the partners of Oxfam in Pakistan have had an impact on their target groups.

Table 7. PSM analysis for increase in value of assets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Saving(1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N° obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>N° obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td>.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.1(1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.18</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.1(1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.34</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.1(1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.22</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House quality(1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.26</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production asset(1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.1105</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other assets (1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan (1 if increase and 0 otherwise)</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p < .05 ** p < .01
**Food security**

The number of months with sufficient food per day and the number of meals consumed per day are the key indicators chosen for measuring food security. Although the indicators do not show whether the quality of the food and the diet have changed, they are widely used and generally considered to be the most practical and feasible indicators.

The survey results show that food insecurity clearly is a problem in Pakistan. For most households every year includes a month or more of food insufficiency and most households are not yet in a position to consume 2 meals or more per day.

The survey results show that the target group had significantly less months of insufficient food (on average 1.1 months per year) compared to the control group (1.5 months). However, there was a significant negative difference regarding the number of times a meal is consumed during the most critical month of the year (see Table 8). The target group on average consumed less times a meal per day than the control group.

**Figure 3. Food security indicators**

![Food security indicators graph](image)

**Table 8. PSM analysis for food security**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Months with insufficient food</td>
<td>2804</td>
<td>1.061</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of times a meal is consumed during most critical month of the year</td>
<td>2804</td>
<td>1.286</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**3.2 ESSENTIAL SERVICES**

**Education**

People can often not afford to send their children to school for various reasons: for example because they need their labour, because they cannot pay the cost of education, comprising school fee, uniforms, books etc. When income increases and when people are more involved in economic and social activities and exchanges with other people, they will be more inclined to send their children to school. A better educated population is a sign of social progress and reduced poverty. At the same time education is a good basis for further development. Although school enrolment rates say nothing about the quality of education obtained, school enrolment rate of girls and boys is often taken as a simple proxy for education levels.

Propensity score matching was used to determine whether there are significant differences between the target group and the control group with regard to enrollment and drop-out rates. Table 9 below shows that the number...
of children enrolled does not differ significantly for members of the target group as compared to the control group.

**Table 9. PSM on school enrolment and drop out rates**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment in formal school as percentage of children in school age</td>
<td>1925</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>874</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Besides enrolment and retention in school, the quality of education received is very important for children’s ability to get involved actively and effectively in social, political and economic life. The World Citizens Panel therefore also includes a rating by the parents of the quality of education that their children receive. Key aspects of this quality rating are the content of the educational material, the knowledge and skills of the teachers, the school building and facilities and the ability for parents to influence the quality of education.

**Table 10. Quality of education as perceived by parents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group (n=2714)</th>
<th>Control group (n=1356)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>Fair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content of educational material</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge and skills of teachers</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School building, facilities and surroundings</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability of parents to participate in the management of the school and influence the quality of education</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11 shows that – although differences are small - the target group scores were significantly higher than those of the control group except for parents’ participation in the management of the school (which showed no significant difference).

**Table 11. PSM on parents’ perception of the quality of education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content of the education</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.483</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge and skills of teachers</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.510</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School building and facilities</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.485</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—</td>
<td>2806</td>
<td>.256</td>
<td>1356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Health**

The most direct way of measuring health is to ask project participants whether they have been sick. The WCP impact survey does this through counting the number of days that a person could not be involved in normal daily activities due to illness within a certain period of time (the last three months).

Social Watch has found that the following two health indicators correlate strongly with the wider set of social indicators.

---

7 No knowledge about the quality of education is interpreted here as poor quality. In theory it would be possible that the quality is good, and that parents don’t know this, but in general a lack of parents’ involvement in education is not positive and certainly no knowledge about the ability for parents to participate means that parents do not participate.
indicators and are therefore included in its Basic Capabilities Index\textsuperscript{8}. They are also collected as standard by the national health authorities:

- Percentage of deliveries attended by skilled personnel
- Mortality rate of children under 5 years.

Sexual and reproductive rights and self determination for all people on their sexuality are key issues in Oxfam’s work on reducing the spread of \textit{HIV/AIDS} and the respect for the rights of all people without stigmatisation or discrimination. The sensitivity of the subject makes it rather difficult to develop indicators. An indicator has therefore been selected for measuring behavioural change in terms of number of people that had themselves tested. This is an indicator for awareness of the disease, the reduction of stigma, and the power to take measures to reduce the spreading of the disease.

The table below shows the results in Pakistan. The target group reports less illness than the control group, but in general there appears to be very little impact of project activities on the health status of target communities.

The results show that few people report to have had themselves tested.

\textbf{Table 12. PSM for health indicators}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>No obs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illness (0=not ill, 1 = ill)</td>
<td>2806 .298</td>
<td>1356 .392</td>
<td>-.1**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average number of days ill in the last 3 months</td>
<td>830 15.27</td>
<td>527 15.33</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average number of births attended by skilled health personnel</td>
<td>692 .559</td>
<td>276 .606</td>
<td>-.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child mortality (under 5 years of age)</td>
<td>1415 .0722</td>
<td>677 .0896</td>
<td>-.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tested for HIV</td>
<td>2806 .03</td>
<td>1356 .03</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\section*{3.3 LIFE AND SECURITY}

Empowerment is expected to lead to increased capabilities of individuals and communities to deal with threats and disasters, as well as to a reduction of victims of violent acts. The degree to which people fall victim to serious physical damage to themselves or their belongings and to which they perceive a threat of their physical integrity/personal belongings are therefore good indicators of their vulnerability. Less vulnerable people will have increased capabilities for social and economic empowerment. The indicators used by the World Citizens Panel distinguish between actual damage experienced on the one hand and the feeling of a threat of damage on the other hand.

\textbf{Experiences of physical damage}

The survey presents a mixed pattern with regard to experiences of physical damage as a result of natural and man-made disasters. Natural disasters are the most important causes of physical damage for the target group respondents.

\textsuperscript{8} Research has indicated that as a summary index, the BCI provides a consistent general overview of the health status and basic educational performance of a population. It has also proven to be highly correlated with measures of other human capabilities related to the social development of countries (http://www.socialwatch.org/node/9376).
Figure 4. Percentage of respondents experienced physical damage per type of disaster

Table 13 shows that the target group experienced significantly less damage to themselves or their belongings than the control group for a number of types of disasters, but for the most frequent source of damage (natural disasters) and for civil unrest the difference was not significant.

Table 13. PSM for experience of damage due to disasters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of disasters</th>
<th>Percentage of respondents</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Target group (n=2804)</td>
<td>Control group (n=1356)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural disaster</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil unrest</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banditry</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State action</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic violence</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Being prepared for emergency situations is an indicator of resilience and capability to prevent social and economic deterioration as a result of external shocks. The extent to which a person has knowledge about potential emergency situations and is capable to act in such emergency situations are important indicators for preparedness. The indicators distinguish between the actual measures taken and the capability to cope with future disasters.
The analysis shows that there is no evidence of impact of disaster reduction and preparedness activities. The target group feels more threatened by natural disasters and civil unrest (which could be a sign of increased awareness) and less threatened by state action and domestic violence (possibly a sign of empowerment), but there are no significant differences between the target group and the control group with respect to increased resilience: target group members have not taken more measures and do not feel better capable to cope with future disasters than members of the control group.
3.4 SOCIAL AND POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

Exercising the right to participate in social and political organisations and having the capability to initiate and/or take part in action against injustice are key impact areas for Oxfam’s work on the right to be heard and active citizenship.

In order to participate in social and political life, demand rights and act against injustice, it is important that people are informed about public affairs. People have the right to access government or publicly-funded information, including for example, census data, public expenditure and scientific and social research produced with the support of public funds.

The World Citizens Panel has therefore included questions about the extent to which people are informed about public issues and through which channels. These questions are important to analyse, because access to information is a pre-condition for empowerment and accountability and therefore fundamental to Oxfam’s work.

Access to information

The Pakistan impact survey shows, that access to information about public issues is very limited, both among the programme participants and among the control group. Half of the respondents do not have access to internet, email or social media. Among those that have access to media, rather large proportions get never or rarely informed on public issues. TV, telephone, CBOs and the word of mouth are the most important channels of public information.

**Figure 10. Sources of information and frequency of use for accessing information on public issues**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Information</th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>25%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>75%</th>
<th>100%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community based organisations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word of mouth (friends, neighbours etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n: Base

Legal action against injustice

Taking action against injustice requires knowledge about legal rights and access to support in situations of injustice and disputes. For this reason questions on disputes and access to justice and their effect have been included.
About 11% of the respondents in the target and 14% in the control group report to have had a serious dispute. Among these respondents, 88% in the target group and 84% in the control group have made use of third party support (either from formal judiciary, traditional and customary authorities or support from family or community members). A majority (66% in the target group and 51% in the control group) of those who made use of third party support regarded such support as positive. The absolute numbers of these respondents in the control group were too low to enable a statistical analysis of the differences between target group and control group.

Table 16. Percentages experienced serious dispute

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 11. Use of support from a third party in case of dispute

Figure 12. Type of support received in case of dispute
Participation in organisations and collective action against injustice

Social organisations are a key player in the force field of government-private sector-civil society, especially to ensure that the rights of people are being respected. Unequal power balances can be addressed by strengthening organisations that stand for the rights of people living in poverty. Many organisations encourage people to work together, empower people to participate in civil life and stress that some form of social organisation helps in advocating in the interest of people living in poverty. They thus contribute to more participation in social organisations and a stronger position of project participants in social and political actions. An important indicator for empowerment is participation in organisations and decision making power. Membership of a social or community organisation is the first step in gaining more influence. Next is being able to influence decisions, as this would indicate important changes in power structures. Another important indicator to measure decision making power is leadership positions of the project participants.

The participants in programmes of Oxfam Novib’s partners in Pakistan are slightly more involved in community decision making (13% vs 12%) and more active in terms of participation in collective action against injustice (28% vs. 16%) compared to the control group.

