WOMEN'S ACCESS TO JUSTICE IN MENA REGION

ENDLINE AND FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

OXFAM

ACCESS TO JUSTICE IS A RIGHT FOR ALL
INDEX

13  LIST OF ACRONYMS
15  1. OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION & APPROACH
18  2. STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT
19  3. PROJECT DESCRIPTION
21  4. ENDLINE
22  4.1 Analytical Framework
26  5. METHOD
26  5.1 General notes on endline study design and methodology
28  5.2 Participation in the endline study
Survey of women in the community
28  Survey of women in the community
30  Survey of community leaders
30  Survey of court officials
31  Survey of lawyers
31  5.3 Profiles of respondents
33  Age and gender distribution of lawyers
33  Age and gender distributions of court officials
35  6. MAIN FINDINGS
35  6.1 Access
35  6.1.1 Access—women level
41  6.1.2 Access—Social level
45  6.1.3 Access—Institutional level
### LIST OF FIGURES

**4. ENDLINE**

23  Figure 1 - Analytical Framework as presented within the baseline study

**5. METHOD**

28  Table 1 - Consent to be interviewed - Survey of women in the community
29  Table 2 - Consent to be interviewed - Survey of women in the community - Survey of women with family court dealings
29  Table 3 - Consent to be interviewed - Survey of women dealing with court
30  Table 4 - Consent to be interviewed by study area - Survey of community leaders
30  Table 5 - Gender distribution of court officials - Survey of court officials
31  Table 6 - Consent by lawyers to participate in the survey by study area - Survey of lawyers
32  Box 1 - Occupation of community leaders interviewed by region – Community Leaders Survey (Q4)
33  Box 2 - Occupation of community leaders interviewed by gender – Baseline Survey of Community Leaders (Q4)
34  Box 3 - Specific Occupations disclosed by court officials interviewed by study area - Baseline Survey of Court Officials (Q4)
34  Box 4 - Specific occupations disclosed by court officials interviewed by gender Baseline Survey of Court Officials (Q4)

**6. MAIN FINDINGS**

36  Graph 1 - Variances in Access (women’s level)
37  Table 7 - Copy of family law & training - Access (women’s level)
37  Table 8 - Knowledge of family law - Survey women in the community
38  Graph 2 - Knowledge of family law- consolidated by answers (in percentage)
39  Table 9 - Rating of community leaders of the level of understanding of women in the provision of family law by area - Survey community leaders
39  Table 10 - Perception of lawyers regarding women’s understanding of family law by area - Survey of lawyers
40  Table 11 - Women’s knowledge of legal procedures - Survey women in the community
40  Table 12 - Capability of women to obtain legal services pertaining family law - Survey women in the community
41  Table 13 - Participation of community leaders in any workshop on women’s rights by gender – Survey of Community Leaders
43  Graph 3 - Expected level of support from community leaders in cases of a family dispute brought to court - Survey women in the community (in percentage)
44  Graph 4 - Variances of indicators at Access (social level)
46  Graph 5 - Variances indicators Access- Institutional level (in percentage)
47  Graph 6 - Variance of indicators related to Utilization (in percentage)
48  Table 14 - Experience with court and continuity in pursuit of litigation - Survey of women dealing with court
49  Graph 7 - Reasons for dropping litigations - Survey women dealing with court
8. FINDINGS

50  Graph 8 - Variances of volume of family law litigations and of outcome of litigations in favor of women

52  Graph 9 - Variance of indicators related to Quality

53  Table 15 - Assessment of level of general satisfaction with legal services availed to respondents in their court litigation - Bas Survey of Women in the Community

53  Table 16 - Satisfaction with court rulings - Survey women dealing with court

54  Graph 10 - Variance indicators related to Institutional level (Quality) - Survey of lawyers and court officials

55  Graph 11 - Consolidated overview of variance of indicators related to access, utilization and quality at women/social and institutional levels

73  Table 17 - Overview of project indicators for the three areas of implementation

76  Table 18 - Overview of project indicators - Jordan

78  Table 19 - Overview of project indicators - Iraq

80  Table 20 - Overview of project indicators - Lebanon

84  Graph 12 - Level of support by community leaders for a woman who would resort to court according to community leaders view (in percentage)

86  Table 21 - Amount of pro bono services provided by lawyers to women in the 12 months preceding the survey – endline survey lawyers
This endline and final evaluation report has been prepared under the Women’s Access to Justice in the Middle East and North Africa Region Programme funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency – Sida and implemented by Oxfam Great Britain in partnership with non-governmental organizations in Lebanon (Justice Without Frontiers), Jordan (Arab Renaissance for Democracy and Development-Legal Aid), and Iraq (Asuda for Combating Violence Against Women).

Author: Just Consultancies

Programme Manager: Sarah Barakat
Project Officer: Mirvat Haddad
Graphic Designer: Tania Abdul Rahman

The information in this publication is correct at the time of going to press.

Disclaimer: The views expressed in this publication are those of Just Consultancies and do not necessarily represent the views of Oxfam GB or the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency – Sida.

Oxfam is a registered charity in England and Wales (no 202918) and Scotland (SC039042)

Oxfam GB in Lebanon is registered in Lebanon by virtue of Republican Decree number 3578 dated 10/06/1993.
DISCLAIMER

This evaluation is supported and guided by Oxfam GB and presented by JUST Evaluation team, that comprises four consultants – Stefania Chirizzi, Elisa Visconti, Barbara Lilliu, and Rania Fazah. The report does not necessarily reflect the views and opinions of Sida (Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is with sincere gratitude that the evaluation team acknowledges the contributions of numerous individuals to the final evaluation. In particular, the evaluation team would like to thank the project staff of Oxfam GB (Gender Hub - Lebanon), ARDD-Legal Aid (Jordan), ASUDA (Kurdistan, Iraq) and Justice Without Frontiers (Lebanon) who gave their time and support to the evaluation work.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ARDD-LA</td>
<td>Arab Renaissance for Democracy and Development-Legal Aid (ARDD-LA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASUDA</td>
<td>Asuda for combating violence against women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBA</td>
<td>Beirut Bar Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CB0s</td>
<td>Community Based Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS0s</td>
<td>Civil Society Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROPEAID</td>
<td>European Commission Directorate for Development and Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FE</td>
<td>Final Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRBA</td>
<td>Human Rights Based Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBV</td>
<td>Gender Based Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JWF</td>
<td>Justice Without Frontiers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEAL</td>
<td>Monitoring Evaluation Accountability Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>Middle East and North Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTR</td>
<td>Mid-Term Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD-DAC</td>
<td>The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development-Development Assistance Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTC</td>
<td>Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTP</td>
<td>Outputs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSL</td>
<td>Personal Status Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Steering Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIDA</td>
<td>Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ToC</td>
<td>Theory of Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ToRs</td>
<td>Terms of Reference of the Final Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WAJ</td>
<td>Women’s Access to Justice programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Oxfam GB, in partnership with other leading civil society organizations (CSOs) implemented a three-year project to enhance women’s access to justice in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region (May 2011 - April 2014).

The project is funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) and it is being implemented in Lebanon, Jordan, and Iraq.

According to the ToR the Final Evaluation of the project should enable Oxfam and implementing partners to review the project process, evaluate results, and document lessons learnt in order to guide the development of Phase 2.

The evaluation shall specifically seek to achieve the following:

- Assess project impact by (i) identifying changes in people’s lives, as compared to beginning of the project (endline compared with baseline) and set objectives, outcomes and outputs; and (ii) inform project final reporting;
- Highlight project successes and shortcomings (both at theory of change and implementation levels) and identify significant factors that facilitated or impeded the delivery of outputs, outcomes, purpose and overall objective;
- Identify key lessons learnt from the present project, and incorporate them in recommendations for the design of Phase 2, including review of the suggested theory of change.
After careful consideration of the requirements concerning the Endline and Final Evaluation, the evaluation team proposed a strategy based on participatory and, when applicable, innovative techniques. The evaluation process, according to the main features of the participatory approach, will be characterized by the involvement of the main actors at every stage, including beneficiaries, stakeholders, and project staff. Specifically, stakeholders’ consensual and competing claim, concern, and issues will be taken into consideration as well as beneficiaries’ diverse perspectives.

The proposed strategy aims at achieving the following objectives:

- Gain insight into the implementation of activities from the perspective of beneficiaries, staff, and end users.
- Develop self-sufficiency and sustainability by linking end users to the evaluation planning cycle.
- Increase ownership and responsibility for success-failure of the programme through participation.

End users, project staff, and other stakeholders were involved, as much as possible, during assessment of the findings. Data processing will function to convert data into findings, and analysis and judgment will elaborate findings into final conclusions and recommendations.

The gathered data has been coded and aggregated on a thematic basis, analyzed, and validated throughout exploratory and confirmation stages. The findings, supported by factual evidence and witness’ statements, are presented here in the Endline and Final Evaluation Report, using a descriptive and analytical approach.

The evaluation team comprised four consultants with different backgrounds and roles to better adhere to the objectives outlined in the ToR.

Importantly, the evaluation strategy will rely on the use of audio-visual tools, which aim to adequately reflect the participatory intent of the evaluation and to make the evaluation approach dynamic and innovative. This evaluation study will employ an ex-post design, which includes the formulation of evaluation questions and indicators pertaining to the four main dimensions of the project: individual, community, institutional, and policy. These areas of intervention will be analyzed to measure the project’s progress, achievements, and weaknesses based on key evaluation criteria such as relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability.

The evaluation will also seek to determine Oxfam’s contribution to the project and potential for future developments.

To the extent possible, stakeholders’ involvement has been ascertained by addressing three major groups:

- Those involved in programme operations: management and technical program staff and key partners.
- Those served or affected by the programme: beneficiaries of activities, service providers, communities at large, and other organizations working on similar issues.
- Those who are intended users of the evaluation findings: persons in a position to make decisions about the programme, such as partners and funding agencies.
02 STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT

The first section of this Final Report summarizes the project under evaluation and the baseline carried out by Oxfam at the beginning of the project. It then continues by illustrating the findings of the endline in comparison with the baseline to get an overview of the progress made by the project during its implementation.

The report then presents the framework and the findings of the evaluation, analyzing various aspects of the projects such as policy, strategy/approach and implementation. Every aspect of the project is linked to the relevant evaluation criteria ranging from relevance to efficiency and from effectiveness to impact, including sustainability and crosscutting issues.

Finally, conclusions and a set of recommendations/observations on the way forward for the project are provided. The annexes section provides an overview of the methodology and the tools used during data collection, such as the evaluation grid and other documentation. An overview of the report’s content is also provided in the executive summary, which is attached to this report.

03 PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The following table summarizes the main features of the project:

The Overall Objective of the action is:
To contribute to just outcomes/verdicts for poor women which lead to reduced vulnerability and suffering in the Middle East and North Africa.

The Specific Objective Project Purpose is:
Improvement in quality of legal services for poor and vulnerable women in the Middle East and North Africa.

The Project Outcomes are:
• More women in target countries able to access legal services.
• Community leaders advocate for women’s access to justice in public.
• Lawyer syndicates and bar associations increase provision of free legal services for vulnerable women.
• Improved attitudes and practices of police and judicial officials towards women’s access to justice in each target country.
• CSOs influence policy reform on women’s access to justice in the Middle East and North Africa.

The Project Outputs are:
• Women in targeted locations in Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, and Lebanon are aware of their legal rights under family laws (Personal Status Laws) and in legal procedures.
• Low-income and vulnerable women in programme areas in Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon and Egypt receive free legal consultations, legal aid and representation in courts, and follow up on cases.
• Community leaders have increased awareness of women’s legal rights and men’s advocacy groups are established.
Endline

A baseline study was conducted in 2011, at the beginning of the implementation of the project, in Lebanon, Jordan and Iraq. It consisted of five interrelated surveys aiming at gathering information on access to justice, quality of legal services, and knowledge about current legislation, such as Personal Status Laws (PSL) amongst different target groups and beneficiaries. The gathered information constituted the basis on which Oxfam and its partners tailored the implementation strategy and therefore represents a milestone for evaluating changes produced by the project. The endline focuses specifically on updating data gathered during the baseline analysis with new data collected at the end of the programme, in order to compare findings and evaluate changes. With this in mind, the evaluation team has adopted an integrated methodology merging the final evaluation and the endline exercise, considering them as complementary to each other, as the endline was found to actually play a crucial role in assessing core aspects of the evaluation itself. Indeed the endline, while maintaining its own objectives and approach, has been used as a tool of the final evaluation, focusing mainly on the effectiveness and the impact of the project.

Specific objectives of the study are 1) Providing information enabling evaluation of changes produced by the implementation of the Women’s Access to Justice (WAJ) project, in comparison with findings of the relative baseline; and 2) Producing information to support future strategies and plans.

In order to produce a coherent comparison with the baseline study and generate homogeneous findings, the approach, methodology, tools and analytical framework of the baseline itself have been followed and adopted by the endline study. We will briefly recall them during the final evaluation.

- Lawyer syndicates and bar associations attend awareness raising sessions on women’s legal rights.
- Officials attend capacity building activities on legal justice for women.
- National and regional level advocacy strategies with detailed policy goals and advocacy targets are developed by civil society organizations.
Within this comparative framework, it is relevant to recall the main findings of the baseline which indicated: 1) A low level of effectiveness regarding access to the legal system among women; 2) Impediments to the influence of informal and formal gatekeepers to the legal system, who have the capacity to enhance access of women in matters relating to Personal Status Law; and 3) Major challenges related to legal knowledge and financial access to justice mechanisms among women in target countries.

4.1 Analytical Framework

The analytical framework of the study consists of three components: 1) Access to legal services using an ecological model that is centered on women in the community and their social and institutional environments; 2) Utilization of legal services including process and outcome measures; and 3) Quality of legal services provided, as perceived by both women utilizing legal services and court officials. The evaluation framework is based on systems theory and informed by current knowledge of litigation process dynamics and is consistent with the intervention itself, which is based on a multifaceted model of change.

- Access to legal services is viewed in terms of a) Knowledge and attitudes/practices of women; and b) Social gatekeepers – men and community leaders, and institutional gatekeepers — namely lawyers and court officials.
- Utilization includes volume of litigation, sustainability of litigation and attrition.
- Quality includes measures of satisfaction of women and various gatekeepers.

Both baseline and endline methodology and tools have been tailored to this analytical framework and a system of five interrelated surveys covering all aspects of the framework has been designed and implemented accordingly.