Table 17. PSM for ability to influence decision making and participating in collective action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceived ability to influence decision making in the community</td>
<td>2804</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td>.03*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(leadership position or able to influence decision making in at least one organization)</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in collective action against injustice or to fight for rights</td>
<td>2804</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td>.13**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.5 GENDER AND EMPOWERMENT

Mobility
In Pakistan, most people seem to have the ability to move safely in the village/city. Members of the control group appear to be better off than the target group. On a scale between 0 (no freedom) and 1 (freedom) the average was 0.83 in the target group and 0.90 in the control group.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nº obs. mean</td>
<td>Nº obs. mean</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived freedom of mobility (to move safely in own village/town)</td>
<td>2806 .83</td>
<td>1356 .90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Economic empowerment
Economic empowerment can be measured through looking into the perceived ability to influence decisions related to economic affairs: daily expenses, savings and productive expenses. The indicators show the gender aspects of economic empowerment by asking whether decisions are being taken by husband, wife or together. Being a participant in the activities of partners in Pakistan has a significant positive impact on women’s involvement in decision making about household expenditures.

Figure 15. Percentage of women involved in household decision making

Table 19. PSM for female decision making power

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nº obs. %</td>
<td>Nº obs. %</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s involvement in decision making about household expenditures (women only or women and men together)</td>
<td>2803 54%</td>
<td>1355 48%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender based violence
Gender based violence is measured by asking women about their own experience of gender based violence (and in particular if they had been hit by their husband) and whether action is being taken in cases of violence against women.
The analysis shows that significantly less women in the target group report having been hit by their husband as compared to the control group, whereas slightly more (but not significant) action is being taken in target group communities upon violence against women.

**Sexual and reproductive rights**

Women’s ability and opportunity to discuss sexual practices and to negotiate safe sex or to refuse unwanted sexual contact and to make reproductive choices is a clear indicator for gender justice. We chose to measure this indicator with the following aspects of sexual and reproductive rights:

- possibility for a woman to have a safe abortion if she wishes
- possibility for women to talk with their partners about safe sex
- possibility for women to talk with their partners about family planning
- possibility to obtain contraceptives

**Figure 17. Sexual and reproductive rights**

---

### Table 20 PSM for violence against women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
<td>mean</td>
<td>Nº obs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hit by husband</td>
<td>1107</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action taken against women violence</td>
<td>1696</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>835</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21. PSM for sexual and reproductive rights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possibility</th>
<th>Percentage of respondents</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Target group (n=2806)</td>
<td>Control group (n=1356)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possibility for a woman to have a safe abortion if she wishes</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possibility for women to talk with their partners about safe sex</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possibility for women to talk with their partners about family planning</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possibility to obtain contraceptives</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results are somewhat ambiguous. Whereas women from the target group see more possibilities for obtaining contraceptives and talking with their husbands/partners about safe sex, women in the control group see more possibilities to talk about family planning and – slightly but not significantly – could have a safe abortion if they wish.
4. RESULTS OF THE STORIES OF CHANGE

In the previous chapter we quantified the impact of Oxfam’s projects in Pakistan on a broad set of indicators. The present chapter zooms in on certain survey results to gain a comprehensive understanding of selected topics through Stories of Change.

Domains of change
For this qualitative analysis, a total of 54 stories of change have been collected by participating organisations in Pakistan:

- 18 stories within the domain of Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights (Gender Justice)
- 24 stories within the domain of Livelihoods;
- 12 stories within the domain of Disaster Risk Reduction;

In this chapter, an in-depth analysis of how the changes took place in the three domains will be presented. The main questions that will be answered are:

- What factors are curtailing the uptake of family planning methods in the communities where our projects were implemented, and what is necessary to overcome these factors and successfully promote family planning methods in order to improve the health and lives of our beneficiaries?
- What has made the livelihood projects successful? More specifically: what elements of the projects have contributed to people’s improved livelihoods and how? How do people utilize their increased resources and income?
- What is needed to make people (feel) better prepared for future disasters?

These topics of analysis came up during the reflection sessions in Pakistan and in conversations with Oxfam staff.

4.1 CHANGES IN SEXUAL AND REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH AND RIGHTS (GENDER JUSTICE): FAMILY PLANNING

4.1.1 INTRODUCTION

The survey showed ambiguous results about women’s ability to talk with their husbands about sexual reproduction. Women from the target group reported a better ability to talk about safe sex, but a poorer ability to discuss family planning compared to the control group.

To get more in-depth information and a better understanding about our project participants’ views and behaviours with regard to family planning, 18 Stories of Change about sexual and reproductive health and rights, in particular about family planning, were collected.

With the help of these stories we have tried to find out what factors are curtailing the uptake of family planning methods in the communities where our projects were implemented, and what is necessary to overcome these factors and successfully promote family planning methods in order to improve the health and lives of our beneficiaries. These barriers and strategies are analyzed in the 2 sections below.

4.1.2 BARRIERS TO FAMILY PLANNING

Before discussing the results, it is important to note that most of the stories are about positive changes only. The focus on positive changes limits the research, as it sheds light on the positive aspects only, leaving out important lessons to be learned from negative changes. Nevertheless, we can learn some important lessons for our strategies when comparing how change takes place in the different stories.
The stories of change show that married women are often pressured to have many children quickly after another. Insufficient spacing between pregnancies means women do not have the time to mentally and physically recuperate after a pregnancy and cause many health issues, both for the mother and child. The World Health Organisation recommends an interval of two years between a live birth and attempting the next pregnancy.\textsuperscript{10}

The stories of change that were collected on the topic of family planning provide us with a better understanding of the reasons why women adhere to these expectations, despite the health complications they suffer as a result of it. It is important to examine these reasons, as they may serve as barriers for adopting healthier reproductive behaviour. A thorough understanding of these barriers will allow us to better address these issues in future programmes.

1. Lack of knowledge about the health risks of a short interval between pregnancies

For some storytellers the inability to adopt healthier reproductive behaviour was first and foremost the result of a lack of knowledge about the health risks attached to the rapid succession of pregnancies. Additionally, ‘having a lot of children and suffering health issues’ was simply perceived as the norm for women by some storytellers. Because all the other women they knew seemed to suffer the same fate, it had never occurred to them to complain or protest about their situation.

Only after two month of the delivery she was pregnant again. Now she felt more tired while working. She claimed that the second baby is making her more exhausted and weak all the time. I also observed that the only baby we had was not getting healthy. My wife started looking like more than her age in just a couple of months. We never visited the doctor for these reasons as the family thought it a common issue. My brother's wife also had the same reflections whenever she got pregnant so not much care was being provided to my wife. She too never demanded to go to the doctor and thought it a normal thing to happen to females when they are pregnant (male storyteller, SCUHLA).

2. Power dynamics between woman, husband, and mother-in-law

Even when people become more aware of the possibility and benefits of birth spacing (i.e. leaving sufficient time for recuperation in between births and pregnancies), another barrier still has to be overcome before they can actually start to practice it: the interfamilial power dynamics between the woman, her husband, and her mother-in-law. More specifically: the power that the husband and the mother-in-law traditionally hold over a woman’s reproductive choices.

In Pakistan, when women marry they traditionally leave their own family and become part and property of their husband’s family, where they generally have little decision-making power. Within the family, the mother-in-law is held in high esteem, and can have an important and influential role in governing the reproductive choices of her son and his wife\textsuperscript{11}.

The stories of change show that having many boys is a source of great pride, as it heightens the status and prestige of a family within the community. This results in families – in particular mothers (in-law) – pressuring young married couples to produce as many male heirs as possible. The stories also make clear that women often don’t have the power to resist the family’s pressure to produce more children, for a number of reasons.

The first reason is related to gender norms that women internalize and actively impose on themselves: some storytellers mentioned that they (or other women in their vicinity) felt that—as a good and obedient wife— it is not their but their husband’s right to make family planning decisions for them. Some of the stories suggest that women with a very religious upbringing may be particularly likely to have internalized this idea, as gender norms subscribing women’s subordination to men are actively reinforced by religious teaching.

In our society, Husband (Male) has the right to decide regarding number of children and female has no role in taking such decisions. So, unless and until the husband is not convinced to use these methods, I as a woman cannot do anything in making such choices. Even, I am aware of the benefits of having sufficient gap in child births but I am unable to exercise such decisions (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

Furthermore, the stories suggest that when a woman does wish to ensure an interval between pregnancies or stop having children all together, her dependence on her family-in-law may prevent her from doing so. Some

\textsuperscript{10} World Health Organization (WHO) “Technical Consultation and Scientific Review of BirthSpacing”

stories show that defying or otherwise failing to fulfil the fertility wishes of their husband or relatives-in-law can have grave consequences for a woman, as her husband -sometimes pressured by his family- may decide to divorce her on account of it.

A divorce in Pakistani society may result in a woman losing all standing and respect within her community, and may leave her discredited and helpless. Three tragic stories of female storytellers illustrate the major power that their families-in-law hold over them as a result of this notion and the contempt women may have to face, even by their own families, when they fail to fulfill their role as wife in a manner that is expected of them.

I was depressed and never told my parents about this violence as they often said that now onward my in-laws’ house is my actual house and even I live or die I have to stay there forever. I just wanted to run away from that “hell” but was completely dependent on my in-laws and was not able to get anything for me and my kid (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

When my daughter was 9 months old and after that he gave me divorce through political leaders of my village he used the platform to give me divorce and didn’t paid dower amount to me because of the political leaders settlement the divorce decision finalized and I returned to my parent’s home but all family members taunted me, “she should compromise with her husband’s second wife and in any case she should not leave the house of her husband, her death news would be good compared to divorce” etc. Even my villagers’ points of view were not good about me (female storyteller, SAP-PK).

After marriage, everything was good and my in-laws especially mother- and sisters-in-law wanted to have a new male family member as soon as possible. I could not conceive, due to some physical problems. However, after two year of marriage, I got pregnant and started facing complications. The Diayah (traditional female birth attendant who assists women out of sympathy, not because it’s her profession) of our village kept on visiting me during that time. She advised my mother in-law to take me to the doctor as it was not possible for her to manage the complications. My mother-in-law accompanied me to visit the nearby medical clinic (being run by Rahnuma-FPAP). The female doctor made a detailed check-up and informed my mother in-law that my physical condition was very poor to continue the pregnancy. She prescribed us to go for abortion as soon as possible otherwise it would create more problems for me. My mother-in-law did not pay a serious attention to the doctor and argued that abortion is a sin “Gunah” according to Islam and we can afford the death of mother rather going for abortion. She insisted to continue the pregnancy and one month later I gave still birth to a baby boy by the same Diayah. In the whole situation, my husband remained with the decision of my in-laws. After this incident, I felt that the behaviour of my in-laws was gradually changed with me. They did not talk to me for several days. My health continually worsened and it became almost impossible for me to even get up from bed and I remained in isolation. My parents were not aware of the situation and no one informed them. Observing my continuously falling health condition, my in-laws decided to get rid of me and informed my parents and asked them to take me their house, as they did not want me keep with them. They decided to give me divorce... Currently, being divorced I am facing a lot of social issues. I have no skills to make earnings nor can I compromise with her husband’s second wife and in any case she should not leave the house of her husband, her death news would be good compared to divorce” etc. Even my villagers’ points of view were not good about me (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

The severe social consequences women face when failing to produce more children, gives their families-in-law a powerful weapon to enforce their will upon these women. Because society condones their ‘ownership’ over the women, family members can even compromise their daughter-in-law’s health in favour of an unborn baby, or resort to using violence to make her comply with their demands.

3. Lack of communication about family planning between husband and wife

Another important factor that stood in the way of family planning for the storytellers was the lack of communication about sex between husband and wife, likely due to cultural and religious taboos surrounding the topic.

Both male and female storytellers reported that they were too shy to talk to their spouses about family planning and birth control.

After marriage, I was very shy and not able to express my feelings in front of my husband and in-laws. My mother-in-law wanted a boy baby from us as soon as possible and my husband was also of the same opinion. After eleven months of my marriage, I gave birth to a baby boy but faced some complications. Delivery was conducted by a local female. But gradually, both I started recovering and we came to our normal life. I was very happy and my in-laws were also feeling blessed. Three months latter my husband told me that his mother, my mother-in-law, is demanding another child to increase our family size, as having more sons is considered a matter of pride in the area. I was not prepared for this but could not do anything as I was unable to express my feelings in front of him. I do not want to make him angry so I kept quiet. Just after a year, I gave birth to a baby girl. But this time I was very sick and faced a lot of complications. The infant was very weak and was under weight. This time the delivery was conducted by the nearby public health facility as the Diayah told my mother-in-law that this is a complicated case and I cannot handle it. This time, I thought of having space in birth, but found it quite difficult to talk to my husband and mother-in-law (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).
In some cases this shyness to talk to a spouse resulted in misunderstandings, where both husband and wife didn’t want to have a new baby, but were unaware of each other’s feelings and – under pressure of their mother (in-law) - kept having children.

4. Lack of knowledge about family planning methods, and negative attitudes towards contraceptive use

The stories show that in case one or both of the spouses felt the need to delay having more children, in many cases a last barrier still had to be overcome, namely: misunderstandings or a general lack of knowledge about contraceptive methods.

The reason of the village population is because of illiteracy regarding the family planning. Mostly people did not consult with doctor or lady health worker regarding the family planning and for other diseases and used home remedies for the treatment and other health related issues (female storyteller, SAP-PK).

People are illiterate here in my village and women didn't have information about the contraceptive, abortion and ultrasound. I remembered how difficult it was for me to talk with my husband about the family planning (female storyteller, SAP-PK).

One of the male storytellers recounted that he and his wife were in dire need to delay the conception of another child, but the fact that he and his wife didn’t know any other way than to abstain from sex created a lot of frustration, and even caused difficulties in their relationship:

As a matter of fact I needed to be with my wife and feared of making her pregnant. Keeping away from her made me sick and my behaviour was also changed with her… We feared that it will ruin our life totally (male storyteller, SOJHLA).

For the storytellers that were already aware about the existence and workings of contraceptive methods, some were disinclined to use them – or were prevented to do so by their spouses or family - due to religious reasons:

I thought for the first time to visit the Family Planning office and get more of the information regarding FP. The family planning department’s office was very friendly and they welcomed me. The lady doctor there, asked me to bring my wife along so that they can guide her for a better future for us both. When I told my wife about my day’s activity she became furious. She said that our religion never permits for family planning. She further added that according to the religion every soul which comes to life brings its food and shelter along. So we human beings have not to worry about the financial matters (male storyteller, SOJHLA).

Fears about the side effect of some contraceptive methods had also made some people hesitant to use them:

When I came back to my home I shared what I learned to my neighboring ladies. They told me that they know somewhat about family planning but are afraid that they or their spouse have to go through some sort of surgery; the other method they know is using the pills which has some severe side effects (female storyteller, SOJHLA).

Lastly, a story from a male storyteller that reports to be afraid that a vasectomy would ‘take away his manly powers’, suggests that cultural notions of masculinity are intricately intertwined with male fertility and that the fear of ‘losing your manliness’ by using contraceptives may hinder contraceptive uptake:

Because earlier I only knew that the operation is necessary, I mean long term family planning. I was afraid that I will no more be a man (Mard) as my manly powers will be taken away from me. And what If have to go for another marriage due to any of my family problems. Then again I was not sure if that operation could be reverted back to make me normal. Therefore, this point is very important because it gives me confidence and control to plan my own family (male storyteller, SOJHLA).

4.1.3 HOW CAN PEOPLE BE ENCOURAGED TO ADOPT FAMILY PLANNING METHODS?

Analyzing the stories of project participants that reported that they or others in their communities had become (better) able to adopt family planning methods, can help us to determine which specific types of activities or strategies are particularly effective in doing so. Determining ‘what worked’ for these storytellers, will hopefully allow future programmes with similar goals to design and implement their activities in a more effective way.

Considering the Stories of Change, the barriers that need to be overcome to change the family planning
behaviour of the project participants can be addressed in 2 steps: Firstly, both spouses need to be made aware of the health risks of incessant pregnancies and need to be enabled to discuss family planning together. Secondly, negative attitudes towards the use of family planning methods need to be changed.

1. Increasing awareness and improving intra-marital communication about family planning

Almost all of the project activities reportedly having helped storytellers to achieve better family planning had one important strategy in common: they all focused on changing the awareness of the husbands, targeting either the husbands alone or the husbands in addition to --or through-- the wives.

The stories show the importance of changing men’s perspectives on family planning, as they are generally the ones that hold the decision power over when and how many children will be born within the marriage.

Teaching women (how) to discuss family planning with their husband
An important element in improving family planning behaviour was encouraging communication about family planning between husband and wife. One female storyteller, for example, mentioned that apart from being made aware of the harmlessness and health benefits of using family planning methods, she had also learnt how to broach the subject of family planning with her husband.

Guiding women to overcome their original shyness about talking about family planning, and teaching them helpful strategies on how to convince their husbands to see the benefits of it, is important. The story of the storyteller below shows us that convincing men that birth gaps are in their own interest can be one helpful strategy to persuade men to start using family planning methods. Possible ways to convince them might entail: making them think about the costs of another baby (and the financial benefits of having fewer), and making them aware that short intervals between pregnancies can not only create grave health issues for their wives, but may also lead to weak and sickly –or even deceased- offspring.

She [a female health worker from Rahnuma’s Family Planning Association] also guided us that we need to discuss these matters with our husbands and need to get them in confidence. She also told us the way how to communicate this message to husbands; she said that the health of new born is of ultimate concern for husbands so if we can communicate to them that insufficient gap in child births can create problems for them which can lead to their death ...

It enables me to discuss the matter of family planning with my husband more confidently. I am in a better position to explain that insufficient duration in child birth can create serious dangerous for both mother and child (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

Directly target men and include them in project activities (such as sensitization activities & stage plays)
However, training women to overcome their culturally ingrained shyness and to gain the confidence to speak with their husbands about the controversial topic of family planning and persist until he is convinced, is a complex task and may not be a viable goal for many women within the (short) time span of a programme’s implementation.

It may therefore be necessary –or at the least more efficient- to also directly target men, and include them in the project activities. For example by arranging sensitization sessions for men, where informed professionals such as doctors or health workers inform them about family planning methods, and where they are encouraged to communicate with their wives about the topic of family planning and include them in the decision making. The following quote describes one of these activities, which has proven to be successful for this female storyteller:

Analyzing the traditional values and female’s reluctance to start discussion on these matters with their husbands at first, the lady health visitor invited the male doctor of the concerned Basic Health Unit (BHU). My husband also joined the session. The doctor arranged a dialogue with the young husbands and informed them about the benefits of using family planning methods. He also informed them that this is good for both mother and child. He told the young men to discuss the matter with wives and decide mutually. The doctor also get help from the local Imam Masgid (Local religious person) to convince young men to use family planning methods. He also stressed that the health of mother and child should be given priority. The doctor also advised men to get counselling from nearby health facilities and wives should be accompanied with them while visiting to the health staff (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

Another idea on how to involve men in project activities and making them more aware about the problems that the rapid succession of pregnancies can cause for their wives and babies, and thereby also for themselves, is getting them involved in the staging of educational plays about family planning issues.

The Stories of Change of a number of male storytellers that were involved in these plays –either as actor or as
The following quote from one of the female storytellers suggests that it may not be fruitful to organize ‘mixed gender’ group activities where multiple men and women take part, as they may be viewed as culturally unacceptable, and women may not be allowed or willing to attend out of embarrassment or fear of being stigmatized as a ‘bad woman’. 

Initially, I found resistant and difficulties in my community and people passed negative comments on me this women’s character is not good as she participated in events where men are part, in our community women are not allowed to talk with men without the veil is why I choose before that change in myself nobody can dare to talk about women rights in our community (female storyteller, SAP-PK).

Especially when dealing with potentially sensitive topics such as family planning, it is important to consider the local context and norms regarding the appropriateness of mixed gender events when organizing group activities where both men and women are to be invited.

**Changing the awareness and attitudes of the mother-in-law**

When both husband and wife have been made aware of the health risks that come with repeated pregnancies and have together decided that they would like to delay or prevent another pregnancy, another potential problem still remains in the form of the mother-in-law.

The following quote from one of the female storytellers illustrates that, even if husband and wife are on the same
Many of the stories of change contain examples of the power that the mother-in-law holds over her daughter in-law, and the influence she can exert over the reproductive behaviour of the couple. It is important to recognize the pivotal role the mother-in-law can play in reproductive decision making, and address this in (future) project implementation by making efforts to change mother-in-laws’ attitudes towards family planning too.

Within the stories, only one example is mentioned where a mother-in-law is targeted by the project staff, albeit at the request of the storyteller herself:

... When I informed her that the doctor and lady health worker informed us that it can create serious problems for children. I also requested the lady health visitor to convince my mother in-law. Gradually, she was convinced especially when she came to know that my husband also had the same opinion (same female storyteller as previous quote, RAHNUMA).

A combination of the visit of the health worker and improved communication about family planning between mother-in-law, daughter-in-law, and husband proved to be a fruitful strategy for changing the mother-in-law’s attitude and thereby enabling the storyteller and her husband to undertake healthier family planning behaviour.