The applied surveys - the same utilized during the baseline study - include: 1) Survey of women in the community focusing on women’s ability to access legal services, roles of community leaders, utilization of family courts, and quality of legal services;

2) Survey of women who had dealings with courts, focusing on assessment of the quality of women’s court experiences;
3) Survey of community leaders looking at knowledge about Personal Status Law and opinions about supporting women in accessing the legal system;

4) Survey of lawyers examining provision of free legal services to vulnerable women, perceptions of levels of understanding of women with regard to Personal Status Law, as well as lawyers’ understanding of PSL; and finally,

5) Survey of court officials examining information on the volume of litigation, knowledge and attitudes, and practices related to women’s access to justice, as well as opinions on the quality of legal services available including presence of discrimination against women.

The following frame presents aspects covered by each survey, as per the analytical framework:

While women were surveyed on most aspects of the analytical framework, with the exception of the institutional survey, the survey on women’s dealings with the court focuses mainly on utilization and quality. Community leaders have been surveyed on access issues only, lawyers have been surveyed on both women and institutional aspect of access and quality, and court officials have been surveyed on utilization, quality and institutional aspect of access.

Looking at the logics of the surveys it is interesting to note that some aspects of the project are the result of a triangulation of different perspectives. For example, the survey measuring personal/women’s level of access to justice is the result of a comparison of three different perspectives (surveys of women in the community, community leaders and lawyers), while some others aspects of the framework, such as institutional and social levels of change, are looked at from two perspectives only. We will see further in the report how this might have impacted changes generated by the project.

Findings will be presented as per the following analytical categories: Access, Utilization, and Quality, based on triangulation of information provided by different categories of respondents. The endline analysis will attempt to analyse which aspects have been impacted the most among these three categories, and at what level (individual/social/institutional) changes have occurred.
5.1 General notes on endline study design and methodology

As mentioned above, five independent surveys were conducted in each of the three target areas – Maten, Zarqa and Chamchamal by three implementing partners JWF, 'Legal Aid' and ASUDA. These five surveys consisted of:

• 1 main survey targeting 600 women from the general population
• 1 survey targeting 128 women who had dealings with family courts
• 1 survey targeting 36 court officials
• 1 survey focusing on 61 community leaders
• 1 survey focusing on 51 lawyers

These surveys were the same questionnaires used during the baseline study; however, additional questions focusing on different qualitative aspects of the project were added and utilized for the evaluation process. Partners have selected and identified data collectors, who have been undergoing training implemented by member of the evaluation team in each location. Following the methodology adopted during the baseline study, random sampling was applied in the baseline surveys of women in the community (with exception of Lebanon, where two-stage cluster sampling with replacement was adopted), and convenience sampling was adopted by implementing partners until assigned targets were reached. Refusals as well as other comments were noted. The table below summarizes main characteristics of the final evaluation methodology:
5.2 Participation in the endline study

Survey of women in the community

Data related to consent to participation, refer to Jordan and Iraq only, as the survey in Lebanon followed a two-stage random sampling with replacement approach. As shown by the following tables, response rate remained high at endline time, with significant increase in Zarqa (from 29% to 79%) and a general growth from 55% to 77% in both areas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consent to be interviewed</th>
<th>Zarqa (Baseline)</th>
<th>Zarqa (Endline)</th>
<th>Chamchamal (Baseline)</th>
<th>Chamchamal (Endline)</th>
<th>Chamchamal &amp; Zarqa (Baseline)</th>
<th>Chamchamal &amp; Zarqa (Endline)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>254</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 Consent to be interviewed - Survey of women in the community

The level of response of women dealing with family courts has remained high, if not increased both in Zarqa and Maten, while it has decreased in Chamchamal, as shown by the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consent to be interviewed</th>
<th>Zarqa (Baseline)</th>
<th>Zarqa (Endline)</th>
<th>Chamchamal (Baseline)</th>
<th>Chamchamal (Endline)</th>
<th>Maten (Baseline)</th>
<th>Maten (Endline)</th>
<th>All Areas (Baseline)</th>
<th>All Areas (Endline)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>94.5</td>
<td>86.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>13.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 Consent to be interviewed - Survey of women dealing with court
Survey of community leaders
The level of agreement to participate in the study among community leaders remained high (90%) across the three study areas. A small variation in terms of gender distribution was found with 100% consent obtained by women and 88% by men (100% at baseline time). The variation occurred among men in Chamchamal only.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>MEN</th>
<th>WOMEN</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Baseline%</td>
<td>Endline%</td>
<td>Baseline%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>87.76</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>12.24</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 Consent to be interviewed by study area - Survey of community leaders

Survey of court officials
Thirty-seven court officials agreed to participate to the endline study (22 at baseline time). While at baseline time there was a high level of refusal in Zarqa compared to Chamchamal and Maten, at endline time the highest level of participation was actually registered in Zarqa (54%), followed by Iraq (35.1%) and Lebanon (10.8%). At baseline time there was a strong indication of gender variation in survey consent, with 50% of men responding, compared to 100 percent of women, however at endline time, 72.9% of respondents were men and 27% were women.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
<th>ALL AREAS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 Gender distribution of court officials - Survey of court officials

Survey of lawyers
Level of agreement to participate has increased in all areas, reaching 98% at endline time, compared to 90% at baseline time. The most significant increase was in Zarqa where consent was obtained from 95% of lawyers at endline, a 15 percent increase when compared against the baseline rate of 80%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
<th>ALL AREAS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Baseline %</td>
<td>Endline %</td>
<td>Baseline %</td>
<td>Endline %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>95.0</td>
<td>95.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 Consent by lawyers to participate in the survey by study area - Survey lawyers

5.3 Profiles of respondents
As recorded at the baseline time, the pattern of age distribution of women who participated in the survey of women in the community varied by study area. Respondents in Jordan were older than women in other areas, with an age range between 46-55 years. Chamchamal had the widest age range, with respondents ranging from 26-45 years, while in Lebanon respondents were comparatively younger than other areas, with an age range of 26-35 years. Similar to the baseline time, there is under-representation of younger women in all areas.

Regarding the age distribution of participants in the survey of women with prior dealings with court, the pattern here is consistent with data collected at baseline time, with younger age groups across the three target areas: In Chamchamal the age range was from 26-35 years, while in both Jordan and Lebanon, the age distribution ranged from 36-45 years.

As for age distribution among community leaders, the majority interviewed in Maten were between 26-35 years. (Note that only three out of 20
respondents in Maten indicated their age); in Chamchamal the majority of respondents ranged in age from 36-45 years; and in Jordan the majority of respondents were over 55 years. As per gender distribution: In Zarqa and Maten men represented from 70-75% of the interviewees, while women represented from 25-30%; and in Chamchamal all interviewees were men. With regard to distribution of occupation, data collected refer to community leaders and court officials only. Profiles vary from spiritual leaders to journalists, offering a variegated picture of local communities. Tables below summarize occupations of respondents at baseline/endline time.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZARQA JORDAN</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL KURDISTAN REGION - IRAQ</th>
<th>MATEN LEBANON</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bank manager, candidate for parliament, project coordinator, director, director of women association, director of youth association, physician, education supervisor, elected official, investigating officer, lieutenant, member of municipal council, project director, public relations officer, secretary, social worker, teacher of Islamic association.</td>
<td>Director, director of religious endowment, physician, elected official, executive director, medical assistant, religious scholar, school principal, school teacher, social advocate, tribal leader.</td>
<td>Editor, elected official, employee, general manager, hotel owner, law clerk, military pilot, university professor, religious leaders, judges, mukhtars, municipality officers/employees.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BASELINE</th>
<th>ENDLINE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family heads (Mukhtar), religious preachers, members of charity organization, supervisor of a vocational center, religious leaders (Emam, Ma’thoun (marriage official), lawyer, member of City Council, lecturer (association member), awareness and communication manager.</td>
<td>Mukhtar(s), spiritual leaders/guides, priests, director of Basma Association, journalist, charity organization official, nun, political party officials, public relations official, lawyers, president of prison fellowship, section heads.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Box 1 - Occupation of community leaders interviewed by region – Community Leaders Survey (Q4)

Box 2 - Occupation of community leaders interviewed by gender – Baseline Survey of Community Leaders (Q4)

Age and gender distribution of lawyers
As recorded at baseline time, lawyers represent the youngest group among all respondents, with the largest proportion of those interviewed between 26-35 years (42 out of 57). In Zarqa, 11 out of 19 lawyers interviewed (57.9%) were between 26-35 years. In Chamchamal 16 out of 18 lawyers (89%) fell in this age range, and in Maten the five participants (out of 20 total) that reported their age were in the range of 26-35 years. With regard to gender balance, Maten and Zarqa had relatively balanced samples. In Chamchamal however, 17 out of 18 lawyers interviewed were men.

Age and gender distributions of court officials
Chamchamal and Zarqa had the widest age variations among court officials with a range between 26-35 years. Regarding gender distribution, men and women were represented in Chamchamal and Maten, while in Zarqa
all respondents were male, which may reflect the gender distribution of court officials in that area. There was a wide range of occupations of responding court officials which included judiciary assistants, court recorders, court reporters, court ushers, observers, accountants, policemen, and supervisors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZARQA JORDAN</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL KURDISTAN REGION - IRAQ</th>
<th>MATEN LEBANON</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>BASELINE</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENDLINE</strong></td>
<td><strong>BASELINE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courier, file keeper.</td>
<td>Judiciary assistant, member of the prosecution</td>
<td>Judiciary assistant, secretary.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Box 3 - Specific Occupations disclosed by court officials interviewed by study area – Baseline Survey of Court Officials (Q4)

Box 4 - Specific occupations disclosed by court officials interviewed by gender – Baseline Survey of Court Officials (Q4)

In this section, main findings of the endline study are presented, organized by component of the analytical framework: access, utilization and quality according to related indicators. Variance levels between data collected at baseline and endline time will be compared in order to record changes.

6.1 Access

Findings show a good progress related to accessibility of the legal system for individual women with disputes related to family law, which seems to be mostly related to increased general knowledge and attitude of women among target areas.

6.1.1 Access-women level

Findings related to this section of the analytical framework are a result of a triangulation of data from three different surveys: women in community, community leaders, and lawyers.

Data show a significant improvement in terms of personal knowledge both of domestic family law and of related legal procedures. This is mainly due to increased number of women who have participated in trainings/awareness raising events. As shown by the following graph - comparing variance of indicators related to personal level of access - the indicator related to “prior training on family law” registers a huge positive change, reaching 1385% in Iraq and 2176% in Lebanon (the highest percentage of variance among all indicators of the program). This explains strong positive changes in terms of: 1) Possession of a copy of family law (350% in Lebanon); 2) “Good” knowledge of both family law and legal procedures (with a peak of 412% and 329% in Jordan respectively); and 3) Increased percentage of community leaders perceiving women’s knowledge of family law as “good”.

06

MAIN FINDINGS
Prior training on family law and possession of a copy of family law, seemed to serve as strong actors for change, therefore it may be meaningful to detail improvement of both indicators across all target areas. The following table shows that progress has occurred among the three target communities, at varying levels. While Zarqa registers a soft improvement, changes in Chamchamal and Maten are particularly tangible.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline %</td>
<td>Endline %</td>
<td>Baseline %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OWN A COPY OF THE FAMILY LAW</td>
<td>1.00%</td>
<td>56.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRIOR TRAINING IN FAMILY LAW</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>49.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 Copy of family law & training - Access- women’s level

As mentioned above, this increase in the number of women participating in trainings and possessing a copy of the family law demonstrates clear progress of personal knowledge. In this regard it is interesting to notice how the percentage of women reporting “fair” and “good” knowledge of family law issues has strongly increased, accounting for 75% of all respondents.

In regard to knowledge of family law in particular: at endline time, 45% of interviewed women across the three countries ranked knowledge of women regarding family law as “fair”, 30% as “good”, 13% as “bad” and 11% “does not know”. The table below details number and percentages by location and shows progress against baseline.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline %</td>
<td>Endline %</td>
<td>Baseline %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAD</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
<td>16.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOESN’T KNOW</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
<td>6.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAIR</td>
<td>38.8%</td>
<td>52.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOOD</td>
<td>18.8%</td>
<td>24.80%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 Knowledge of family law - Survey women in the community

Data show how changes occurred mostly in terms of decrease, both of women reporting poor/bad knowledge of family law and of women expressing a lack of awareness (doesn’t know) in favour of a robust increase in general/fair understanding of family law. The following graph gives a consolidated overview of changes of answers on knowledge of family law.
The increase in understanding of family law is partially in line with the perception of community leaders on women’s knowledge of provisions of family law, as only 7% of community leaders (5% at baseline time) ranked women’s knowledge as “good”. On the other side, 44% of respondents considered women’s knowledge as “fair” (36% at baseline time), while a ranking of “bad” knowledge decreased from 57% at baseline time to 43% at endline. Overall the data demonstrate that a general positive change in the perception of community of women’s awareness has occurred, even if the perception of this change among women themselves is stronger than that of community leaders. Still, it is interesting to highlight that the percentage of respondents ranking legal knowledge of women as “fair” is practically the same among the two groups as reported by 45% of women and 44% of community leaders.

Increased knowledge of women is also confirmed through the perception of interviewed lawyers, the majority of which rank knowledge of women of family law as “fair” (51.8%). It is interesting to note that at baseline time the majority of interviewed lawyers described women’s knowledge of family law as “bad” (53.2%) and 6.4% did not know how to answer. Data show a positive variance within the “good” and “fair” ranking (6% and 43% respectively) and a negative variance for both “bad” and “do not know” rankings (-23% and 100%).
Similarly, in regard to women’s awareness of legal procedures: at endline time, most of the women interviewed across the three countries ranked knowledge of legal procedures as “fair” (40%), while 23% ranked women’s understanding as “good”. A comparison with the results of baseline findings shows a significant increase in ranking of “good” awareness of legal procedures in all areas, where the percent of women reporting “good” increased from 2.8% to 12.0% in Zarqa, from 17.7% to 27.0% in Chamchamal, and from 27.5% to 32.2% in Maten.

Table 11: Women’s knowledge of legal procedures - Survey women in the community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
<th>TOT ENDLINE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BAD</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>39.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOESN’T KNOW</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>37.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAIR</td>
<td>38.9</td>
<td>38.9</td>
<td>19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOOD</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>28.8</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As per the capability of women in general to obtain legal services pertaining to Family Law again, the majority of women ranked their knowledge as “fair” (41.7%), with a significant increase in related ranking of knowledge in each country.