2. Changing negative attitudes about family planning methods

The second problem that needs to be overcome in order to make people start practicing healthy family planning behaviour is existing negative attitudes towards contraceptive use. These negative attitudes - stemming from religious beliefs, traditional ideas about family planning, and misconceptions and fears about the workings and safety of contraceptive methods -, can be found for both men and women alike. Hence, both husbands and wives, as well as mother-in-laws need to be targeted.

Within the Stories of Change a number of factors could be distinguished that seem to have helped to change people’s attitudes towards the use of family planning methods.

Including religious leaders in sensitization activities about family planning and contraceptive use

First of all, having religious authority figures (that take a positive stance on family planning) provide people information about family planning as part of the project activities seemed to be a very effective way to reduce people’s anxiety about using contraceptive methods, which they previously thought of as being sinful or culturally unacceptable. For the storytellers that mentioned that they had taken part in such an activity, the religious legitimation they received from the religious authority figures played an important role in their decision to actually start practicing family planning.

During the event of SOJHLA [where he was informed that “contraceptives don’t have side effects and it is not necessary to use pills or go through surgery to have a break”] an address of a Moulvi Sb. also cleared to me that planning a family is not restricted and even the religion says that it’s the right of a baby to get his/her mother’s milk for two years. In order to have a gap of two years there is no way besides keeping away from the wife, which in most of the cases results in family failure or the second option is to adopt the family planning tools (male storyteller, SOJHLA).

To make the performance [stage play] more acceptable for the community I also had to go for a religious opinion for which is consulted some religious leaders. These meetings resulted in providing me more information about the teaching of the religion regarding the need of Family Planning. Now I was much more confident to adopt the Family Planning methods for my own family too (male storyteller, SOJHLA).

Playing into basic human emotions and instincts

Other useful observations come from one of our female storytellers, who works as a health worker and provides advice to her community members on the topic of family planning as part of her job. She hints towards the idea...
that people’s behaviour with regards to family planning and using contraceptive methods can be changed by playing into basic human emotions and instincts, such as pleasure, fear, and maternal instinct.

She says –for example- that she has noticed that men started using condoms more often after the condom manufacturer had added features to the condoms that increased the men’s sexual pleasure during intercourse.

Another reason behind the increased use of the contraceptives is hmmm… it seems very odd to say... but..... the use of condoms increased due to the companies change in their product. The condom is not only used for the intervals but now the condoms come with different qualities the most important is the one which guarantee the more satisfaction. Their qualities are also a reason of males going for it (female storyteller, SOJHLA).

She further noticed that one of the reasons that women were more inclined to start using family planning methods, was that they had come to realize that pregnancies were bad for their health, and feared that repeated pregnancies would take a toll on their physical appearance.

The females when they came to know that their health is also affected due to giving birth every year, realized that it’s a matter of their health. They are keen towards their health their physique their looks which show them that they are more aged if they are into the process of getting pregnant again and again (female storyteller, SOJHLA).

She also suggests that it is useful to ‘open women’s eyes’ about the costs of having another baby, and to point out the dangers that repeated pregnancies, and having too many mouths to feed can have on the health and happiness of their already born children, as mothers will be naturally concerned about their children’s wellbeing and will feel the instinctive need to take precautions – in the form of not having another baby - to protect them.

One more reason behind this change according to me is the financial status of the people. We emphasize more on the growth of the child and health of both mother and the child. The mother no matter if she is young and is careful about herself or not, but she is very careful about the health of her baby. This acted as an eye opener for the mothers. They became reluctant for giving birth to more kids (female storyteller, SOJHLA).

A last useful advice this health worker gives is that organizations should make an effort to reduce the psychosocial threshold for acquiring contraceptives. For example by making contraceptives more easily available and by helping people to overcome the shame they feel when buying them at a store.

Organize activities and help the community to have easy access to the contraceptives and the barrier of getting ashamed if one asks for contraceptives at a store should also be focused and it should be made a norm for asking such a thing from a store (female storyteller, SOJHLA).

**Making project participants feel at ease with the project officer**

Some quotes of storytellers suggest that having a familiar and respected facilitator for the project activities can help to put project participants at ease and make them accept and absorb information better.

Rahnuma-Family Planning Association of Pakistan arranged awareness raising sessions with young married girls in the local community to make them aware on the benefits of using family planning methods. The sessions were conducted by a lady health worker working in our area that we already knew very well and she delivered the information in local language “Saraiki”. It was easy for all of us to understand that what she is saying (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

The quote above shows that –when raising awareness about family planning issues- it is advisable to choose a (local) project facilitator who people are already comfortable sharing sensitive information with, and who knows the local language.

Furthermore, other quotes show that repeated contact with the same project officer (for example a health worker, a counsellor, etc.) can help take away initial suspicions and reservations a participant has towards that project officer. The quotes below illustrate that -at least for some participants- trust needs to be built slowly before participants really start to listen and open up.

Initially my wife was not agreeing to go on pills but later she was convinced after visiting the lady doctor several times and sharing her insecurities. Now after having a gap of three years and also have a baby boy, what we wished for, is a blessing for us. We are a happy family now. I think if we were not practicing these contraceptives we would have never recovered financially or health wise... Initially she somewhat agreed but was not sure about the side effects of pills. I took the courage to take her to the doctor several times and after all she was convinced (male storyteller, SOJHLA).

The counsellor observing my condition and needs, she offered me regular counselling to come out of mental pressure. Initially, I was quite reluctant to talk to her and most of the time; I just replied her questions only in yes or no
“Haan yah Naa”. She kept on visiting me on a regular basis and gradually I started doing trust on her (female storyteller, RAHNUMA).

4.2 CHANGES IN LIVELIHOOD

4.2.1 INTRODUCTION

The livelihood programmes focused on strengthening communities that live in areas that are prone to flooding. These communities are heavily reliant on agriculture, and damages to farm land due to floods can have disastrous consequences as they (temporarily) leave people without food, jobs, and income.

Survey results show that Oxfam’s programmes have had a positive impact on people’s livelihoods, i.e.: a higher income, a higher value of assets, less months of food insufficiency, and less illness (in the last 3 months) compared to the control group.

Partners wanted to know what had made their projects successful. More specifically: what elements of their projects contributed to the success and how. They were also curious to know how people utilized their increased resources and income.

From the Stories of Change a number of factors could be distinguished that contributed to the improved livelihoods. These factors can be divided in 3 categories: helping people to improve their crop and livestock production and yield, helping people to sell their yield for a higher price, and helping people to strengthen their food security during and in the aftermath of floods. These 3 categories will be further analyzed in the 3 sections below.

4.2.2 HELPING PEOPLE TO IMPROVE THEIR CROP AND LIVESTOCK YIELD

The stories of change show that the combination of the provision of resources (such as seeds, animals, and water facilities) and trainings on how to effectively use those resources and otherwise improve farming techniques, proved to be an effective strategy to improve livelihoods for our storytellers.

Providing seeds (for crop rotation and easier growing) and trainings on how to improve yields

According to several Stories of Change, one very successful activity was to provide people that were in the business of cultivating wheat with seeds of a new crop – in this particular case mung bean, that allowed them to practice crop rotation (i.e. the practice of growing a series of dissimilar or different types of crops in the same area in sequenced seasons, which helps in reducing soil erosion and increases soil fertility and crop yield). Before, people had their lands lie fallow between periods of wheat production, but now those periods could be filled with mung bean cultivation.

Another effective strategy was to provide people with seeds of crops that are cheaper and easier to grow, for example because they grow faster and/or require less water and care.

Furthermore, many storytellers reported that different types of trainings they received about ‘bio-diversity based ecological agriculture farming’ (or: organic farming), had greatly helped them to improve their crop production and enhance their yields. In these trainings they were for example taught how to make and use natural fertilizers, how to practice composting, how to monitor their crops for pests, and how to determine the best times for the sowing and harvesting of both their old and newly acquired crops. This resulted in cheaper production, increased yields, and healthier crops.

After 2010’s flood, we started working with HELP Foundation to develop our food sources. We started late cultivation of mung bean with no fertilizer and focus on our area and conducted many awareness programs. One of them was training on latest production techniques of mung bean. This training was very useful for small poor farmers as it contained very much useful material to increase per acre yield. All this trained us in using only DAP fertilizer at sowing time, 3-4 irrigation with critical time which resulted in highest yield from 5 to 15 maunds per acre. This increased yield was literally a blessing for poor farmers like us who were facing problem of food insecurity (HELP 6).
After harvesting of wheat in year 2007, Mr. Nisar from Lok Sanjh foundation visited my area and after listening my problems related to agriculture farming enrolled me as Lok Sanjh farmer. I started listening to them attentively and same season my cost of production drops to some extent. Through different types of field trainings I came to know that what I have done with my soil? I realized the importance of organic agriculture farming and making use of available resources. I further came to know that apart from growing only wheat and rice there are many other options available that will fetch better price and will increase the fertility of soil as well. I started cultivating vegetables also (LOK 3).

So, I actively started attending the field’s schools and trainings sessions of Lok Sanjh foundation both at village level and also at union council level. With little help of seed from LSF I fully prepared one Kanal of vegetable plot. I have not applied single drop of synthetic pesticides, instead I have applied neem pesticides and composts. Later, on with the trainings and exposure visits facilitated by Lok Sanjh I was able to completely turned my farm to organic. I learned how to prepare and apply different models of composting. I developed my seed bank for local seeds, all the time, liquid compost, dry compost and Neem Pesticides models were seen in my fields. Later on, Lok Sanjh research farm related to System of crop Intensification was also done on my farm. When I was able to completed transform my farm to organic i was able to grow healthy crops that were friendlier to environment. Said crops and vegetables were less reactive to diseases and climatic conditions. I was able to grow organic wheat and vegetables that was the major ingredient of our food (LOK 1).

Not all storytellers were directly convinced about the usefulness of organic farming. One storyteller reported that he had been reluctant to join the trainings about organic farming because he couldn’t believe such a thing would be possible.

In year 2004-05, Rana Yaqoob from Lok Sanjh Foundation started visiting my village, one day he also came to my house and we had half an hour discussion on agriculture farming. I thought that it was all fake and soon the company will run away or might be selling their products. For one year the facilitator regularly visited our village and I did not go to the meetings at all. At that time I heard that the said organization wanted to do agriculture without or minimum application of synthetic pesticides and fertilizers. I thought how it will be possible? So I didn’t show any interest for one year. After one year the organization was able to start the work with 5-6 farmers. I also started going in the meeting and trainings and still at that time I was not satisfied with the statement “How farming could be possible without the application of synthetic Fertilizers and pesticides”? When I visualized the vegetable plot of my nearby farmer where limited pesticides and fertilizers were applied I thought that I will be the next farmer to grow such type of plot. So, I actively started attending the field’s schools and trainings sessions of Lok Sanjh foundation both at village level and also at union council level (LOK 1).

His story suggests that showing people real life examples (proof) of successful organic farming, such as farmer field schools, can be helpful in convincing people to join the program and start practicing organic farming methods themselves.

Another activity that helped people to use their farm lands in a more efficient way, was providing trainings and tool kits for kitchen gardening. With the help of these trainings and tool kits storytellers obtained the knowledge, skills, and resources to independently cultivate vegetables and fruits for household use on small plots on their lands, thereby saving money otherwise spent purchasing these fruits and vegetables at the local market.

We used to purchase our vegetables for kitchen use from the market Rs. 200/day, which used to cost more on our household budget as well our savings. It was a significant compromise on other household needs and children’s education. We are small farmers so we were compelled to spend our savings. It was very alarming situation for us. We are small farmers so we were not able to manage enough land for major crops … When we attend trainings on kitchen gardening we felt deficiencies in our techniques and our livelihood earning profession. With a little more effort, we were trained to manage our own kitchen gardening with easy to adopt methods along with the necessary toolkit. Hence we started to grow some of the important food items like vegetable and fruit by ourselves instead of purchasing from market. The improved methods of vegetables gardening/growing helped us to continue different types of vegetables throughout the year. With growing continued, we got trained about the vegetables the season of which was going to end. HELP Foundation’s team advised us not to use agricultural land just use some portion of land with household boundary which could be utilized for kitchen gardening rather to make it useless just to widen the space in front of house. We learnt to use livestock dung as fertilizer as well (HELP 6).

Livestock support and trainings on how to manage livestock
Another activity that some of our storytellers reported had improved their livelihood was to provide livestock to people that had lost their livestock in the floods or were in need of an(other) income source, together with trainings in poultry and livestock management.

Starting off by giving people one animal and giving more animals based on performance, or only giving animals on the condition that the receiving beneficiary makes sure the facilities for livestock management are in place (i.e. a fence, shed, grazing area, etc.) can help to determine which people in the community are willing to make a serious effort, and will help to make sure that the resources you provide are well used.
Next year Lok Sanjh Foundation registered me in poultry and goat program. Firstly, I was told that organization will give 50 poultry birds and only I have to arrange for shed wire, bamboos and labour. I built the shed at my own and as per agreement birds were given to me. I worked hard and sooner I was able to sell the eggs and got a handsome amount from that business also. Based on my work and commitment LSF then gave me 20 goats. I, with the help of my husband, built goat’s sheds. My husband did grazing of goats and I was doing other husbandry aspects of goat’s management. Afterwards the number of goats increased and we sold the animals also and did religious activity that is sacrificing an animal (LOK 2).

In 2008 I was provided with a unit of 10 poultry birds, I had to build the shed on my own, so I did that. I worked hard and from 10 birds the next year I tripled the birds through hatching. Later on in late 2009 based on my work I was provided with 4 goats also. As per agreement I returned half of the baby goats and started building my goat farm (LOK 6).

Some stories of change suggest that improvements in crop production and yield can open up the possibility for people to start practicing livestock farming, as they will be able to use the surplus of crops to feed the animals. It may therefore be an efficient strategy to combine the provision of animals and livestock management training with seed provision and organic farming trainings, while saving the implementation of livestock related activities until later on in the programme.

### Building water facilities

In some communities water scarcity or problems with the water quality can inhibit healthy agriculture and livestock management.

I own four acres of agriculture land near to my village. Agriculture was the main and sole component of our livelihood. Wheat, cotton, sugarcane and rice were normally cultivated in addition to fodder crops. Underground water was brackish due to which the production was very low. Secondly, our village is situated at tail of irrigation system due to which reduced amount of canal water was available for irrigation. We were not able to irrigate our field from tube wells due to presence of salty water. We were facing the problem of water used for human drinking and washing of cloths. We cannot grow vegetables also. Our livestock were also facing the problem of drinking and are compelled to drink brackish water (LOK 4).

For the storyteller above these problems were solved when LOK constructed a water pond in which irrigation water from the canal could be stored and used to cultivate vegetables that people were previously unable to produce due to a lack of usable water.

Mainly due to construction of water pond and conversion to bio-diversity based ecological agriculture farming system solved the problem of brackish water. I was able to irrigate the crops from canal irrigation water stored at water pond that increased the production. I was able to cultivate vegetables also, which were not previously cultivated due to brackish water. Our livestock were all given the drinking water stored from canal irrigation. Same water was used for washing of cloths and for bathing purpose. Production from livestock and form crops increased considerable and all resulted in increase of income and better livings (LOK 4).

People can only undertake agriculture and livestock farming when there is enough quality water. Therefore, in communities such as those of this storyteller, water problems need to be addressed first before proceeding with other activities, such as the provision of seeds and livestock.

### Providing interest free loans

Providing interest free loans to people who have lost their sources of livelihood after a flood or other disaster can also be a strategy to help people to acquire the necessary resources to start up their agricultural activities again.

Our Farmers Association is linking with other organizations as well. For instance, we have now accessed the facility of interest-free loan as well which has served our agricultural uplift even greater. Our food stock is quite at the level of our annual requirement. Now we have no compulsion to remain hungry or out of stock like we used to be till 2010 (HELP 3).
What do people do with increased yields from crops and livestock?

In addition to finding out how people were helped to improve their crop and livestock yield, the participating organizations were also curious to know how people utilized their increased resources. The following section answers this question.

The Stories of Change show that people use their increased crop and livestock yield in a number of ways.

Firstly, the storytellers used the yield for own consumption. The majority of the storytellers reported that after converting to organic farming and/or taking up the production of additional crops or livestock, they and their household members now had enough to eat and/or that their diet had become healthier because they now cultivated and/or had access to a more diverse range of food products than before (e.g. milk, eggs, mung beans, and vegetables in addition to—for example—only wheat and rice). Some storyteller also mentioned that because natural fertilizers are used, the vegetables also contain less harmful chemicals than before.

Now we are growing successfully vegetables in a small piece of land just to fulfil the need of our kitchen. There is much more difference in taste and purity of vegetables as these are being grown by us with full care. I am sure these are much healthier instead of market vegetables (HELP 5).

When I was able to completed transform my farm to organic I was able to grow healthy crops that were friendlier to environment. Said crops and vegetables were less reactive to diseases and climatic conditions. I was able to grow organic wheat and vegetables that was the major ingredient of our food. Our health becomes better… (LOK 1).

We have more choices of eating food due to the availability of mung bean throughout the year and in addition to this different dried vegetables are also on our disposal all the year (HELP 1).

We as a family are eating healthier and safe food that mainly comes from my farm. It’s all going very well (LOK 5).

Her family is getting their health improved through utilizing milk for personal purpose (RDF 5).

Secondly, storytellers used seeds from remaining (surplus) crops to sow their fields, sometimes storing them in seed banks provided by the NGO first. Some storytellers even extended their farms by renting or buying new farm land that they sowed with these surplus seeds, or by breeding livestock they had received as part of the programme.

Net profit from three acres of my agriculture land increased substantially and input cost declined a lot due to adaptation of local and indigenous techniques and technologies, making use of local resources. I have taken more rented land and widen my agriculture and work. My family members all are very satisfied (LOK 5).

Thirdly, many storytellers said that they used surplus crops, animals, or animal products (such as milk and eggs) to sell at the market, and thereby increased their net income.

I worked hard and sold eggs to meet expense of my children’s school fee and also sold few of the male goats, the money was used for my parents curing. My elder boy or sometimes my husband collected all the eggs and sold at city shops to get higher profit (LOK 6).

The goats have also given birth so we rear the baby goats and the after sometime sale it in nearby market to earn our livelihood (RDF 1).
4.2.3 HELP PEOPLE TO SELL THEIR YIELD FOR A HIGHER PRICE

Help people to undertake collective marketing

A number of Stories of Change show that in order to help people maximize the profit they make from their surplus yield it is useful to encourage them to join Farmer’s Organizations and Farmer’s Associations. It is also useful to help those organizations and associations to negotiate a higher price for their collective yield than farmers will receive individually at local markets or when selling to local middle men. This can for example be done by connecting them with private companies that are interested in selling their produce in big cities.

Our Farmers Association and HELP Foundation planned to get engaged with urban markets for collective bargaining. HELP Foundation engaged our Farmers Association with a private company (Indus Growers Pvt. Ltd.) which supported us in collective marketing of our mung bean production. Now this company pays us more than the local market and then sells our mung bean production in big cities. Every small farmer engaged in this business is earning unexpected returns. As I am also a member of the Farmers Association, my household has earned a lot as additional source of income in a given year (HELP 1).

Our Farmers Association, with the support of HELP Foundation and Oxfam Novib, established its farms centre and other farming related facilities. But most of the effective initiative, in my opinion, was when Farmers Association held consultations and resultantly built the collective marketing system for the agricultural production of all the member farmers from every associated village. I remember when I contributed my mung bean crop first time in year 2012 for collective marketing through Farmers Association’s platform. It gave my household more profits than ever before. Major reason, I believe, was our collective marketing strategy rather than previous practice of individual sale to local middlemen [who always used to purchase our production at very low rates]. Farmers Association’s office bearers had contacted a company from Faisalabad city and sold the whole mung bean collected from all the member households. I do not remember exactly, but I think gained 40% more profit than the previous sales to local middlemen (HELP 3).
Helping people to dry and store food

In order to make sure that people have sufficient food to survive during and after a flood, a number of activities
can be undertaken to strengthen their resilience. For example, helping people to store and safeguard a proportion of their produce, so they can use it as food during and after periods in which farm lands are flooded and harvests are destroyed. This can be done by training people how to dry and preserve vegetables, and by providing communities with the necessary processing and storage facilities to do this.