Table 12: Capability of women to obtain legal services pertaining family law- Survey women in the community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
<th>TOT ENDLINE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BAD</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>35.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOESN’T KNOW</td>
<td>30.3</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAIR</td>
<td>41.1</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOOD</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>16.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.1.2 Access-Social level

Findings related to this section of the analytical framework are a result of a triangulation of data from two different surveys: women in community and community leaders.

Data show less progress in attitude changes at the social level, when compared to changes previously discussed at the individual level; however changes at the social level did occur. Similar to what data showed in relation to women’s training on family law, major change at the social level occurred with regard to “participation of community leaders in training and workshops on family law/women’s rights”. Such increase in the number of community leaders reporting to have attended training sessions on women’s rights (43% at baseline, 68% at endline) is homogenous across target areas. Comparison with data collected during the baseline, shows increased rates of participation among both women and men. The table below disaggregates participation by gender.

Table 13: Participation of community leaders in any workshop on women’s rights by gender – Survey of Community Leaders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MEN</th>
<th>WOMEN</th>
<th>MEN &amp; WOMEN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline%</td>
<td>Endline%</td>
<td>Baseline%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>34.50</td>
<td>67.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>65.50</td>
<td>32.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HIGHLIGHTS ACCESS PERSONAL LEVEL:
- Increased number of women trained on family law
- Increased number of women owning a copy of family law

STRONG INCREASE OF PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE both of family law and legal procedures
The level of perceived support for women resorting to court in cases of family dispute has improved among all target areas with 80% of women across the three countries expecting a positive (“fair” and “good”) support from community leaders in cases of a family dispute. The change of perception can be related to the increased number of community members and community leaders participating to trainings and awareness raising sessions on women’s rights, which might have send an encouraging and positive message to women in the community. Additionally, target groups consulted during the field missions emphasized how the project contributed to create a social network in support of women, who are better equipped to seek remedies to their violations. Community leaders are indeed relevant points of references in this social network and the project intervention might have contributed to improve women’s perception of their role.

Data are particularly positive in Jordan, where 72.1% of respondents ranked support from community leaders as “fair” (30.5%) and “good” (41.6%) at endline time, demonstrating a positive increase when measured against rankings of “fair” (14.3%) and “good” (24.3%) at baseline time. Similarly, 73.4% of women rank potential support from community leaders as positive in cases of a family dispute brought to court: “fair” (48.0%) and “good” (25.4%). In the graph below it is interesting to note that women interviewed in Cham chamal described support from community leaders as positive with 74.1% of women reporting “fair” (62.6%) and “good” (11.2%).

If data related to the above mentioned indicators (number of community leaders attending trainings and perceived level of support from community leaders by women) are consistent with each other, the picture of perceived knowledge of women’s rights/family law among men and community leaders is less coherent. Findings would predict that increases in knowledge as a result of trainings, and increases in perception among women of support from community leaders would be indicative of corollary increases in self-reported knowledge of key community members (men and community leaders), however this is not reflected in the survey results. While data show consistent positive change of perceived knowledge within community members across the three countries, major discrepancies have been recorded in Jordan and Lebanon. In Jordan positive perceptions related to community leaders’ understanding of family law seem to contradict negative findings related to men’s understanding of such topics, since within the context of the country, the majority of community leaders are men.
The opposite scenario is presented in Lebanon, where a positive perception with regard to men’s knowledge of women’s rights/family law, is counterbalanced by a negative perception of community leaders’ understanding.

In order to provide an overview of changes that occurred at the social level, the graph below summarizes variance rates of each indicator in relation to social access.

6.1.3 Access—Institutional level

Findings related to this section of the analytical framework are a result of a triangulation of data from two different surveys: lawyers and court officials.

The data show that positive changes have also occurred at the institutional level. With the exception of two indicators reporting a decrease—negative rankings related to the perception of lawyers on the fair understanding of family law by women in Lebanon, and court officials’ knowledge of CEDAW in Jordan, all indicators related to institutional access show good progress.

With regard to lawyers, data from surveys related to lawyers’ participation in trainings on women’s rights and their understanding of family law, show positive variances reaching peaks of 59% and 152% respectively. It is interesting to point out that, while the highest percent of progress at the access and social levels was reflected in indicators referring to participation to trainings, at the institutional level personal perception related to knowledge of family law shows stronger improvement than participation to trainings.

With regard to court officials, results are less consistent in the three countries: data from Jordan showed negative variation on indicators for both “fair” awareness of court officials of CEDAW and “fair” actual knowledge of CEDAW, while data coming from Iraq shows significant progress for both indicators, and moderate change is reported in Lebanon. It is worth mentioning that both Lebanon and Iraq reported significant decreases of barriers to implement CEDAW.

Graph 4 Variances of indicators at Access—social level

### HIGHLIGHTS ACCESS SOCIAL LEVEL:

- Increased number of trained persons
- Increased perception of community support in cases of family dispute
- Contradictory perception of men and community leaders’ knowledge of women’s rights
The table below gives an overview of variances for all institutional-related indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Jordan</th>
<th>Iraq</th>
<th>Lebanon</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participation of lawyers in prior training on women's rights (%)</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>351%</td>
<td>152%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived personal understanding of family law for lawyers (%)</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of lawyers of the FAIR Understanding of women of family law by area (%)</td>
<td>146%</td>
<td>-16%</td>
<td>-34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair awareness and knowledge (hearing about) of CEDAW (%)</td>
<td>360%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived decrease of barriers to implement CEDAW (%)</td>
<td>-67%</td>
<td>-75%</td>
<td>-75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Graph 5 Variances indicators Access- Institutional level (in percentage)

HIGHLIGHTS ACCESS INSTITUTIONAL LEVEL:
- Increased perceived knowledge among lawyers of family law
- Perceived decrease of barriers to implement CEDAW (Jordan and Iraq)

6.2 Utilization

Findings related to this section of the analytical framework, are a result of a triangulation of two different surveys: women in community and women dealing with court and court officials.

While general improvement has been recorded in terms of utilization of legal services among women in community/dealing with court related indicators, changes registered at the institutional level are quite weak. Data show improvements at personal levels in terms of utilization, with more women accessing courts and believing that resorting to court allows women to access their rights (with the exception of Lebanon), but data also show and increase in the rate of women dropping litigations. The following table shows percentage of variance by women-related indicators of utilization, per country.
While significant increases in the number of women accessing the legal system in all target areas have been recorded - with the following variance rates 65% in Zarqa, 211% in Chamchamal and 313% in Maten - a decrease in rates of continuity in pursuit of litigation has been recorded in Jordan and Iraq.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>LEBANON</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Baseline</strong></td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Endline</strong></td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 14 Experience with court and continuity in pursuit of litigation - Survey of women dealing with court

Aggregating statistics from the three study areas, showed that attrition in pursuit of court cases was mostly attributed to reconciliation (i.e. settling out of court), followed by insufficient funds and the length of proceeding, as reflected at baseline time.

Graph 7 Reasons for dropping litigations - <survey women dealing with court

Data on dropout rates are consistent with decreases in the volume of family law litigations both in Jordan and Iraq, and that the outcomes of litigation in favour of women is reported to have lowered as well as compared to baseline time. With regards to the latter, it is possible to presume that the limited engagement of judges played a role in the project action, affecting its consistency in improving favourable verdicts for women. This is an important aspect that should be taken into account in the next future.
Endline data on utilization showed that the project impacted change at the personal level (i.e. increase in number of empowered women resulting in increase in number of women taking cases to court). Social and institutional deterrents recorded at baseline time remained, however endline analysis revealed a shift in their role. For example, at baseline time women reported pressure/economical vulnerability/administrative deterrents at the Access Level impacting their decision to pursue cases in court, however at endline time the role of these deterrents had shifted to the Utilization Level, particularly impacting attrition rates related to pursuit of court cases. These results may indicate that the project was successful at targeting deterrents at the Access Level, however a more specific and focused approach could be helpful in reducing the negative impact of these deterrents at the Utilization Level.

### 6.3 Quality of legal services

Data on quality of legal services paint a non-homogeneous picture among the three countries, in part due to the fact that the institutional contexts of each country are not fully comparable to each other.

In Iraq, general satisfaction was reported with regard to legal services among women in the community and women dealing with the court (Questions 14 and 15 in the following graph), treatment of women by court officials; emotional/psychological impact of the court experience. However, negative variances were reported in relation to women’s dealings with the court reflected in indicators related to length, administrative and financial aspects of legal proceedings.

In general, data in Jordan reflected positive feedback from women in the community and women dealing with the court in terms of positive variances related to most indicators evaluating quality of legal services, with exception of experiences with administrative procedures.

Data from Lebanon shows a discrepancy between perception of women in the community and perception of women dealing with the court; while the general perception among women showed negative variances (Q 14 & 15), feedback provided by women dealing with the courts showed positive variances.
It is relevant to mention that a low number of answers related to quality of legal services was registered among women within communities across the three target areas: only 11.47% answered the question. Still, satisfaction with the legal services seems to be reflected in the data with 48% (36% at baseline time) of all respondents reporting “fair” satisfaction with legal services: 27% in Jordan, 64% in Iraq and 25% in Lebanon. The number of women who reported a “good” level of satisfaction also increased, reaching 37% across all areas (24% at baseline time). Change in this regard is particularly strong in Jordan where the percentage has increased from 20% at baseline time to 46% at endline time.

While a low response rate was registered among women in the community, 64.67% of interviewed women who had dealings with the courts answered the question related to the level of satisfaction with court rulings and results showed an increase in “good” rankings (from 30% to 39.3%) and a decrease in “bad” rankings (from 36.7% to 14.3%).

At the Institutional Level court officials in both Iraq and Lebanon reported a decrease of presence of discrimination against women in courts, and in Jordan they reported a significant positive variance in terms of length of proceedings. Assessment of “fair” support of lawyers to vulnerable women was not homogeneous among the three countries.
6.4 Conclusions

To draw conclusions on the volume and level of change generated by WAJ, analysis should consider two different aspects: 1) To what extent change has occurred among the three analytical components of the program (access, utilization and quality); and 2) To what extent personal/social/institutional levels have been affected by the activities of the project.

With regard to the first aspect, comparing the average progress of the three components of the analytical framework – access, utilization and quality – it is evident that the level of access has been the most positively affected, with an average variance rate reaching 340%. Change has indeed occurred within utilization and quality (positive variances of 68% and 87% respectively), but as mentioned in the previous sections, the volume of this change is less compared to the results obtained at access level.

In looking at the various levels of the analytical components, it is important to take into consideration that the impressive change in terms of access is mostly due to progress at a personal level, while changes at social and institutional levels are less evident. As analysed in the previous sections, change at the personal level has been produced mostly by an increased knowledge which generated a chain of positive changes: empowerment of women, whose understanding of family law issues is more recognized by both community leaders and lawyers, and increased utilization of legal services. From this perspective, knowledge represents a key factor in facilitating change within the framework of the project.

Additionally, the data shows that change related to external factors rather than personal factors (being it of women, community members, lawyers or court officials) has not fully occurred. In fact, negative variances in terms of continuation of litigations, volume of family law proceedings and nature of related verdicts, show that the project has not been fully effective in tackling structural deterrents to women’s access to justice.
Costs of lawyers, length of proceedings, administrative issue etc. still play a role in impeding women’s access to justice and should be taken into account within a second phase of the project.

With this in mind, referring back to one of the main findings of the baseline study, namely “Major impediments include knowledge and financial access”, the fact that the general level of knowledge among women and some gatekeepers has increased at different layers, represents a positive change produced by the project. Looking at the utilization component, again data show a high percentage of variances within the number of women who had experiences with the court (65% -313%), representing progress towards addressing one of the main gaps identified by the baseline study, namely “A low level of effectiveness of access to the legal system among women”. Taking into consideration the number of pro bono services provided by lawyers has not changed significantly between the baseline and endline times, it would be reasonable to conclude that spreading awareness and knowledge about family law among target communities must have contributed to increasing the rate utilization of legal services. On the other side, findings did not reveal any solid evidence of significant changes related to main external factors leading women to drop litigations, for example reconciliation, insufficient funds and length of proceedings.

The same patterns applied to the quality of legal support, suggesting some improvement in the perception of both women within the community and women who have been dealing with courts, however persistent institutional and administrative elements acted as deterrents toward significant improvement.

07
EVALUATION FRAMEWORK AND QUESTIONS

This chapter describes the evaluation framework used in the study. It starts by reviewing some technical issues about the approach. Next, the evaluation criteria are defined and the chapter ends by explaining the correlation between the key areas of engagement, the approach, and the activities that constitute the framework of the evaluation.

The evaluation framework is the structure of issues to be examined based on study of the logframe and other project materials. The presentation follows the style adopted by EURPEAID in their Evaluation Guidelines and evaluation criteria follow the OECD-DAC guidelines. These criteria are: impact, relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability. Each section also incorporates the answers to the set of evaluation questions included in the ToR.

7.1 Evaluation Issues

Assessing the Impact - Measuring changes in the lives of the target groups is a challenging task, including multiple levels of complexity. The nature of change can be difficult to measure. Characteristics such as social change and empowerment are fraught with problems of how to define objectively verifiable indicators. Measurement of change may depend on the extent to which indicators can be quantified and exist for independent inspection.

Ascertaining the magnitude of change is also difficult. Measurement before and after an event is desirable however, unless the individuals who participate in a project are known beforehand to establish a baseline, the best estimate of change will have to come either from a statistical average of data before-the-event, or by memory recall. Data series may need to be
collected for several years to demonstrate statistically significant change. Finally, in order to attribute any change to the direct effects of a project it will be necessary to compare the experiences of those participating in the project with others who did not, but were living under comparable circumstances and experienced secular changes common to the participants. Therefore, the most robust evaluation model relies on quantitative data collection collected from project participants before and after project activity.

Combining such self-evaluation with participatory tools that promote triangulation of information is widely accepted as a practical approach to project evaluations.

This evaluation study will use triangulated self-evaluation tools described above, supported by secondary data when available at the project level. This will result in quantifiable responses to participants’ own perceptions of the benefits they have gained. It will also generate data on access to justice that can be compared with the baseline study carried out at the beginning of the project. This type of evaluation is cost effective and relatively quick to enumerate through a combination of quantitative questionnaires, qualitative focus groups, and individual interviews.

7.2 Evaluation Framework

Analysis of the logframe and the related project documents lead to the identification of specific areas of engagement that can be considered the starting point of the evaluation framework. These areas can also be viewed as characterizing niches for Oxfam:

- **Participation and empowerment**: Ensuring that the action considers final beneficiaries, target groups, stakeholders, and local partners as active contributors, guaranteeing their full participation in defining and driving the response modalities in terms of social mobilization and advocacy actions at the local level.

- **Multi-layered approach/model of change**: Ensuring that the action takes into consideration different levels of engagement including individual, community, institutional, and policy levels.

These areas of engagement have been translated in practice by using a variety of approaches in the project which included:

- **Participatory methodologies**: These ranged from consultations to meetings with women, community leaders and other stakeholders.

- **Vulnerability strategies**: The identification of root causes of vulnerability such as gender and financial constraints was an important component of the project.

- **Empowerment strategy**: This strategy focused on building the knowledge of beneficiaries, as well as their skills and confidence through a series of activities.

- **Human Rights Based Approach**: The overall approach to the project was based on the promotion and respect of human rights standards.

- **Mobilisation**: This occurred at different levels. Two meaningful examples include: (i) the practical involvement of law students in the activities, which eventually lead to more pro bono work; and (ii) the deployment of paralegals which was strategically integral to social mobilization and inclusion.

- **Influencing strategies**: The targets of these strategies were key actors at community, institutional and policy levels. The aim was to positively influence a change in attitude towards women’s access to justice.

- **Partnership**: This action was implemented by local partner organizations.
Using participatory methodologies and a multi-layered approach as a starting point and enacting them through the above approaches, resulted in actions that stand apart from the top-down or short-term modalities.

The framework for the evaluation recognizes that analyzing activities in isolation would not give justice to the synergistic qualities of the project as a whole. Therefore, it will be important to understand: 1) To what extent Oxfam and its partners have been consistent with their aim of improving access to justice for poor women in the target areas, not only providing free legal assistance, but also empowering people and putting the most vulnerable individuals at the center of the process; and 2) To what extent the approaches adopted actually shaped intervention in the field.

To answer these primary questions regarding the project, the related approaches, implemented activities, and project impact will be analyzed according to the following criteria:

**Evaluation criteria:** This evaluation will use well-established evaluation criteria outlined in the table below. The definitions given here are derived from those adopted by OECD/DAC criteria to ensure compatibility of analysis. The ways in which the criteria are applied to different key areas of intervention, and the related means of verification, are set out in the evaluation grid [Annex 1].
08 FINDINGS

8.1 Relevance

*Did the intervention suit priorities and policies of people and communities it is intended to benefit?*

The project relevance has been measured against its identification of problems and needs in the target areas and their integration in the design of the project, as well as its alignment with key national and international development policies and strategic documents. From the analysis of the logframe, the project documentation, and the feedback from the project management staff (including local staff), it can be said that the intervention logic of the project is excellent and highly consistent with the target countries' needs and policy priorities both at regional and country levels.

Women in the Arab region are on average more disadvantaged economically, politically, and socially when compared with women in other regions, and certainly more so than in regions with similar income levels or at similar stages of economic development (e.g. Latin America, Southeast Asia, East Asia). Women are also under-represented in senior and decision-making positions in politics, government, the judiciary and the private sector. With regard to constitutional rights, most Middle Eastern countries include a clause in their constitution that guarantees the equality of all citizens, with some variation regarding the principle of non-discrimination and the prohibition of different forms of discrimination; additionally, some countries have also drafted new constitutions after the waves of political reforms brought about by the “Arab Spring”. It can be said that most countries have made significant progress in improving the legal status and the rights of women through policy and legal reform, however there are significant gaps between constitutional reforms and enforcement of rights and women throughout the region still face systematic forms of discrimination that pervade every aspect of their lives.

Moreover, Arab countries are unique in their adherence to family laws – also known as personal status laws (PSL) – that subjugate the legal status of women to that of a dependent with respect to issues of marriage, divorce, child custody, and inheritance. The majority of states that have signed the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) in the MENA region have done so with significant reservations to avoid conflicts between international and national laws, specifically with family laws.

Traditional gender norms with regard to division of labor remain strong among Arab states where women’s roles are seen primarily in relation to the family and a kind of “patriarchal gender contract” prevails across the region. The cumulative effect is gender-based discrimination and second-class citizenship for women, although in varying degrees across countries. Many challenges persist in the effective enforcement of existing legal provisions that guarantee the respect of women’s rights. These challenges are twofold, resulting from overall weakness and complexity of the legal system which negatively affect women’s access to justice, and a lack of awareness among women themselves in regards to their own rights. Taking this into account, it can be affirmed that the project directly contributes to, and aligns with, an impelling need for disadvantaged women to improve their access to justice.

---

2 UN Women for Arab States & The committee on Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW Committee) Regional Consultation for the Proposed General Recommendations on Women Human Rights in Situation of Conflict and Post Conflict Context, Report, page 9
3 Supra note 2, page 28
In Jordan there have been a number of important improvements with respect to women’s rights. For instance, the publication of CEDAW in the official gazette in 2007, giving the Convention the force of law, and in March 2008 the government, promulgated the Family Protection Law, designed to regulate the handling of domestic abuse cases by medical workers and law enforcement bodies. While Jordanian women now largely enjoy legal equality on issues such as freedom of movement, health care, education, political participation, and employment, the personal status law remains discriminatory despite a 2010 amendment. Marriages between Muslim women and non-Muslims are not recognized. A woman separated from a Muslim husband forfeits her custodial rights after the child reaches seven years of age. Additionally, Article 9 of Jordan’s nationality law denies women married to foreign-born spouses the ability to pass on their nationality to their husbands and children and articles 98 and 340 of Jordan’s penal code, which provide for reduced sentences for perpetrators of “honour crimes,” remain in force even though criminal courts have begun to issue stricter sentences for honour killings and a new specialized tribunal for cases involving honor crimes was created in 2009.

On the other hand, social norms often deter women from seeking justice and protection through the legal system. Many women have internalized such cultural attitudes and believe that discrimination and abuse are unavoidable parts of their existence. Moreover, for disadvantaged women it is difficult to request legal remedies without adequate legal assistance because in Jordan, as in the majority of the Middle Eastern countries, the judicial legal system is quite complex. It consists of three categories of courts: civil courts, religious courts and special courts. The civil courts are courts of general jurisdiction and hear civil and criminal cases that are not reserved by law for other courts. The religious courts, which consist of Shari’a (Islamic law) courts and tribunals of other religious communities, have jurisdiction over personal status matters, such as marriage and inheritance. Additionally, there are several special courts, the jurisdiction of which is specified in the laws creating them, for example the State Security Court, which has jurisdiction over cases relating to state security and drug offences.

In terms of legal assistance the provision of pro bono legal services by lawyers to disadvantaged individuals is not common in Jordan. According to the Bar Association Law, one of its goals is to assist in providing legal services to those who cannot afford them, however, they have no established mechanisms to organize and encourage pro bono efforts by Bar Association members and there is no specific governmental body regulating this type of work in Jordan. According to their by-laws, the President of the Bar Association may assign any Jordanian lawyer, once per year, to represent on a pro bono basis an individual lacking the means to hire a lawyer. In practice, accepting a pro bono assignment is not mandatory, and the lawyer may refuse to provide the representation. Although pro bono services are not common there are a number of governmental and non-governmental organizations that provide free legal services to people in need, with some having a primary focus on providing services to women.
The WAJ project has targeted the area of Zarqa, the second most populated governorate in Jordan after Amman. A combination of factors led to the selection of Zarqa as project location. These included socio-economic patterns, high incidence of violence, and the number of courts. Also, in Zarqa there are many existing programs ranging from emergency response to development and this project was seen by ARDD-LA as an opportunity to build on existing efforts in an area where the organization had not worked before. The evaluation findings revealed that the project consistently responded to the profound needs of the target population, as validated throughout all meetings with beneficiaries, target groups and key stakeholders.

IRAQ

According to the Iraqi Constitution of 2005, Islam is the main source of legislation in the country and laws that contradict Islamic provisions may not be enacted. Article 41 of the Constitution allows for personal status matters [such as marriage, divorce and inheritance] to be governed by the rules of each religious group in Iraqi society. Article 41 also conflicts with article 14 of the constitution, which calls for non-discrimination and equality before the law. Due to the controversy of article 41, it has not yet been put into effect. Until the dispute is resolved, a unified personal status law (a unique example in the Middle East) remains in place that builds on the 1959 personal status code. Many attempts to reform this law have been made. Recently for example (October 2013), Iraq’s Justice Minister introduced a draft law to its Council of Ministers (called the Jaafari Personal Status Law) which would restrict women’s rights in matters of inheritance and parental and other rights after divorce, making it easier for men to take multiple wives, and permit girls to be married from age nine. If passed, this law would be a huge setback for women’s rights in Iraq, and would go against CEDAW’s provisions, ratified in 1968, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, ratified in 1994, its own constitution (Article 14) and a number of other international instruments.

Given its status as an autonomous region, the Parliament of Iraqi Kurdistan, in 2008, passed a law amending many of the key provisions of the 1959 Iraqi Personal Status Law. The Kurdish amendments to the law further extended women’s rights in marriage, divorce and inheritance, by placing more restrictions on polygamy, and giving more rights to women in divorce for example. Moreover, in 2011 a new anti-violence against women law was passed by the Parliament. Major provisions of the law related to the punishment of physical, sexual and psychological assault committed within the family. It also created conditions for the protection of victims and mandated the establishment of specialized courts, as well as penal and financial punishments for those who promote or practice female genital mutilation, a major issue in the country. However, despite these advances, women still face many challenges in Iraqi Kurdistan. The threat of violence hinders most women from going to court to ask for their rights, assuming she is aware of her rights in the first place, which unfortunately a vast majority of women are not. Furthermore, for women who do choose to go to court, lawyer’s fees are often cost prohibitive and unaffordable, further hindering women’s access to justice.

The justice system in Iraq is mixed, similar to Jordan, and is comprised of both civil and religious courts. Although the justice sector has been making steady progress, many structural and capacity gaps still exist. The judiciary sector is suffering from lack of human resource capacity to manage their workload, particularly with regard to court personnel and judges.

---

13 The Kurdistan Regional Government (KRG) according to the 2005 Iraqi Constitution cannot abolish laws, but has the right Not to apply them and to use other legal texts.
15 In Iraqi Kurdistan, navigating approaches to justice for rural women, article, available at: http://www.namati.org/entry/in-iraqi-kurdistan-navigating-approaches-to-justice-for-rural-women
Additionally, in the context of new laws (such as the GBV Law), as well as emerging social, economic and political dynamics, lawyers, judges and other legal professionals lack knowledge and awareness regarding how to best increase women’s access to justice. There are still numerous barriers for poor and vulnerable individuals to access and use the formal justice system, including lack of knowledge of basic rights, lack of guidance on navigating the legal and court system, cost prohibitive fees for retaining a lawyer and overall delays in the judicial process causing poor follow up. Pro bono legal assistance was supported during Saddam’s regime, when a dedicated budget for vulnerable women was made available for courthouses. Today pro bono legal services are not common in Iraqi Kurdistan, where these types of services are envisaged solely for criminal cases, and widely viewed by lawyers to be a social inconvenience.

The area of Chamchamal is amongst the most conservative areas in Kurdistan, where patriarchal norms predominate and strongly affect the conditions of women. Kurdistan is a place where the safety and security of staff and beneficiaries is of serious concern when working to advance women’s access to justice. For women in this region, ‘mistakes’ are still punishable by death. A simple action such as using the phone can turn into a life threatening issue for women. The WAJ project is tackling highly relevant needs of women in the area, as confirmed by all players and final beneficiaries.

LEBANON

The Lebanese constitution asserts the equality of rights and duties for all citizens, regardless of gender (Article 7), and also stipulates that individual liberty will be guaranteed and protected by law (Article 8). In Lebanon, unlike most other Arab states, Shari’a law is not held up as the main source of legislation. The preamble of the constitution declares that, "Lebanon is committed to apply the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in all domains without exception," and that international treaties and their provisions have precedence over national laws and legislation. In Lebanon, CEDAW was ratified in 1997.

However, gender-based discrimination persists in some laws, which have not been challenged as unconstitutional.

Generally speaking progress on women’s rights since the 2006 war has been minimal, and many Lebanese policies and laws remain discriminatory in nature. For instance, Lebanese women are unable to pass their nationality to foreign husbands and their children, the definition of and punishment for adultery differs depending on whether the perpetrator is male or female, and men are given reduced sentences for committing “honour killings”. Systemic bias is also reflected in what has been recognized by many as discriminatory provisions of the multiple personal status laws, which apply to citizens based on their religion. Under these laws, women are disadvantaged in terms of marital rights, divorce proceedings, and child custody.

The Lebanese legal system is primarily based on the French and Egyptian legal systems. The different religious communities in Lebanon have their own personal status laws. Therefore, marriage, divorce, custody, and inheritance are governed by religious codes, of which there are 15 recognized by the state. Each religious sect follows a distinct set of personal status laws, with several of the country’s 18 sects falling under a single jurisdiction. For example, for Muslims, the Shari’a courts hear personal status cases. The courts are separated into Sunni and Shiite hearings. For the different Christian denominations in Lebanese society the ecclesiastical courts have jurisdiction over personal status issues.

---

17 Supra, note 16
20 Reservations were maintained on art 9(2), 16(1, c, d, f, g), art 29(1).  
21 Supra, note 19, page 3 
22 Supra note 18, page 3. 
23 Supra note 11, Chapter on Lebanon page 3.
WAJ in Lebanon addresses the personal status law of Catholic sects (and Maronite) in the specific region of Metn – Mount Lebanon. Catholic PSL in Lebanon is linked to the social fabric, culture and traditions of those living in the region. Civil marriage in Lebanon is not an option; hence, the vast majority of marriages are religious in nature making all personal status issues social issues, hence subject to social norms, customs, and stigma. The need for legal and social support is evident in such cases.

By shunting citizens into religious communities, the personal status laws fracture the population along sectarian lines in an intimate, personal way. In this extremely complex context is not easy for rights holders to advance their claim without legal assistance. Also in Lebanon, as in Jordan and Iraq, there is no government-funded legal aid system in place. Therefore, the responsibility of ensuring that everyone has equal representation in court through pro bono work rests entirely on Bar Associations and NGOs. The general economic vulnerability of the country, the lack of confidence in the court system and judicial independence, in addition to the high court fees, and the lack of satisfactory legal representation in civil and criminal cases, leave a considerable part of the Lebanese population, and especially disadvantaged women, without access to the legal system.

Divorce among Catholics (Christians) is still considered to be socially stigmatizing and women who divorce face enormous social and economic pressure, in addition to significant legal challenges relating to alimony and child custody.

HIGHLIGHTS RELEVANCE:
- The project is relevant in terms of the needs of the target countries and beneficiaries.