We built our association with the local organization HELP Foundation which conducted most of the necessary training in our area including the training on Kitchen Gardening and processing of the vegetables and other fruits after drying. This training had very innovative ideas and was very useful especially for our flood affected area … Also we learnt the better techniques to save our stored grains for long time from grain pests, moisture and even from flood. By storing in air tight bins at raised bed and used of fumigation tables within bins for grain pests … We are in better condition as compare to earlier times in terms of food stock availability. Now we have the sufficient food as per our family need. We are growing our food especially fresh seasonal vegetables. We utilize our vegetables drying training skill to dry these vegetable. We can use these dry vegetables in critical condition especially in the time of flood because during flood season mostly we are disconnected from the market. In these situations we use our stored food which we save for these critical times … As earlier before this awareness, we did not have the idea to store food for food crises time. But now we are ready and trained to face such crises situations. We have a sufficient stock of pure and quality dry food/vegetables (HELP 4).

Helping people to diversify their income

Another (supplementary) strategy is to provide people with a second source of income in addition to their agricultural work, so they will still have a source of income left in times farm lands are flooded and agricultural work is impossible. Storytellers who mentioned that they had received help to start an additional job besides farming were all very happy with its results and felt more ready to face future disasters.

The following quote illustrates how people can benefit from having a second income source, in this case a small shop:

I was supported to establish a small shop in front of my home with a little space available … My current situation is much improved and satisfactory than ever. I have established my own shop which is a great support in meeting my household needs on regular bases … My son runs the shop and I have regained access to my agricultural land. Now we have two income sources which are diversified and it has made our life much happier than ever … Now even if our one source is affected by any unforeseen disaster we would not have to be worried much because I think our food is secure now in comparison with our past time (RDF 2).

Another storyteller reported that he had received a 10-day training and a toolkit which enabled him to start working as a mason. This not only provided him with a way to earn more income, but also gave him the skills to construct a concrete house for his own family. By providing masonry trainings and starter kits to people in affected communities, organizations can thus achieve two goals at once by simultaneously providing people with a second source of income that secures their livelihoods during periods of flood, as well as increasing community resilience by making sure that there are people in the community that have the skills and knowledge to build safer houses that are better able to withstand the damaging effects of floods and other disasters.
4.3 CHANGES IN DISASTER RISK REDUCTION

4.3.1. INTRODUCTION

Survey results show no significant differences between the target and control group with respect to increased resilience, as target group members have not taken more measures and do not feel better capable to cope with future disasters than members of the control group. However, the target group feels more threatened by natural disasters and civil unrest than the control group, which could be a sign of increased awareness.

In order to investigate what is needed to make people (feel) better prepared for future disasters, 12 stories were collected by the organizations Doaba Foundation and LHDP. Nine of these stories referred to natural disasters such as floods. The other three stories concerned risks caused by health incidents. The 12 stories indicate that the programmes have at least for some beneficiaries led to feelings of increased preparedness and diminished vulnerability for disasters. Three important factors that contributed to this change could be deduced from the stories, i.e.: skills training, improved livelihoods, and increased community participation and social bonding. These three factors will be further analyzed in the three sections below, after a brief presentation of the barriers to participation in project activities regarding disaster preparedness.

4.3.2. BARRIERS TO PARTICIPATION IN THE PROJECT ACTIVITIES

From some of the stories it can be gathered that people’s willingness and ability to participate in the project activities was not always self-evident. Examples can be found where female storytellers needed to convince their husbands about the benefits of the trainings to obtain approval to participate.

LHDP arranged a meeting in a village Essa Notiyar which is located in our neighbourhood; I rushed to that village and waited to have discussion with them and asked them to visit my village. My husband showed strong resentment when I returned my village and asked why did you paid visit to that village and discussed with those strangers. I tried my level best to convince my husband that the team is talking about good things just have a simple meeting when they come to our village. We both attended that meeting in which he was fully convinced and agreed to work in our village (female storyteller, LHDP).

Furthermore, another storyteller hinted that participation in the trainings on disaster risk management, might somehow conflict with proper cultural and religious behaviour:

... most of my relatives were not in favour to participate in such type of trainings due to cultural and religious point of view (female storyteller, LHDP).

In order to maximize project participation, more information is needed on the nature of these norms, and ways to circumvent these.

4.3.3. SKILLS TRAINING

One of the most important factors that made the storytellers feel more secure and prepared to face future disasters was skills training. Firstly, storytellers reported that trainings on how to pre-plan and prepare for upcoming disasters had considerably increased their level of preparedness. Furthermore, some storytellers reported that they felt more secure because they had learned useful and important skills, such as how to build safer houses, how to make an evacuation plan, and how to undertake kitchen gardening in case farm lands are flooded:

First time we had joint meeting after distribution of goats; they provided us then trainings on kitchen gardening and also on preparedness in which we developed a plan together with all the members of male and female community organizations. The plan focused on how to reduce the impacts of floods and proposed safe routes in case of evacuation during flood situation. This plan is stall placed at central point of outaque [local community gathering space in village]. We raised our houses that were constructed newly as per guidelines sought during trainings (female storyteller, LHDP).

Now we all villages included me are living on raised plate form which are above about 5 feet from river. My family and other 10 households feeling satisfaction and protected from disaster. We all participated in construction work and build our own houses. By doing this, we are feeling protection (female storyteller, DOABA).
Other storytellers mentioned the benefits of attending trainings on first aid assistance in case of medical emergencies due to a disaster, and the impact their new found skills had on them and their community members:

Health facility in our village is far away from my village, at least 10 kilometres. There was no care of children. Especially no care of health, people don’t understand how to cope up with diseases and accidents. I attended a Training form rescue 1122 at my village organized by Doaba Foundation. There I learnt about bandage for wounded person and other skills. This skill enabled me to help a wounded woman named […] who got wounded during cutting grass for her animals in the land (female storyteller, DOABA).

4.3.4. IMPROVING LIVELIHOODS

Some storytellers also reported that they felt better prepared to deal with future disasters as a result of the trainings they received on how to ensure their livelihoods in the face of climate change. These trainings mostly focused on how to perform agriculture in the specific climate conditions of flood-prone areas, for example by teaching the beneficiaries about land use planning and specific cultivation methods. In some of the coastal areas where stories were collected, people’s livelihoods were severely affected by damages to agricultural lands due to heavy floods caused by rain. In these areas, trainings on land use planning and adapted agricultural techniques had supported a restart of the agricultural production.

In 2009 LHDP conducted an assessment for its one projects fortunately my village was also identified for this assessment. They formed farmers’ group in my village; LHDP provide them trainings on land use planning and different cultivation methods and techniques … LHDP resumed work in my village in 2012 and initiated activities on climate change adaptation in my village. This project is also running at present with changed nature of activities. In this project they introduced us new varieties of seeds of rice, livestock fodder (livestock rotation-interaction) and established community-managed seed bank in my village. LHDP also conducted field visits of us to different institutes and areas which ultimately taught to change our cultivation methods and thus we practiced it that improved our yield remarkable … No doubt the disasters will come again and again but we to build our capacity to learn new things and practice it (male storyteller, LHDP).

In the case of our storytellers, teaching them new farming skills that are better adapted to the new environmental circumstances proved beneficial in 2 ways: Firstly, multiple storytellers reported that they felt less vulnerable to future disasters, because they now felt they possessed the skills and knowledge to quickly bring their farm lands back in business after a disaster strikes without outside help.

As compared to the past now community is more reliant on itself and tries to resolves problems by combining their own resources. I want to say that, through different training on DRR by Doaba Foundation. Now we are able to work on self help basis for vulnerable community of rivrine are.

Secondly, for some of the storytellers the new ways of farming had already led to an increase in their income, and the fact that they were economically self-reliant further increased their confidence that they could cope with future hardship:

With the improvement in cultivation methods my land yielded me handsome amount of crop outcomes which increased economic benefits and access to finance. The enhanced productivity has reduced food insecurity of my family. I have enough grain to sustain my whole family and feed them at least for two times round the year (male storyteller, LHDP).

The fear of disasters has been reduced as I am mentally and physically prepared (male storyteller, LHDP).

Teaching beneficiaries how to adapt their ways of farming to the new environmental circumstances caused by climate change and how to increase their income can thus give them an increased sense of safety, and the confidence to cope with and act upon natural disasters, in case they arise.

Another reason to include specific activities aiming for economic improvement (of which people can see the direct benefits for themselves) within a program design is that it may entice people into participating –or men allowing their wives to participate- in the project. For instance, one of the female storytellers reported on how LHDP’s first attempt to form a local female community organization was rejected by the male community members. Later, after an income generating source – goats – was offered, the initiative of forming a community female organization was more readily accepted.

LHDP visited our villages to form community organization but our male members out rightly denied it. One day they came again in villages and shared that we want to distribute goats to females. Then all our male members of the village agreed and thus a female community organization was formed and I become president of it. LHDP provided me three goats; out of which I sold out one goat to cultivate my land (female storyteller, LHDP).
Including a project activity that has a direct and obvious financial benefit for the participant, may thus help to increase participation in the project, especially for women.

### 4.3.5 Community Participation and Social Bonding

Another factor that seemed to contribute to people feeling less vulnerable to future disasters is ‘being united as a community’. The stories showed that a successful way to help people bond as a community is helping them to build community organizations that prepare collectively for future disasters. Some of the storytellers mentioned that they had attended trainings and discussions held by these organizations on how to plan and prepare for the effects of upcoming disasters, and how to organize the community and its farm lands to protect it against flood-hazards. The involvement of community members in these organizations seemed to encourage social bonding. Storytellers reported that after experiencing severe floods and with the help of trainings, they had learnt that acting united makes them stronger in the battle against disasters.

Doaba foundation started work in most flood affected villages in District Bhakkar. Our area was included in the project. We were not organized before. With their coordination and facilitation we formed CO’S of men and women separately in 30 villages. I participated in formation of different formations of CO’S. Doaba Foundation also provides us training on Community Management skills Training. I was also part of this training. There we learnt different tools (organizational set up, record keeping and importance of organization) how to form and run an organization. In village level meetings some CO’s discuss that we should have a district level organization for solution of disaster prone community issues. People are feeling proud on their self struggle and protected from low level flood which may disturb their crops and houses (male storyteller, DOABA).

In some cases, increased social bonding also led to further community action. In the stories, examples could be found where community members cooperated and united against the local government to demand land to build their safe houses on.

Overall, the storytellers seemed to enjoy helping each other and contributing to the community’s wellbeing with their new found skills. For example, by sharing their knowledge with other people, by helping others build houses, or by providing first aid to injured community members.