8.2 Efficiency
How effectively and efficiently have our resources been used?

Overall programme efficiency
The WAJ project was initially expected to involve five countries - Jordan, Iraq, Lebanon, Egypt and Yemen through a 'one-programme' approach that integrates direct action, capacity building and advocacy initiatives. The direct implementation of the project at the national level was planned to take place in all countries with the sole exception of Yemen, which mainly served as reference experience – in fact Oxfam GB runs a longstanding project on legal protection in collaboration with a Yemeni partner.

Two major constraints occurred over the project implementation:

1. Egypt – The WAJ project proposal did not obtain the approval of the Ministry of Solidarity. This is a common scenario that many organizations have been recently experiencing in Egypt, following the uprising of January 2011. The overall process of deliberating on the project authorization lasted several months and the final response from the Ministry came while the project was already running in the other countries. A few options were explored on how to reallocate the funds for Egypt. It was finally decided by Oxfam, in agreement with Sida, to freeze the funds, which in fact remained unspent.
II. Yemen – The organization of a study tour was expected to be carried out in Yemen in the second year of project implementation. The worsening of the political and security situation, in combination with visa restrictions, generated major delays that compelled Oxfam to revise the work-plan accordingly. The study tour was finally organized in Yemen in July 2013 with the approval of the donor.

At the time of evaluation the overall programme implementation in Jordan, Iraq and Lebanon is in its last quarter. Despite some internal factors (e.g. high turn-over and temporary suspensions) that resulted in temporary delays over the project duration, the three countries managed to catch up on project activities and move toward the completion of the programme delivery in a timely manner.

The table below shows an overview of the performance progress indicators versus the targets. It is important to note: 1) The following indicators are not final as the evaluation work was carried out two months before the end of the project; 2) Data provided by the field countries reports on progress until January/February 2014; and 3) Targets are adjusted to 75% of the proposal figures in consideration that one country (Egypt) has not taken part in the project and thus is not included in the analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OUTCOMES</th>
<th>OUTPUTS</th>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>PERFORMANCE AGAINST OUTPUT INDICATORS</th>
<th>VARIANCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Women attending awareness raising sessions in (3) years in (3) countries</td>
<td>4500</td>
<td>2549 7507</td>
<td>-43% 67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free legal consultations in (3) years in (3) countries</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>669 2558</td>
<td>-44% 113%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free legal representation in (3) years in (3) countries</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>86 212</td>
<td>-68% -21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free follow-up cases in (3) years in (3) countries</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>66 173</td>
<td>-47% 40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Graduate lawyers volunteer with partners in (3) years in (3) countries</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>13 29</td>
<td>-57% -3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Community lawyers targeted by awareness raising on women’s legal rights</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>101 673</td>
<td>-66% 124%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Men’s advocacy groups are meeting quarterly</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0 3</td>
<td>-100% 0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Lawyers attend awareness raising sessions in (3) years in (3) countries.</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>57 242</td>
<td>-81% -19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>(10) Roundtables held in each country in 2 years (2-3) in (3) countries.</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>3 24</td>
<td>-90% -20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 17 – Overview of project indicators for the three areas of implementation

The project is remarkably exceeding expected targets related to awareness raising of women, involvement of community leaders and provision of legal counseling. Indicators referring to the involvement of law students and the formation of a men’s forum are on track. Indicators related to legal representation and the organization of roundtables for officials are expected to increase by the end of the project as activities are still ongoing. The involvement of lawyers is still below the target.

Comparing the progress and results achieved through the project given the financial resources available in the budget, it is possible to say that the project intervention has been highly economically efficient.

All local partners highlighted that financial constraints partly affected the efficiency, and to some extent the effectiveness, of the project. The salaries planned in the budget for key staff such as project officers, lawyers and media support officers are far below the real market standards. The implementing partners either proposed budget revisions or integrated the
salaries with extra resources in order to safeguard staff continuity. The same challenge was underscored by all paralegals across the countries. The incentives devoted to their deployment barely covered the expenses for logistical arrangements of the awareness raising events. Investing in human resources is key to developing quality implementation standards, ensuring sustainability over the project and, ultimately, pursuing valuable changes regarding women’s access to justice.

Based on evaluation of the final project phase, it will be important to review the financial planning through a rational and strategic approach. Quantitative and qualitative achievements (number of events and beneficiaries versus behavioural/policy changes) go hand in hand provided that a combination of factors are considered. From an efficiency perspective it is relevant that human resources are available, tasks are defined and working procedures are well in place. The evaluation analysis suggests that these factors were given serious consideration by all organizations; notwithstanding, there is space for improvement at the mentioned levels. Further action might be taken to strengthen the actual staffing structure, with additional resources in order to ensure better performance. For instance, it is advisable that monitoring and evaluation staff or liaison officers be integrated to future projects to regularly follow up on the field work. Their deployment would enable project officers, with the supervision of directors, to focus on the overall coordination of the project and the ‘qualitative’ change making aspects of the intervention. Stronger planning systems should be developed (or strengthened) in order to better define project milestones and all arrangements related to their achievement. On a different level, clarity should be extended to delineating the partnership between Oxfam and the implementing organizations (see paragraph on partnership in the Effectiveness section).

8.2.1. Country Efficiency analysis – JORDAN

Overview of progress indicators
The progress indicators of the project activities implemented in Jordan confirm to some extent the trend recorded at the time of mid-term review. Particularly, quantitative data concerning women’s attendance at awareness raising sessions is considerably surpassing the targets. Even more significant is the number of legal consultations provided throughout the project timeframe (+432% compared to the targets), which represents the highest reported figure for this output across all countries. Conversely, the indicators related to legal representations and follow up cases reached only half of the expected target. Two considerations are useful in this regard: 1) the comparative analysis between the mid-term and the final evaluation suggests an important increase in number of legal representations and follow-up cases. This increase seems to confirm that a physiological time was needed for ARDD-Legal Aid to win the trust of communities in an area where they had never worked before; and 2) the fact that indicators remain below the targets reflects the persisting influence of external factors, as previously reported in the mid-term review, although the project assisted in mitigating them to some degree.
At the social level, the involvement of community leaders is in line with expectations, and at the institutional level, as the indicators show, the engagement of lawyers and officials continues to be a challenge.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OUTCOMES</th>
<th>OUTPUTS</th>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>PERFORMANCE</th>
<th>VARIANCE</th>
<th>MTR</th>
<th>FE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Woman attending awareness raising sessions in (3) years</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>1100</td>
<td>3022</td>
<td>-27%</td>
<td>101%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free legal consultations in (3) years</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>1585</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free legal representation in (3) years</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>-92%</td>
<td>-50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free follow-up cases in (3) years</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>-95%</td>
<td>-54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Graduate lawyers volunteer with partners in (3) years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Community leaders targeted by awareness raising on women’s legal rights in (3) years</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>-47%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Lawyers attend awareness raising sessions in (3) years</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>-81%</td>
<td>-60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>(15) roundtables held in each country in 2 years (Years 2-3)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-100%</td>
<td>-100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 18 – Overview of project indicators - Jordan

The analysis of the financial expenditures reveals a trend that, in many cases, is in line with the other countries. The main budget constraint was reported to be the very limited allocation for the salaries of project staff (management staff and lawyers). Staff salaries had to be supplemented by extra contributions from ARDD-LA in order to ensure suitable professional skills and avoid continuous turn-over. Another constraint was the limited funds available for awareness raising costs. Particularly, project staff noted that expenses related to venue rental and transportation should be taken into account in the future. To compensate, ARDD-LA conducted training sessions using internal capacity and personnel. This initiative proved to be highly cost-effective.

Finally, the financial resources allocated for advocacy efforts were not sufficient to implement a powerful action plan, as the high price of TV and radio ads proved cost prohibitive, limiting the impact of the campaign at this level. As outlined above, budget lines related to awareness raising (women, community leaders) as well as advocacy were overspent, whereas budget lines related to legal fees were underspent on account of lower than anticipated court representation.

Evaluation analysis recorded well-structured working modalities. However, moving forward it is advisable to strengthen internal communication mechanisms, particularly between the main office in Amman and the field staff, and ensure that all staff members, including volunteers, are involved in periodical exchanges about progress and challenges related to the project through an inclusive approach.

8.2.2. Country Efficiency Analysis – Iraq

Overview of progress indicators

The overview of progress indicators shows that the quantitative data are generally in line with the target. In the case of women attending awareness raising events and benefiting from legal counseling, data significantly exceed the expectations. While the indicator related to legal representation is below the target, the number of follow up cases is largely above the target. In fact, the local partner in Iraq registers the highest number of follow up cases across all countries.

Despite major delays caused by the turn-over of key staff members (project officer and financial officer) and a financial review that temporarily put the project implementation on hold, ASUDA has been able to catch up on activities by intensifying its pace of work in the second half of the project timeframe.
The most critical sections in terms of budgeting, indicated by ASUDA staff, refer to salaries of project staff and advocacy action. Like the case of ARDD-Legal Aid in Jordan, ASUDA partly contributed to the salary of the staff (project officer) with extra resources, after undertaking a budget revision. At the management level, ASUDA faced difficulties concerning internal communication throughout the project implementation. Moving forward, it is important to strengthen coordination and communication between staff members (e.g. between the staff in Chamchamal and the staff in Sulaymanial and ensure that flow of information is shared and properly recorded. During the evaluation many staff voiced the importance of having a field office in Chamchamal, which would strengthen ASUDA’s presence in the area, facilitate the organization of project activities (including awareness raising events and legal counseling) and give consistency to outreach efforts.

8.2.3. Country Efficiency Analysis – LEBANON

Like the other countries, JWF experienced some constraints in the management of the project; however these did not affect the efficiency of the project in the long term. As the table shows, the majority of progress indicators demonstrate that targets were largely achieved. Remarkable performance is recorded in the achievement of number of free legal consultations and the number of community leaders targeted by awareness raising events.

Through the course of the project, JWF was able to build cooperative relations with three lawyers who were willing to provide pro bono representation for cases referred by JWF. Two of the lawyers work in the Muslim courts and were helpful in assisting on cases of Catholic women married or seeking divorce from Muslim men, although pro bono case representation is limited to no more than two cases per annum per lawyer. The third lawyer who partnered with JWF is currently handling one case this year. Although pro bono lawyers were willing to support the project, they were in some cases unable to cover the court fees and other costs associated with legal representation in Lebanon. This financial barrier to meaningful partnerships with pro bono lawyers would be worth considering in future projects, as it was shown to limit the possibility of increased services for women.

Additional strides were made regarding the recommendations extended in the mid-term review related to improving the dissemination of information on WAJ legal services among poor women (i.e. posters, brochures), and providing visibility to WAJ-related success stories to encourage more women to take action.
Analysis of financial expenditures reveals that resources were re-allocated to meet the specific needs of the project in Lebanon. For example, to cover legal fees for cases requiring legal representation and for media and advocacy campaigns (billboard and graffiti); also, additional resources were allocated for the design and production of the Personal Status Law guide (booklet).

These budget revisions were done upon approval of the donor. In the case of the men’s forum, the absence of a budget to support activities of the forum meant that meetingsfunctioned more as a support group, rather than a forum with the capacity to plan activities or initiatives. Additionally, the scale set for staff salaries impacted the recruitment and retention of partners. For example, the project coordinator left the project for a better paying position, and in the case of lawyers, it was difficult to find experienced lawyers, particularly those with Canonic experience, that were willing to work for the low salaries outlined in the budget. As a result, legal interns were recruited to assist with the project, however they were not able to provide a full range of legal services, as they are interns and not yet able to plead cases in the court of appeal.

### Table 20 – Overview of project indicators - Lebanon

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OUTCOMES</th>
<th>OUTPUTS</th>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>PERFORMANCE AGAINST OUTPUT INDICATORS</th>
<th>VARIANCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Women attending awareness raising sessions in 3 (3) years</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>696 1774</td>
<td>-54% 18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free legal consultations in (3) years</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>187 654</td>
<td>-38% 118%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free legal representation in (3) years</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>36 94</td>
<td>-60% 4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Free follow-up cases in (3) years</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>16 34</td>
<td>-61% -17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Graduate lawyers volunteer with partners in (3) years</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0 8</td>
<td>-100% -27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Community leaders targeted by awareness raising on women’s legal rights in (3) years</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>33 461</td>
<td>-67% 361%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Lawyers attend awareness raising sessions in (3) years</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10 102</td>
<td>-90% 2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>LOI roundtables held in each country in 2 years (Years 2-3)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0 14</td>
<td>-100% 40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The evaluation research assessed the degree to which the project has been effective at engaging beneficiaries and target groups and together with them moving towards the achievement of the project outcomes.

### 8.3 Effectiveness

**WORKING WITH BENEFICIARIES AND TARGET GROUPS**

How effectively and appropriately have those the project seeks to benefit been involved at relevant stages through the process? How effectively and appropriately have we worked with others and involved them in relevant stages through the process? To what degree have we learnt from this experience and shared the learning with others and ourselves? What will we now do differently, or what will we do more of?

The evaluation research assessed the degree to which the project has been effective at engaging beneficiaries and target groups and together with them moving towards the achievement of the project outcomes.

**WOMEN**

The awareness raising events, as well as the legal counseling sessions, proved to be effective channels to support women and thus facilitate their access to justice. Particularly, it contributed to increasing women’s knowledge of their rights and legal procedures. The awareness raising events were designed to build upon a participatory approach that encourages women to actively engage in the activities. Nevertheless, it may be useful to explore additional mechanisms to further enhance women’s participation. The basic information scheme currently in use for awareness raising activities could be supplemented by other initiatives that would enable beneficiaries to discuss more in depth about their challenges, share experiences and convey their suggestions. These initiatives might be structured on the basis of various modalities ranging from discussion groups to focus groups to self-help groups. They could be characterized by a generational or inter-generational approach (peer-to-peer groups or mothers-to-daughters groups) and could possibly...
be extended to involve men and boys.

This approach is favorably viewed and supported by the local partners’ staff engaged in the implementation of the project. An important aspect to consider in future projects is the need for dedicated places where women can feel comfortable and safe. When possible, suitable facilities should be identified amongst available resources in each area of implementation. Wherever local partners do not have the possibility to rely on field offices for these spaces, alternative locations should be explored with the collaboration of CBOs or local councils.

This suggestion builds upon specific needs that emerged in the context of the field interviews. All local partners see the importance of integrating legal services with psychosocial support. In the countries where these services are already aligned, (Iraq, Jordan), the level of effectiveness of the services offered is significant. Giving serious thought to this perspective would require the integration of staff with a social worker/psychologist. This approach would also strengthen the utilization of legal services and thereby women’s access to justice, as it was recorded during the evaluation missions that women’s difficulties in coping with the demands of legal proceedings are one of the reasons some do not pursue/continue legal action. The endline and final evaluation findings show that more women access courts and believe that resorting to court allow them to access their rights. Nonetheless, an increase in cases of women dropping litigations is recorded. Data on utilization suggests that if the project has generated a change at the personal level, some external factors (economic/social/administrative) persist to prevent women from enjoying full utilization of legal services.

With regard to the quality of the legal services, interviewed women expressed a positive level of satisfaction about their legal experience in general terms. The endline survey confirms this trend by showing that the number of women who rated their satisfaction as “good” increased from 24% to 37% and “moderate” from 36% to 48% compared to the baseline in all target areas. All in all, the total number of women declaring positive satisfaction about the legal services received is 85%. When it comes to rating the level of satisfaction regarding specific aspects of the legal experience, the pattern is less homogeneous and corroborates the hypothesis that external factors hinder women’s access to justice at the utilization level (see endline sections for details).

**MEN**

The engagement of men was taken into account to a lesser extent at the beginning of the project. The mid-term review helped to draw attention to this area of focus and related adjustments were made to ensure that this aspect of the project would be adequately addressed. As a result, men were in fact more actively engaged in the second half of the project, in large part due to the efforts of project staff, including paralegals and lawyers. The importance of involving men was highlighted by many different actors during the evaluation field meetings. Experiences developed by local partners in this regard constitute a wealth of knowledge worth sharing. In particular, the approach used in Jordan appears to be both innovative and successful. Raising awareness on women’s issues from a male perspective is a strategic way to involve men, enhance their interest and make them feel like they are part of the solutions. The success of this approach should definitely be taken into consideration in the future.

**Community leaders**

In general, the methodology initially used to target community leaders based on their occupations and backgrounds (differentiation of awareness raising modules) was very well designed and implemented. Based on evaluation analysis of different approaches used throughout the implementation of the project in the three countries, it is possible to highlight: (i) Diversification in the selection of community leaders is instrumental to ensuring positive results. The ideal combination should envisage young generations, influential figures, and gatekeepers in the local communities; (ii) Collaboration with religious leaders was particularly successful in all locations, despite the context peculiarities. Their role...
remains powerful inside communities and evaluation work found evidence that they are seen as primary points of reference by many individuals, both women and men, in difficult situations; and (iii) Higher consideration should be devoted to the involvement of educational leaders and schools for awareness raising purposes. While there is little doubt regarding the influential positioning of community leaders within the local communities, relations with them must be carefully monitored by local partners, as it was mentioned that in some cases community leaders saw their work on the project as an opportunity to advance their own agendas.

Through the endline survey and the evaluation fieldwork the extent to which community leaders have been of support to women in accessing justice was explored. When asked to grade their level of support for a woman who would resort to court because she was unable to solve her problem through informal means, the interviewed community leaders from all areas provided the following feedback:

With regard to the involvement of community leaders at the advocacy level, in each country a men’s forum was formed and convenes periodically. The forum is comprised of 36 men from target communities who have been trained to advocate on issues related to women’s access to justice. At the time of evaluation the men’s forum were mainly functioning in support of awareness raising actions and advocacy events. Many of the members expressed genuine commitment to the goals of the project and could potentially be valuable agents of change at the social level.

**LAWYERS**

The extent to which lawyers have been successfully engaged in the project remains a controversial matter. While evidence of success is clearly available (e.g. number of collaborations related to legal service provision or participation in trainings), in all countries of implementation local partners reported challenges related to their steady and tangible response on a larger scale. The main obstacles reported were cultural and financial in nature and related to: (i) Sense of competition amongst lawyers and perception of free services provided through the project as competition to their regular services; (ii) An inability to bear financial costs deriving from pro bono services; and (iii) The concept of volunteerism was viewed as either not socially acceptable or was not well rooted into personal beliefs. All these factors led to difficulties in attracting lawyers to the project or eliciting from them a commitment to provide pro bono services.

The following table shows an overview of the amount of pro bono legal aid provided by lawyers to vulnerable women in the 12 months preceding the survey:
These challenges suggest that securing the support of influential figures within the legal community is essential in order to encourage the involvement of other lawyers and increase their buy-in to project goals. It may be useful to look for creative ways to secure lawyers’ support including for example creation of an award for champions of pro bono work, honor certificates, etc. It is also worth exploring others’ experience at the country, regional or international levels in an attempt to learn from their successes and enlarge the vision of possible approaches.

COURT OFFICIALS

Like the case of community leaders and lawyers, the involvement of court officials was not homogeneous in all locations. Identifying entry points and establishing good relations with them remains pivotal to securing positive results. Bureaucracy was reported as a major constraint in dealing with court officials and employees, as formal authorizations are necessary for the organization of events that envisage their participation.

The percentage of court officials who participated in awareness raising activities on discrimination against women remarkably increased in all areas (from 20% to 55%). Interviewed court officials also stated an increase in awareness on CEDAW (from 50% to 70.3%). The number of interviewed women across all countries who expressed satisfaction for the way they were treated by court officials generally increased compared to the baseline survey with women reporting “good” treatment increasing from 26.9% to 40.7%, and “moderate” from 34.6% to 46.9%.)

STAKEHOLDERS

Over the course of the three-year project all local partners have been able to involve a variety of stakeholders representing different sectors of society, including state actors, educational institutions, civil society organizations, international and national organizations. Most of these actors have been engaged in the creation of Steering Committees or in advocacy efforts. It should be noted that the majority of advocacy events are scheduled in the last quarter of the project, while the evaluation study is being finalized.

The evaluation analysis must differentiate between the theoretical approach used to define the advocacy strategies and the practical level of engagement and implementation. The pathway to the advocacy campaign was comprised of a number of key milestones that included trainings, stakeholder analysis, definition of strategies, and action plans in each country. During the learning workshop held in April 2013 Oxfam and local partners worked together to identify three possible areas of focus for advocacy purposes:

- Increase provision of free legal support by relevant authorities
- Reduce court fees and lawyers honoraria
- Facilitate and shorten court procedures

The evaluation found that the applicability of the above advocacy objectives may vary according to the nuances of individual contexts. In general terms, the reduction of court fees is the most challenging area to focus advocacy efforts considering that operating budgets of court institutions rely heavily on this source of income. Additionally, securing the provision of free legal services on a larger scale (not just a few cases per year) remains a significant challenge for all countries of operation. Working on amending court procedures in favour of beneficiaries is an interesting initiative that has been successfully tested in Jordan and could be further explored in the other countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZARQA</th>
<th>CHAMCHAMAL</th>
<th>MATEN</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Baseline %</td>
<td>Endline %</td>
<td>Baseline %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 to 10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 to 20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater than 20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total respondents</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 21 – Amount of pro bono services provided by lawyers to women in the 12 months preceding the survey – endline survey lawyers
The engagement of stakeholders in the project did not always appear to be strategic and effective. In fact, all local partners experienced a lack of commitment from stakeholders in actively contributing to the advocacy plans, which can be linked to a combination of internal and external factors. The advocacy agenda was not always developed in a way that raised the interest and the buy-in of identified stakeholders. It is also recorded that some stakeholders shifted their focus toward other priorities (e.g. the Syria crisis) during the course of the project.

The time availed to the local partners in this project phase was mostly dedicated to building a foundation for advocacy actions, which will need additional time and work to achieve a more advanced stage. All local partners are encouraged to review their strategies and action plans based on lessons learnt from experiences during this phase, define customized approaches and focus on one or more objectives that are workable and realistic within their local contexts.

Oxfam can play a crucial role in giving consistency to the advocacy efforts and amplifying WAJ’s messages. To this end, Oxfam can provide support in the following ways: 1) Back up local partners in building advocacy actions in a focused way; 2) Help to bring national experiences into a regional dimension and to develop a joint initiative at the regional level; and 3) Develop regional communication tools that will sustain and supplement advocacy actions and give them visibility on a broader scale.

**PARTNERSHIP**

The extent to which the project has contributed to improve the partnership between Oxfam and its partners has been also assessed by the final evaluation. This aspect is indeed linked to assessing the achievement of the project outcome five, output six and seven. The evaluation analysis focused on three key aspects: Capacity building, Management, and Performance.

**Capacity building** - Local partners benefitted from capacity development actions both through formal trainings and on the job guidance. All partners unanimously emphasized the mentoring role played by Oxfam and its added value to the development of their internal capacity.

**Management** - This is a dynamic area which reflects diverse expectations and modus operandi. The project has been an opportunity to create synergies out of different levels of competence, expertise, and skills possessed by the organizations involved. Many important steps have been made during the project towards the definition of working procedures that rely on common criteria and standards. Nevertheless, all organizations involved (including Oxfam and local partners) report challenges at the planning, management and coordination level. A clear need to enhance the level of ownership among WAJ partners emerges from the evaluation work. This is a two-sided process that requires increased flexibility for local partners to conduct project management in their own contexts and major responsibility of local partners to respond of their in-house project management in compliance with shared working procedures. The development of ad hoc tools to (i) reinforce planning systems, and (ii) better define the relation between Oxfam and implementing partners, could be of help to ensure more fluid project management. In the first case, the adoption of a shared plan that defines in detail the project milestones would enable Oxfam to reduce time and resources spent on micro-management and invest more efforts on other areas of engagement (such as advocacy). In the second case a partnership framework would clearly define mutual roles, responsibilities and tasks and would be a source of reference for all key operational staff.

**Performance** – All organizations demonstrated a strong level of commitment to the project. The model of change proposed by the project is highly demanding, as it envisaged a broad spectrum of activities in connection with its multi-layered approach. The level of ownership in the project is a decisive factor that enables quality performance, as is adequate financial planning.
LEARNING

Similarly to the section on partnership, the evaluation has assessed the learning mechanisms developed through the project in line with the project outcome five (outputs 6 and 7). During the project timeframe a structured monitoring, evaluation and learning system was developed by Oxfam in collaboration with its implementing partners. All implementing partners refer to MEAL frameworks designed in the context of a training held in 2012. The MEAL methodology is indeed comprehensive and detailed, and a variety of monitoring tools were in place to assess progress made through the implementation of activities. These tools included: pre- and post-tests distributed during awareness raising events and trainings, session evaluations collected during awareness raising activities for women and other target groups, attendance sheets, photos, a legal database, gathering of personal testimonies, and media coverage.

The MEAL frameworks are still in their roll-out phase, as they were not produced until half way through the project. Based on evaluation findings, improvements in the following areas could be pursued:

1. Consider increasing efforts to assess immediate impact of the project activities on beneficiaries/target groups;
2. Ensure that findings of monitoring and evaluation efforts inform all key project staff; major internal information sharing/exchange between staff members is advisable;
3. Ensure adherence between planning and M&E systems, including budgeting.

At the time of evaluation two learning workshops were held by Oxfam, with the most recent one taking place in April 2013 in Iraq. The workshop in Iraq was an opportunity to review progress and challenges related to the project, and conduct field meetings with a sample of beneficiaries and representatives of target groups. Additionally, a session to prepare project staff for advocacy actions was included. This type of learning approach – which was well received by participants – has multiplier effects in that it:

1) Contributes to further building of staff capacities both at the theoretical and practical level;
2) Encourages common understanding and vision amongst participants on the basis of shared standards; and
3) Facilitates information sharing, problem solving processes and identification of best practices.

Based on the success of this approach in the WAJ project, it is strongly recommended that learning opportunities for project staff and partners continue and that the development of learning agendas relies on inclusiveness and the active participation of all concerned staff members. Considering that the model of change proposed by Oxfam for the WAJ project is a relatively new approach piloted in the Middle East, experience-sharing is seen as both a crucial resource and opportunity that should continue moving forward. During the evaluation, all WAJ partners expressed the value of these activities. Notably, many efforts have been made by Oxfam in this regards but it is important that increased regard will be devoted to this area of engagement. Experience-sharing can take place at two levels:

1. Sharing among project partners through thematic/peer-to-peer discussions (e.g. strategies and approaches to involve individuals – men/lawyers/community leaders etc.). Remarkably, each country had successful experiences to share (e.g. ASUDA/community leaders; ARDD-LA/court procedures; JWF/Bar Association).
2. Sharing with others through seminars that would enable participants to compare their experience to other initiatives and learn from common challenges or success. Oxfam is highly resourceful in this sense (e.g. change making campaigns; advocacy campaigns) and could effectively respond to this need. ‘External’ organizations with strong expertise (regional or international) on issues related to women’s access to justice could be also involved.

A combination of the two approaches is also possible as long as the focus of the event is very well defined.

Finally, the learning process should definitely lead to the identification and documentation of best practices, which will give consistency to the many project elements, including ownership, capacity development, sustainability, communication and advocacy.
8.3.1 Country Level Efficiency Analysis – JORDAN

OUTPUT 1

Awareness raising
In three years at least 75% of women and men targeted by awareness raising sessions showed an increase in awareness based on pre and post evaluation forms, as well as estimates by paralegals. Five women took part in the focus group during the field mission and were either referred by other parties to ARDD-Legal Aid or approached through awareness raising sessions. The impression from the focus groups and feedback is that in this context the awareness of women about violations (what they are, type and severity of violation) is in an advanced stage when compared with the baseline. They strongly need support to find redress for violations and to develop coping mechanisms, at both the psychosocial and economic levels. They are encouraging other women to participate in the project activities and to also stand for their rights. There are interesting inter-generational dynamics involving mothers and daughters, which could be a good resource for in-depth discussion opportunities.

The guideline material is useful and relevant according to the opinions of beneficiaries recorded during the focus groups. Nevertheless, the project staff highlighted the need to develop information material that could better reflect the complexity of cases from both the legal and psychosocial point of view. Based on this experience the organization is enriching the guideline resources with additional material and case studies.

The same topics included in the guidelines manual were presented from the men’s perspective. Men were interested in learning about their own rights in conjunction with obligations towards women, as opposed to learning about women’s rights. This approach was very helpful to ensure men’s participation and win their cooperation. It was noted that men were more willing to cooperate in men’s groups than in mixed groups (mainly couples). The topics they were most interested in include:
- Minimum age for marriage and process of registration of marriage, especially when target audience was mainly comprised of students.
- Rights during marriage when attendants are mostly married women, mothers.