One woman benefited with my act by providing first Aid to her, but a culture of humanity and help also developed in my house village and in community also. I am happy that I set example of serving (female storyteller, DOABA).

I felt satisfaction on it. For sustainability of this change I have conducted training for women of my village On First aid which I have learnt. I think this is my responsibility to convert my knowledge among illiterate and poor women (female storyteller, DOABA).

Now by doing this, I feel protected as comparing in the past. I am also feeling content that, I have made some other house hold safe (male storyteller, DOABA).

The satisfaction and pride storytellers felt when they could set an example for their community members and received recognition for it also seemed to stimulate them to continue with their activities, and to inspire other community members to follow their lead. This could potentially create a ‘snowball effect’ in which more and more people start to undertake beneficial community activities.

My own house hold was damaged in flood 2010, but my family constructed house in herring without thinking regarding the future or upcoming flood. I attended several training on DRR that made my conscious to think about making my house hold on safer place. I herself and family member my husband, sons and daughters are agit labour. I also make tandoor (bread). I started saving by selling these tandoors. I also started discussion and to motivate my family members to build at least one initial one room as per our available resources to have a safer place in flood situation for our own family. By doing 1 self motivation 2 personal saving 3 self base contribution in form of labour of family made this dream a reality in year 2014. Now, this room is available and in use of my family. If in the future any flood occurs, this room will provide shelter for us. Another good thing, which I realize is building of another two houses (Saeeda and Maqsood bibi house on raise platform) in this year 2015 with my motivation and discussion are also proud of me. But I realize we can do more for our village. My own better understanding by different trainings on DRR, this happened in the year 2014. This dream came in reality by my own saving and frequent motivation to my family members with doing own labour of family members. Other two household constructed on raise platforms may also be a turning point for other community members of my village to do so. After this change, other community members are more motivated to build their houses on raise plate. They are now thinking on this issue to protect their self from the flood. My 18 family members directly benefited from this act and two other household members also in directed benefited indirectly by influence or replication of this model (male storyteller, DOABA).
5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The impact survey has measured the impact of Oxfam’s partners’ activities across a very wide range of indicators. Stories of Change were used to further explore and explain those findings. The major results from these studies are reported below per dimension/thematic section.

Sustainable livelihoods:

- The activities of Oxfam’s partners in Pakistan have a positive impact on income and wealth (the value of land, livestock, labor, production assets and savings). A significantly larger amount of respondents from the target group (33%) have observed an increase in income compared to the control group (22%). Likewise, more respondents from the target group perceive an increase in the value of their assets such as savings, land, livestock, labor, and production assets, with the exception of house quality, loans, and ‘other’ assets.

- Storytellers who participated in the livelihood programme also report that their livelihood has improved. These storytellers live in communities that are heavily reliant on agriculture and prone to flooding. From their Stories of Change a number of activities can be distinguished that have contributed to storytellers’ improved livelihoods, and may prove to be useful for other future programmes in similar contexts as well:
  - Activities that helped people to improve crop and livestock production and yield.
    For example: Introducing new crops that can be sown during times when lands would previously lie fallow or that are easier (cheaper/faster) to grow, and providing people with animals (based on commitment). These crop and livestock provision activities were combined with trainings on easier, cheaper, healthier, and more sustainable methods of production (in this case ‘organic farming methods’ and ‘livestock management’). A prerequisite for effective crop or livestock farming is the presence of usable water, which should be made structurally available to communities that cope with shortages before other activities are implemented.
  - Activities that helped people to maximize the profit on their (surplus) yield.
    For example: encouraging farmers to join Farmer’s Organizations and Farmer’s Associations, and helping those organizations and associations to connect with private companies and negotiate a higher price for their collective yields.
  - Activities that helped people to strengthen their food security during and in the aftermath of floods.
    For example: Helping people to store and safeguard a proportion of their produce so they can use it as food during and after periods in which farm lands are flooded and harvests are destroyed, by training them how to dry and preserve vegetables, and by providing communities with the necessary processing and storage facilities to do this. And, helping people to start a second job (such as shop-owner or mason) in addition to their agricultural work so they will still have a source of income left in times farm lands are flooded and agricultural work is impossible.

- The Stories of Change from the livelihood programmes show that storytellers use their increased income from improved crop and livestock produce to buy new household items, to reconstruct their houses, to buy or rent more farm lands, to invest in farming resources, to save, to pay off debts, to get health care for sick family members, to send their children to (a better) school, and to arrange marriages for their children.

- Generally food security among the surveyed population is low. There is a positive impact, however, on the period of food sufficiency (10.9 months for the target group compared to 10.5 months for the control group), but a negative impact on the number of times per day that a meal is consumed during the most critical month of the year.

Essential services:

- Oxfam projects have not had an impact on school enrollment.
• The quality of the education (i.e. contents of the education, knowledge and skills of teachers, and school buildings and facilities) that children receive is rated higher among parents in the target group of Oxfam’s partners than among the control group. No significant difference was found for parents’ participation in school management.

• Oxfam projects have had little impact on health. Members of the target group were significantly less often ill in the last 3 months, but no significant differences were found for the other health indicators (average number of days people were ill, average number of births attended by skilled health personnel, child mortality, and being tested for HIV)

Life and security:

• Natural disasters are a major cause of damage with no significant difference between the target group and the control group. Roughly 30 percent of all respondents reported to have experienced a natural disaster. The target groups of Oxfam’s partners feel more threatened by natural disasters and civil unrest than the control group (which could be a sign of increased awareness).

• The target group has not taken more measures to cope with future disasters than the control group. Neither do they feel more capable in doing so.

• The Stories of Change of storytellers that do feel that they are better able to cope with future disasters show that boosting people’s practical skills in planning and preparing for a future disaster can – at least for some – be a successful strategy. Activities that contributed to these storytellers’ increased (perceived) ability to cope with future disasters were: trainings on how to build safe houses, make evacuation plans, apply first aid assistance, and undertake kitchen gardening after a disaster, combined with trainings on how to adapt their ways of farming to the new environmental circumstances. This increased people’s ability to secure their means of livelihoods and increased their income so they can put money aside to accommodate the blow after a disaster strikes. The Stories of Change show that by increasing people’s income, as well as their knowledge about and skills in dealing with the (after-)effects of a disaster, they start to feel more self-reliant and confident in their ability to cope and act in case of a disaster. Strengthening social ties by uniting people in community organizations for disaster risk management can even further decrease people’s feelings of vulnerability.

Social and political participation:

• Access to information on public issues is generally low. Among those that have access to media, rather large proportions never or rarely get informed on public issues. Word of mouth, telephone, TV, and Community Based Organizations are the most important channels of public information.

• The survey shows that members of the target group are slightly more involved in community decision making (13% vs. 12%) and are more active in terms of participation in collective actions against injustice or to fight for rights (28% vs. 16%) compared to the control group.

Gender and empowerment:

• Women among the target group are economically empowered by the activities of Oxfam’s partners as shown through being more involved in decision making about household expenses than women among the control group.

• Women participating in the activities of Oxfam’s partners report significantly less acts of violence against them.
• The outcomes with regard to sexual and reproductive rights are rather ambiguous. Women from the target group report better access to contraceptives and a better ability to talk with their husbands/partners about safe sex, but are less able to talk with their husbands/partners about family planning.

• Health problems due to short intervals between pregnancies are a serious problem in Pakistan. From the stories of change a number of factors that can inhibit healthy reproductive behaviour become visible:
  o Women as well as their husbands may simply not be aware that insufficient spacing between pregnancies can cause serious health problems for mother and child, or may not have considered the fact that delaying a pregnancy is even an option
  o If women have the desire to delay or prevent another pregnancy, pressure from their husbands and/or family-in-law and the grave social consequences women may face when they go against their husbands’ and families-in-law’s wishes can prevent them from taking action or even speaking up about the topic of family planning
  o Shyness and cultural taboos surrounding the topic of sexuality make it difficult for both wife and husband to open up and discuss family planning issues with each other, sometimes resulting in the couple not being aware of each others’ wishes to delay a pregnancy
  o A lack of knowledge about- and negative attitudes towards contraceptive use, motivated by religion, tradition, and a fear of side-effects, can make people unwilling to actually use the family planning methods that are available to them

Strategies that have helped our storytellers to overcome these hurdles and adopt healthier family planning behaviour were threefold in nature:
  o First of all, people’s awareness about the health risks and other disadvantages of insufficient birth spacing was increased
  o Secondly, intra-marital communication was improved
  o Thirdly, negative attitudes towards family planning methods were changed

Specific activities or things that worked for our storytellers, and that may thus be fruitful to include in future project design for programmes with similar purposes are:
  o Trainings for women where they are guided to overcome their shyness and to discuss family planning with their husbands
  o Teaching women strategies to convince their husbands and mothers-in-law that birth spacing is in their own interest (e.g. by pointing out the risks involved for the life of the (unborn) child)
  o Directly targeting men, and making them aware about family planning methods and the risks of short intervals between pregnancies through sensitization activities by medical staff, or by involving them as actors or script writers in educational plays about family planning which force them to think about—and recognize— the problems that their own wives and children are possibly suffering as a result of insufficient birth spacing
  o Changing the awareness and attitude of the mother-in-law
  o Having religious leaders speak about family planning. Hearing these leaders express religious arguments in support of family planning and contraceptive use convinced some of our storytellers to stop seeing this as sinful and unacceptable behaviour and helped them to cross the threshold towards actually undertaking family planning
  o Motivating people to use family planning methods, by making it more fun (e.g. selling contraceptives that increase sexual pleasure), or by addressing their desire to be a good mother (e.g. making women aware about the health risks for their child and the negative effects of the extra costs of a baby on the quality of the lives of their other children) or their desire to maintain their physical appearance
  o Making contraceptives easily available, and reducing feelings of shame during purchase
  o Using (local) facilitators that people are already familiar with and feel comfortable sharing sensitive information with, or making sure project participants have repeated contact with the same facilitator to build up trust

The most important lesson from the stories of change is that, for promoting family planning and healthy reproductive behaviour among Pakistani women, it is of paramount importance that not only the women themselves are targeted, but that the knowledge, awareness, and attitudes of all people that have the power to influence or make decisions about the reproductive behaviour of these women (in particular husbands and mothers-in-law) need to be improved simultaneously. This is necessary to create an environment in which women are able to voice and assert their wishes for family planning, without (fearing) negative repercussions.
ANNEXES

A.1 PAKISTAN QUESTIONNAIRE 2014

Part 0: General info

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code of organisation:</th>
<th>Code of Region/District:</th>
<th>Code of interviewer:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant code:</th>
<th>Programme code:</th>
<th>Date of interview:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Sex: Male Female

Location: Urban Semi Urban Rural

Age: ____________ Literate: Yes No

Level of education (finished): None Primary 1-4 Primary 5-8 Secondary Higher education

Participant characteristics:

Marital status: Single Married Unmarried couple Divorced Separated Widow/er

Occupation (current job):

- Farmer
- Fisher(wo)man
- Pastoralist
- Agricultural labourer
- Business (wo)man
- Non farming employed
- Work in own household
- Irregular employment
- None Other

Number of adults living in the household: ____________

Number of children (under age 15) living in the household: ____________

Part 1: Sustainable livelihoods

1a. In the past 12 months has there been any change in the total value of the combined income of all members of your household?