Paralegals
Out of 12 trained paralegals originally deployed for the project, only six remained due to personal constraints or financial reasons. Financial incentives offered by the project were not enough to cover expenses related to the organization of the awareness raising events. Other reasons mentioned by paralegals include the lack of follow up and, to a certain extent, lack of involvement in the project. For instance, they would appreciate having clearer parameters for the referral of women’s cases to legal services, as in some cases the procedure is lengthy and they were not always sure if the case was eligible for representation. Additionally, they reported a desire to be more actively engaged in other project activities, in order to have more opportunities to share their experiences and challenges with other staff; they also mentioned that it would be helpful to have more contact with the office in Amman.

OUTPUT 2

Legal services
About 70% of beneficiaries had successful outcomes according to ARDD-Legal Aid lawyers. The project helped to address fears of beneficiaries about legal procedures, which was one of the most discouraging factors...
for women, along with the financial burden of legal expenses. ARDD-Legal Aid legal staff worked on different levels to ensure effectiveness of legal services. One of these levels was to make court proceedings, and thus verdicts, faster for some legal cases. In the context of roundtable discussion with lawyers, legal challenges were discussed and it was decided to address the aspects related to long-term court proceedings as one of the main priorities. The following stage envisaged the involvement of judges and other court officials in order to identify feasible ways to address this matter and agree on ways to move forward. Specifically, the lawyers submitted formal requests to the judiciary officials proposing amendments on the court proceeding. In the context of the project timeframe three requests were approved leading to significant improvements of legal court procedures, which resulted in ensuring improved services for beneficiaries. Women in particular benefit from faster verdicts and lower financial costs.

Another way to ensure faster legal verdicts was though making sure that the counterparts in litigations (mostly husbands) would attend the court hearings. The legal team repeatedly contacted counterparts prospecting that it was also in their interest to speed up the pace of the legal procedures. Reportedly, this approach was well taken by counterparts and contributed to ensure successful outcomes. The positive results of the legal cases had a knock-on effect on the provision of legal aid for women. The number of beneficiaries seeking legal help in fact increased over the project, as the project legal team asserts. The project lawyers clarified their approach in the context of the evaluation interview and specified that their first action after hearing women’s cases was to verify space for reconciliation or mediation. Whenever this attempt failed or it was not possible to reach a shared solution, the case was taken forward to court.

ARDD-Legal Aid has recorded a strong need to complement legal services with psychosocial support, as the integration of these approaches is more effective in enabling women to cope with the challenges envisaged in undertaking the legal process.

This is seen as a barrier to women’s access to justice, because often women drop their cases or renounce accessing courts based on their inability to cope with such experiences on their own. This aspect, coupled with other types of obstacles (mainly of financial and administrative nature), explains the gap between the availability of legal services and women’s utilization of them. Despite the fact that ARDD-Legal Aid is not in a position to provide psychosocial support in a structured and systematic way, some important steps have been taken in that direction. For example, a handbook was developed to guide frontline staff to offer self-assertion sessions in their own communities. Future partnerships between legal and psychosocial service providers could have a positive impact both on increasing women’s utilization of legal services and making the legal process less overwhelming for them. Additionally, referral to existing economic programme in the area is also a resource that could be further explored in the next future.

Law students
Law students involved in the project volunteered their time to hold 17 legal awareness raising sessions in the community. Some law students held sessions for free in other governorates (five sessions). One law students is actively collaborating with project partners to explore funding possibilities to continue carrying out legal sessions in Zarqa and other governorates. Investing in efforts to involve law students and newly graduated lawyers proved to be promising, and the relationship was seen to be mutually beneficial. The young lawyers had the opportunity to improve their knowledge about international conventions, as well domestic legislation on women’s rights.
Moreover, they could analyse legal cases and practice litigation with the guidance of the project lawyer, who also accompanied some of them to Amman’s courts for a practical learning tour. At the end of the learning path a small graduation ceremony was organized to provide them with attendance certificates and a copy of the official PSL (2010). This initiative was very much appreciated by the young lawyers. The small group of law students/young lawyers consulted during the evaluation mission confirmed the importance of recognizing their learning achievements and efforts made at the field level through volunteer work. Notably, about 20 law students/newly graduated lawyers initiated a collaboration with ARDD-Legal Aid in the context of different activities (mobilizing university students, contacting community leaders, awareness raising events, marathon, etc). More efforts should be made to continue the change making process amongst young generations of lawyers. It should also be noted that the law school at the university may be a viable partner for future projects, as they were very supportive and cooperative in the context of WAJ, making facilities available for initiatives.

**OUTPUT 3**

| Community leaders have increased awareness of women’s legal rights and men’s advocacy groups are established |
| Outcome 2: Community leaders advocate for women’s access to justice in public |
| Outcome 1: Lawyers syndicates and bar associations increase provision of free legal services for vulnerable women |

**Community leaders**

It is reported that not all types of community leaders have had similar reactions to the goals of WAJ and the level of response among them varied. The response of religious leaders was one of the most concrete, as 12 of them delivered 24 awareness raising sessions in mosques, where mostly men were targeted. Notably, in seven cases religious leaders included awareness raising elements in the Friday sermons. Other types of community leaders responded to a lesser extent. In the case of teachers, a stronger engagement might be envisaged if schools could be involved in the awareness raising events. In order to target schools however, a formal authorization from the Directorate of Education is necessary.

**OUTPUT 4**

**Lawyers**

At the beginning of the project the involvement of lawyers was challenging, based on feedback from the project staff. ARDD-Legal Aid lawyers were perceived as competitors and for this reason lawyers approached by the staff were reluctant to collaborate. It took time and effort to engage them and to build cooperative relations. The project staff, in collaboration with a group of law students, defined a strategy in the first year, which was revised the following year, on how to attract lawyers and enlist their support for women through pro bono legal services. The key points of this strategy included: (i) emphasizing their role as professionals in a view of facilitating women’s access to justice; (ii) capitalizing on their opinions and input to the project; (iii) identifying prominent figures who could influence the target group; and (iv) identifying common goals to improve the current justice system. As part of this strategy ARDD-Legal Aid implemented some activities to bring together lawyers through different sources. One of these events was held in a well known law centre, where the director was asked to facilitate the meeting. This was a fruitful way to target lawyers through influential figures.

Paralegals also indicated this direction for future consideration.

**Men’s forum**

The men’s forum has not had the intended role in the project as the choice of involving primarily young community leaders has not lead to the desired effects. Therefore, there is a recognized need to involve influential figures who can ensure steady and fruitful work both at the awareness raising and advocacy levels. ARDD-Legal Aid has already taken some steps to review its strategic approach.
The number of lawyers offering to collaborate through the provision of pro bono services increased over the three years, reaching a total number of 30. Nevertheless, the number of cases referred to lawyers is limited to a dozen of cases. While it was easier to find availability for support with regard to legal counseling, more challenges arose when it came to covering legal expenses.

From the beginning of the project the bar association in Jordan appeared not to be a viable resource for ARDD-Legal Aid also in consideration of the very conservative and radical attitude of bar association members, per the explanation provided by project lawyers. On the contrary, the relation with court officials was deemed very positive and beneficial.

Court Officials
Relations with court officials are seen by project staff as positive. Their responsive contribution is evidenced through their cooperation in identifying ways to ease courts proceedings in favour of women, as previously described. The highly bureaucratic procedures enabling officials’ participation in events was the primary challenge to their involvement in the project.

Steering committee
Like the men’s forum, challenges were faced by ARDD-Legal Aid in the roll-out of the steering committees (SC). Although a good representation of different stakeholders was initially ensured, the majority of SC members proved not to be committed to their newly acquired roles. Learning from this experience, ARDD-Legal Aid revised the approach used to mobilize stakeholders at the advocacy level. At the time of final evaluation, ARDD-Legal Aid had already established fruitful collaborations with influential stakeholders concerned with women’s issues, including academics from the University of Jordan, international organizations with legal expertise (American Bar Association), and some state actors (Family Protection Unit).

Advocacy campaign
The advocacy campaign mainly materialized during the third year of project implementation. ARDD-Legal Aid managed to secure media support and coverage despite the limited financial resources allocated for this purpose. At the time of the final evaluation, ARDD-Legal Aid was participating in a variety of radio programs giving space to WAJ project activities. A roundtable discussion took place in March 2014, gathering different stakeholders together, including powerful allies previously mentioned. The challenge envisaged at this stage is to ensure that a shared vision and common understanding of advocacy objectives amongst engaged stakeholders is maintained in order to pursue a clear advocacy agenda.
8.3.2 Country Level Efficiency Analysis – IRAQ

OUTPUT 1

Low-income and vulnerable women in programme areas in Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon and Egypt receive free legal consultations, legal aid and representation in courts, and follow-up on cases

Outcome 1: More women in target countries able to access legal services

Awareness raising
Fieldwork found evidence of a high level of effectiveness achieved through the awareness raising action. ASUDA project staff proved to be very experienced in the organization of awareness raising events. During the evaluation mission it was possible to take part in one of the events held in Aghjalar, a remote location on the hills surrounding Chamchamal. The event took place in the village school and was attended by 18 women; 30% of them were teachers from Chamchamal and other villages and the rest were women from the Aghjalar.

From the observation of this event many important points emerged:
1. There was a severe lack of awareness amongst women about their rights, specifically those related to PSL.
2. Women were genuinely interested in learning more. Reactions differed on a case by case basis, with some women sharing personal stories, some remaining silent, and others keeping their distance from activities.
3. The information approach used in these events indeed challenged women’s beliefs. Nevertheless, the impression was that a one-time session should be seen mainly as a starting point. It is advisable to think of other approaches that could facilitate more in-depth discussion.
4. Amongst the issues that raised major interest in group members were: minimum age for marriage, ratification of marriage contract, separation/divorce, child custody, and inheritance. However, the most debated issue was polygamy.

1. A sharp difference in attitude was clearly visible when listening to the point of view of young women, particularly the teachers in this context. They strongly condemn polygamy and violence against women and firmly blame men for their behaviours, using words that reveal much anger and resentment. Again, this might be another avenue for building opportunities for dialogue and discussion (peer-to-peer groups; mother-to-daughter groups, etc.).

2. Giving priority to marginalized locations was wise and noteworthy considering the very limited chances for the local population to access information and services like those offered by the project.

Paralegals
Like the other countries, Iraq experienced considerable attrition rates among paralegals. Out of 12 paralegals initially trained four female paralegals are currently working on raising awareness in the local communities. Drop out was mainly due to personal and financial reasons.

The remaining paralegals are very committed though and this ensured successful outreach to and involvement of beneficiaries. While they express high confidence on issues related to PSL, the paralegals met during the field mission reported that increased capacity on how PLS interacts with religious matters and Shari’a law is needed. Paralegals underscored the importance of promoting knowledge about PLS also in light of the legal reform that was undertaken in 2008, which led to many amendments in favour of women. Such changes are not known by the majority of the population, including officials. Also in consideration of these findings, awareness raising activities should be expanded to include governmental offices and schools.

Throughout the project increased attention was paid to the involvement of men in awareness raising activities. The project staff reported an estimation of a 15% increase in understanding of women’s rights amongst men, based on internal monitoring tools and direct observation. Taking this into account, it is essential to assure that engagement of men is
carried forward in the form of constructive dialogue. The strategy used in Jordan which adopted the same awareness raising topics used with women, approached instead from a male perspective, could be an interesting option to explore in this context.

The legal guidelines and the information material were deemed clear, relevant and accessible by both beneficiaries and project staff.

**OUTPUT 2**

*Legal services*

Fear is still a major factor impeding women from taking action and standing for their rights, and was openly confirmed by the group of women benefitting from legal services consulted during a focus group in Chamchamal. This is particularly true in the context of Chamchamal, where the lives of many are still ruled by tribal and conservative norms. The four women participating in the focus group knew about the project through paralegals, neighbours, and personal relations. To date, they are all experiencing serious problems with their husbands and their legal cases are ongoing.

The ASUDA lawyer is the only female professional providing free legal aid to women in the area. Despite her tireless work there are a considerable number of women who still need support. It is possible that through a series of initiatives, advances could be made toward reducing the occurrence of violations. For example, awareness raising sessions could be held in court houses for young couples in preparation of marriage. These sessions could serve to enhance knowledge of both male and female beneficiaries related to mutual roles in marriage, including personal rights and duties.

It was noted during fieldwork that legal services are not often connected with awareness raising activities. While it is evident that the two actions should ideally complement and sustain one another, some reasons concerning safety and confidentiality have to be taken into account, as underscored by an ASUDA lawyer. It happened that some women hid from the organization after being invited to take part in an awareness raising session. The security dimension of project activities also concerns staff members themselves, as they were targeted with threats for their participation in the project. It is advisable that the security/confidentiality issues are addressed based on a shared code of conduct/guidelines and that internal coordination mechanisms between project staff (paralegals, lawyers and management staff) are strengthened.

**OUTPUT 3**

*Community leaders*

Evaluation field work recorded a fruitful collaboration with community leaders, particularly religious leaders. Approximately 5,000 beneficiaries were targeted through awareness raising initiatives held in collaboration with religious leaders, which is an outstanding indicator of how ASUDA managed to involve this target group. During the evaluation field mission it was possible to meet the head of over 200 imams in Chamchamal area. In his opinion the strength of the project was that it did not contradict religious principles. In practice, there must be a common pathway leading to the enforcement of women’s rights and this project is a very good opportunity to develop best practices in this regard. There is high potential to further expand the impact of the project in terms of awareness raising and involvement of religious leaders. In addition to individual engagement, it is possible to build linkages with religious community structures that are present in each village and partner with them for the organization
of joint events. It is advised by the head imam to take into account the importance of allocating resources for such initiatives. Moreover, the production of information material designed for this target group would be helpful. Interestingly, the head imam reported that a young generation of imams is in the process of studying how principles and behaviours related to Shari’a law can be advanced towards the creation of a more favourable environment for women’s rights.

Men’s forum
The men’s forum in Iraq brought together influential and young community representatives. At the time of evaluation the focus group consisted of four participants, including two members of political parties, the head of the youth union and a teacher. They expressed the need to empower the status of the forum in the future. The forum facilitated the organization of some awareness raising events in the communities. Through proper planning, future activities could focus on involving schools in awareness events. It is important to expand the forum to involve other community representatives, including religious leaders, additional teachers (at least one focal point per school), and to exert more pressure on governmental institutions to advocate for WAJ objectives. However, similar to the experience of men’s forums in other project locations, it was difficult to conduct advocacy actions without a minimum budget allocated for this purpose.