- An increase
- No change
- A decrease

1b. During the last 12 months, what were the sources of your household income? (tick all sources that are applicable)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Own farming/livestock</th>
<th>Own business/service</th>
<th>Agricultural labour on other person's farming/livestock</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Remittances

Interest/rent

Domestic work

Other
2a. In the past 12 months, did the value of the following assets change:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset</th>
<th>Increase</th>
<th>No change</th>
<th>Decrease</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Livestock</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other production resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House (quality)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other assets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Savings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Within your household, who decides on the use of household expenditures?
   - [ ] men only
   - [ ] women only
   - [ ] both men and women
   - [ ] not applicable

4. In the past 12 months, how many months did your household have insufficient food? _______ Months

5. How many times per day did you eat a meal (breakfast, lunch, dinner) on average during the most critical month of food insufficiency?
   _______ Times (0,1,2,3,4 or 5)

**Part 2: Social Welfare**

6a. How many children in your household are in the school age?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6b. Of those children, how many are enrolled at school

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enrolled at school</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not enrolled at school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6c. Has any of your children left school during the last year?
   - [ ] Yes
   - [ ] No

6d. Only for the children who left school during the last year, please mention how many girls and boys left school and what was the highest grade they completed before leaving school?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Number of Girls</th>
<th>Number of Boys</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. How do you rate the quality of the education your son(s) and/or daughter(s) receive specifically in relation to:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Good</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>the content of the educational material</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the knowledge and skills of the teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the school building, facilities and surroundings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the ability you have to participate in the management of the school and influence the quality of education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8a. In the last 3 months, have you been ill to the extent that you were unable to participate in normal daily activities?
- [ ] Yes
- [ ] No

8b. If yes, how many days (incl weekends)?
______ days

9a. How many deliveries (child births) were there in your household during the last year?
______ deliveries.

9b. How many of these deliveries were attended by skilled health personnel?
______ deliveries.

(i.e. Number of childbirths attended by physicians, nurses, midwives, and qualified health care agents. Note: Traditional midwives (trained or not) should not be included.)

10. How many children were born in your household:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>_____</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| … during the last 5 years? |
| | Number |
| | _____ |

| Of these children (i.e. born in the last 5 years) how many are still living? |
| | Number |
| | _____ |

11. Have you ever undergone a voluntary test on HIV?
- [ ] Yes
- [ ] No
- [ ] Not possible to answer

**Part 3: Human Security**

12. In the last 12 months have you experienced physical damage to yourself or your belongings because of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>natural disaster</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>civil unrest / armed conflict</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>banditry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>state action</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>domestic violence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. Do you feel a threat of damage to yourself or your belongings because of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>natural disaster</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>civil unrest/armed conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bandity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>state action</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>domestic violence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14. Have you taken any measures in order to cope with future potential disasters (natural or man made)

☑ Yes  ☐ No

15. Do you feel capable to cope with potential future disasters?

☑ Yes  ☐ No

**Part 4: Social and political participation**

16. Through which of the following media do you get information on public issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Daily</th>
<th>Frequently</th>
<th>Occasionally</th>
<th>Rarely</th>
<th>Never</th>
<th>Not applicable*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community based organisations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word of mouth (friends, neighbours etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*not applicable = I do not have access to this type of media

17a. Did you ever have a serious dispute?

☑ Yes  ☐ No

17b. If yes, did you ever make use of the support from a third party?

☑ Yes  ☐ No

17c. If yes which support did you use (multiple answers possible)

☑ Formal judiciary (involving courts and professional lawyers)
☑ Traditional and customary authority (village chief, religious authority)
☑ Legal aid service by NGO of Community Based Organisation
☑ Mediation service by NGO of Community Based Organisation
☑ Other community or family member
☑ Other

17d. What was the effect of this support on your life?

☑ positive
☑ no change
☑ negative
18. Have you participated in any collective/community action against any injustice or to fight for rights, in the past year?
☐ Yes
☐ No

19a. To which of the following organisations do you belong?
19b. At which of the following organisations do you hold a leadership position at this moment?
19c. At which of the following organisations did you manage to influence a decision making process in the past year?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Leadership position</th>
<th>Influenced decision making</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Religious organisation</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community organisation</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports club</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School organisation</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s organisation</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political party</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade Union</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers organisation</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part 5: Gender and empowerment**

20. Are you able to move safely on your own in your village/town/city during day time?
☐ Yes
☐ No

21. Is it possible to speak out in your community against violence against women?
☐ Yes
☐ No

22. During the last 12 months have you taken any action as a result of an act of violence that you experienced because you are a woman?
☐ No, I had no such experience
☐ No, I had no opportunity to take action
☐ Yes, I have sought protection outside my house
☐ Yes, I talked about it confidentially with another person (family, partner, friends, colleagues etc.)
☐ Yes, I went to the legal authorities
☐ Yes, I talked about it openly

23a. Is domestic violence against women a problem in this community?
☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Not possible to answer

23b. If yes, how big was the problem of domestic violence against women in your community during the last 12 months
☐ big
☐ substantial
☐ small

23c (FEMALE ONLY): Have you ever been hit by your husband during the past 12 months?
23d (MALE ONLY) Have you ever hit your wife during the past 12 months?
☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Not possible to answer
24a. Is it possible in your community to obtain contraceptives to limit pregnancies?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not possible to answer

24b. Is it possible for women in your community to talk openly to their husbands/partners about safe sex?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not possible to answer

24c. Is it possible for a woman in your community to have a safe abortion if she wishes?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not possible to answer

**Part 6 Participation in project activities**

Number of years participated in activities of this organisation (name): ____ years

Type of activity a member of your household participated in during the last year:

- None
- Livelihoods (sustainable production and protection) markets
- Education
- Conflict transformation
- Access to information
- Social and political participation
- Humanitarian aid
- Financial services and
- Health
- Natural disaster reduction
- Access to justice
- Gender / women’s rights
A.2 PAKISTAN INTERVIEW FORMAT STORIES OF CHANGE

WCP Stories of Change - PAKISTAN
You are requested to enter now the Story of Change that you collected. In addition, we will ask for some background information (on the interviewer, the storyteller and the interview itself).
First, do the write-up of the interview in Word and then copy-paste all responses in this survey.

Name of your organization:

Country:

Name of the interviewer:

Gender of the interviewer:

What is the position of the interviewer?

Please enter the following information about the storyteller

Storyteller code
Please note down the number that you have entered in the "storytellers monitoring sheet" for this storyteller.

Name of the storyteller
Please only enter a name if the storyteller has given permission to note his/her name! Otherwise, write down a description like 'farmer' or 'community leader'.

Gender of the storyteller:

Marital status of the storyteller:

Number of children:

Occupation of the storyteller:

Age of the storyteller:

Where does the storyteller live?

When did the first interview take place?

Interview questions
The interview form does not specify the domain of change and the level of change. The interview form contained this question: "What main changes have you noticed in [your life / household / community / organization etc] regarding [domain] in the last couple of years?"

For this interview, on which domain of change did you ask the question?
For example: livelihoods, disasters, SRHR, etc.

For this interview, on which level of change did you focus in your question?
For example: the storyteller's individual life, household, community, organisation, (local) government etc.
Interview questions
Please enter below the information you received from the storyteller. Please take into account the instructions on how to draft a good Story of Change!

How would you describe the current situation regarding [domain] in [level of change]?

What main changes have you noticed in [level of change] in [domain] in the last couple of years?

We have been talking about a number of changes (refer to list above). From your point of view, which one is the MOST significant change?

Why did you choose this change in particular? In other words, why is it the most significant for you?

How did this change come about?
Please try to describe this change in the form of a story with a beginning a turning point and an end

Now that you are where you are, what can you do to get a positive change or sustain the positive change?

What could my organization do to support you in this?

What title do you want to give to your story?

Confidentiality: We may want to use your story for reporting to our donors, or for sharing with other organisations or the wider public.

Do you, (the storyteller):
want to have your name on the story or not?
consent to us using your story for publication or not?
consent to us using pictures/movies we made for publication or not (when available)?
allow us to come back to ask additional information, if needed, or not?

If the storyteller doesn't want his/her name on the story, make sure that you do not record the name at the start of this online questionnaire!

Now, we want to ask you (the story collector) a few questions about the content of the story:

What is the domain of this story?

What kind of change did the storyteller talk about?

The change in the story is a...
Please check all the boxes that apply to this story.

Please check all the activities the storyteller has been involved in:
Please check all the boxes that apply to this storyteller.

This story is about...
Please check all the boxes of the categories that apply to this story.
Now we'd like to ask you a few questions about your relationship with the storyteller:

Did you know the storyteller before you contacted him/her about the interview?

Since when do you know the storyteller?

In the last year, in general, how often did you meet the storyteller?
Please tick the answer that fits your situation best.

Now we'd like to ask a few questions about how the interview was conducted:

How did you collect the story?
Tick all the options that apply

How many interview sessions have you conducted with this story teller?
The sessions can be either face-to-face or telephone conversations, as long as the purpose was to get more information on the story.

How did you record the answers during the interview?
Check all options that apply

How many people were present during the interview, apart from the storyteller and the interviewer?
If you have conducted more interviews with this particular storyteller, think about the interview in which you got most of the information.

Who were present during the interview, apart from the storyteller and the interviewer?
Please tick all options that apply

If you have any other comments on the story, please note them here:

If there were any challenges that you encountered during the interview, please describe them here:

Media
If you have more pictures, you can compress them and upload them in one Zip file.