Lawyers
Similar to the experiences in the other two countries, the engagement of lawyers remains a challenging aspect of the project. However, in Iraq ASUDA took some steps in order to strategically attract this target group. One of these steps included appointing the head of the lawyers’ syndicate brunch in Chamchamal as member of the project Steering Committee. While it appears that there might be a potential common ground for ASUDA and the lawyers’ syndicate in terms of advocacy (critical view of application modalities of PSL in court, as well as amendment of some articles in the law), it is less clear the extent to which lawyers demonstrate their commitment through tangible actions, such as provision of pro bono services for poor women (concept of volunteerism).

Court Officials
The involvement of court officials relies on very positive relations established by ASUDA in the context of the project. This assumption was validated by the feedback of two active and influential court employees during fieldwork. One of the court employees was responsible for trainings, which proved to be a valuable initiative for enhancing understanding of women’s rights amongst this target group.

The social structure for referring women to court and encouraging their utilization of legal services supported by the project, was seen by court employees as one of the most tangible outcomes of WAJ. This achievement is accompanied by improvements in the attitude of court employees, who are showing more regard for women. Future work should focus on increasing efforts to target larger numbers of court officials, as results within the sample of court officials included in this project showed promising capacity for change.
Steering Committee
The steering committee (SC) is comprised of a variety of stakeholders in Kurdistan from both Chamchamal and Sulaymania. The promising role of steering committees previously identified in the mid-term review has not yet revealed its full potential. The fact that no budget allocations have been envisaged for SC activities is seen as a major impediment by ASUDA staff to the promotion of the steering committee’s status.

Advocacy Campaign
Like the other countries, the main components of the advocacy campaign have taken place in the last portion of the project. As mentioned in other project locations, advocacy efforts mainly took the form of communication and information activities. ASUDA was able to develop a wide portfolio of contacts with media and a number of collaborations with local TV and radio. In the opinion of the project staff, in the future it would be crucial to target local CBOs (over 20 are present in Chamchamal), in order to strengthen their role as allies in advocacy initiatives. ASUDA emphasizes the importance of building a network linking individuals and organizations in the area, the primary role of which would be to work on priority advocacy issues such as: (i) lobbying on central authorities and institutions to establish free legal services for vulnerable women; (ii) promoting and monitoring the enforcement of the new PSL; and (iii) improving legal and judiciary practices with regard to women’s cases.

Awareness Sessions
Awareness raising sessions were an instrumental part of the project and had a considerable impact on raising levels of awareness regarding legal rights and legal procedures among women in the target community. Through focus groups with six women who participated in the project, participants reported on how the project helped them, citing the following main results:
1. Gained new information about women’s rights in marriage;
2. Less fear of losing rights, specifically alimony and child custody;
3. Increased capacity to guide other women who might be facing challenges in their marriages;
4. Willingness to discuss personal problems in front others, and demystifying the taboo of divorce and marital problems;
5. Increased feeling of empowerment, self-esteem and self-worth;
6. Feeling more support from the community and religious body, especially in cases of violence against them.

It should be noted that working women were usually not able to attend awareness sessions, as most of them were held during business hours. To promote legal awareness among working women, future efforts might consider holding awareness sessions outside of working hours or partnering with organizations/businesses that employ large percentages of women and holding awareness sessions on site.

All respondents unanimously agreed that the PSL guiding booklets were useful, clear, beneficial and effective. The guiding booklets demystified PSL.
obligations and served as a means for women to share information with one another. In several instances, female ‘beneficiaries’ who were not able to attend awareness sessions obtained PSL information directly through the booklet. Women who attended awareness sessions reported sharing knowledge and awareness of women’s rights in marriage with women they were in contact with through their wider social relations, as well as with their daughters and/or female relatives.

Paralegals

Based on feedback from a focus group of two female paralegals, the model of attracting and training female community activists to become paralegals in charge of delivering PSL legal awareness sessions to women was proven effective in ensuring proper outreach, community acceptance and accessibility. Since these female paralegals live and interact with women in their communities, paralegals trained through this project were able to emerge as local community leaders and sources of reference with regard to PSL legal issues. Paralegals contributed to reconciliation efforts among married couples facilitating communication, preventing divorce, and solving domestic issues.

The interviewed paralegals reported feeling empowered both within their ordinary family lives and the community at large. This role in the community allowed them to interact with many people outside their home, increase their capacity and confidence to speak in public, and achieve a higher level of self-esteem related to their increased visibility and status in the community.

The positive results achieved through paralegals’ action, mirrored by the remarkable quantitative results of cases referred to legal consultations, and by women’s voices collected during fieldwork, this model was shown to be a successful and sustainable entry point in the community, specifically in terms awareness raising and referring women to legal services. As such, future efforts should be directed at increasing the capacity of paralegals to effectively deliver legal awareness sessions and providing opportunities for in-depth education on certain legal issues.

It may also be useful to engage male community activists for paralegal training. Additionally, attention should be paid to actions that support sustainability of efforts for active paralegals, especially in a context of limited financial resources.

OUTPUT 2

Legal Services

Women who received legal services (consultation and representation) from JWF expressed satisfaction with regard to quality of services, proper follow-up, and support. Women reported being aware of how their case was being addressed and satisfied with access to legal services. Each of them further highlighted that they were actively referring women they knew who were in distress to JWF for services.

The lawyers were responsible for preparing all necessary steps for legal proceedings. During the project, one of the two JWF lawyers resigned for personal reasons, and a substitute was not appointed until several months later. To support the work of the lawyer(s), two legal interns were recruited to assist in the cases. However, the JWF lawyer was still responsible for representing the cases in the court of appeal, since legal interns are limited in what they can do during their internship stage.

JWF became a source of reference for issues related to PSL amongst marginalized Christian women, with referrals coming from various Christian areas in Mount Lebanon. JWF was very active in reaching out to community and religious organizations, which facilitated their acceptance amongst women in the community. The head of the registrar in the Marionite church reported outreach efforts had taken place in most parishes in the Mount Lebanon area. Sessions were held in community organizations, churches,
parishes, women centres, ministry of Social Affairs Welfare Centres, and on political parties’ premises.

The evaluation fieldwork recorded that the referral network within which JWF is acting is wide and diversified, connecting women with legal services through Social Welfare Centres, women’s prisons, victims of violence shelters, judges in religious courts, and through word of mouth from women who benefited from legal awareness sessions.

As reported in other project areas, women who decide to file a divorce case usually suffer socially, economically and psychologically. The long struggle associated with these cases requires psychological support and social services, as well as economic opportunities. JWF succeeded in developing a comprehensive model, providing legal counselling, while raising legal awareness and representing cases in due process; however, the need to provide referrals to social services is evident based on the self-reported needs of respondents. It is recommended that JWF refer women in need of psychosocial support to social workers at CBOs or NGOs who have a standing relationship with JWF.

Community Leaders

The development of positive relationships with community leaders was a gradual process that required time, especially in the first phase of the project. However, as the indicators show, JWF managed to cultivate outstanding levels of involvement among this target group. Collaboration with religious and municipal leaders, who are key points of reference within their communities, was particularly effective.

Men’s forum

Involving men in advocacy for women’s issues is specifically valuable in a patriarchal society like Lebanon. In the context of this project, efforts of the men’s forum were focussed on providing support, as well as general ideas and input. Additionally, the men’s forum worked on outreach and awareness raising for municipal councils and local governments, since these consist of community leaders, mainly men, who are influential in the local context. The lack of financial allocation in the budget for activities of the men’s forum limited the scope of their activities and led to a focus on meetings and deliberations, which were perhaps less effective. It is recommended that future work focus on further developing a structure and mandate for the men’s forum and empowering the forum to design and implement activities, as well as reaching out to men in the community via awareness raising and advocacy sessions.

‘It is much more stronger to have a man advocate for the rights of women, then a woman to do so; men are more impacted by peer men, the men’s forum is an important initiative in this sense.’ Lebanon, member of political party who is also WAJ men’s forum member.

Lawyers

Cooperating with and referring cases to other pro bono lawyers outside of JWF proved challenging. Pro bono legal services are offered based on the contacts of the JWF director; currently three pro bono lawyers assist in cases [no more than two cases per annum on average]. The economic burden of pro bono cases cannot be underestimated as a challenge.
Cooperation with the Beirut Bar Association (BBA) was not effective until the recent elections, where a new president of the BBA took office and new committees were formed. During the final evaluation the JWF director reported that the BBA agreed to hold round tables with lawyers in a month. Currently, the provision of legal services to female victims of violence is offered by several NGOs, including a women’s committee at the BBA. The head of the legal aid committee at BBA also indicated a growing commitment to issues of protection, social justice, and women’s rights. Canonical judges and lawyers who provided feedback on the project expressed satisfaction with regard to legal awareness raising and legal aid provided to women in PSL.

OUTPUT 5

Court officials
JWF/WAJ was able to attract court officials to the project, specifically the head of the court registrar (whom we met), establishing a rigorous exchange relationship. This strategic partnership provided optimal conditions to meet Outcome 4.

OUTPUT 6

Advocacy campaign
The WAJ project managed to weave a network of support in the Christian community especially among parishes, religious leaders, Catholic CSOs, female political leaders, canonical lawyers and judges, the Beirut Bar Association, and law enforcement officials. Many of them attended a JWF/ WAJ advocacy event that was held in Beirut to promote women’s access to justice.

Though JWF reached out to various political parties only two, Lebanese Forces and Kataeb, were responsive and partnered with JWF on events. Although partnerships with political parties can be beneficial in advancing policy reform, they must be formed in a way that mitigates risk of political polarization of the advocacy campaign, so as not to undermine efforts to increase women’s access to justice.

The main advocacy event held by JWF to influence policy makers brought together members of the judiciary, law enforcement officials, political figures, activists, and substantial media representatives (see targets in the Efficiency table). Male lawyers, religious leaders, and community leaders met confirmed they gained further understanding of women’s issues through JWF advocacy efforts (Outcome 2). Additional JWF advocacy efforts extended to law schools, including the Beirut Arab University law school who recently agreed to start a legal clinic.

JWF made enormous efforts to ensure successful media campaigning and visibility of the WAJ project, resulting in 48 articles covering various activities of the project, 19 TV interviews, 19 radio interviews, as well as a billboard campaign.

Future efforts should focus on further developing an action plan to advance women’s access to justice at the national level. Advocacy efforts should be led by local partners and sensitive to the context and stakeholder/power dynamics in Lebanon.
8.4 Impact

What significant changes have occurred in women’s lives? What changes in policies, practices, ideas, beliefs and attitudes have occurred in specific institutions, groups and individuals?

The model of change proposed by Oxfam reflects the complexity of process dynamics entailing the interrelation between the individual, community, institutional, and policy levels. This approach translates into a very composite work plan and into quite a demanding field workload, as all implementing partners noted. Nevertheless, all key staff that provided their feedback during the final evaluation missions recognized that the four layers, and related activities, are equally instrumental to the change making vision and to achievement of the long term goal. To further advance the impact of WAJ at the individual, community, policy and institutional levels, it may be helpful to adopt a perspective that looks at the change process in a structured and strategic way. It may be useful to look at best practices deriving from others’ experiences which can be of inspiration to better define mechanisms and working modalities.

Change is happening. Work throughout the three-year project laid a solid foundation for future change and feedback from local partners indicates the third year was the most beneficial in terms of results and impact, underscoring the evolution of the project toward end goals.

The findings emerging from both the endline research and the evaluation work are consistent in showing that the project has been significantly impactful at the individual level. This was observed firstly among project staff members. In all three countries the staff deployed on the implementation of the project (project officers, paralegals, lawyers) stated at the very beginning of the interviews that they felt empowered by the project in terms of self-confidence, knowledge and technical expertise about PSL. Within the context of WAJ, the project was particularly successful at engaging paralegals and law students and this is the sphere to which major unexpected outcomes are related. Judging from the tangible results deriving from the paralegals’ performance - including capacity to mobilize and involve individuals, consistently high levels of attendance at awareness raising events, referral to legal support - it is clear that paralegals become agents of change in their own communities. Their functions made a difference in the change making process. Oxfam and the local partners are aware of this potential and are currently exploring ways to build upon this experience. The future direction this evaluation fully supports is to further invest in the human resource potential of paralegals by consolidating and possibly expanding their functions as well as formalizing their role. The evaluation work suggests that greater involvement of paralegals can occur in the following areas:

- Alternative dispute resolution and negotiation in coordination with lawyers.
- Serve as a link between beneficiaries and other institutions/programs concerned with development, particularly in the area of economic opportunities.
- Advocacy actions; Paralegals’ privileged positioning in terms of close interaction with beneficiaries is a valuable resource to gather and voice women’s needs.

Similarly to the case of paralegals, the project revealed promising effects on law students. All countries experienced very fruitful collaboration with this group, who were by far more responsive compared to their senior colleagues. It is worth giving serious consideration to how to better plan their involvement and expand actions of law students by targeting existing university structures such as human rights units/clubs and coordinating with professors.

Literature on change making approaches is available based on project experiences carried out by Oxfam in other locations (e.g. see WE CAN CAMPAIGN).
Change at the individual level was also observed among women who participated in the campaign, with shifts in attitudes and beliefs emerging over the course of the project. Women with varying degrees of legal awareness were included in the campaign. For some, WAJ was the first time they had been introduced to a definition of their rights, and a framework to discern when said rights had been violated. A range of understanding was observed as participants were from diverse backgrounds and contexts, with norms passed from generation to generation. For women who already had an understanding of their rights, but did not have the support or the resources to speak out, and thus challenge their families and social environments when transgressions occurred, WAJ offered them a more defined pathway to justice. Activities were designed to reach women at all levels of change, ranging from awareness raising events, to legal counsel and representation. This diverse range of project support proved a fruitful way to support change among individuals at every level. Despite the meaningful differences among individual women in the project, what is clear is that WAJ was a means to assist women in moving toward progressive stages of self-change.

CHANGES IN THE LIFE OF WOMEN

• More awareness/knowledge/understanding of rights related to PSL, particularly marriage, divorce related issues, child custody, and inheritance.

• Increase in sense of empowerment and self-esteem.

• More strength to challenge family and social pressure.

• Access to a supportive pathway to obtain justice.

• Willingness to share experience, advise other women and encourage them to face challenges in their lives.

• Generational and inter-generational transfer of information and experience (mother-to-daughter, peer-to-peer).

Achieving change at the social and institutional level proved more difficult and controversial, as both the endline and final evaluation results indicate. Measuring the extent to which change occurred among community leaders and officials was also challenging. Even among groups that agreed to partner with WAJ, for example lawyers, community leaders, and officials, observations in the field revealed a discrepancy between knowledge and behavior.

Regarding community leaders, findings show evidence of positive change mostly in terms of their catalytic role at the access level, with increased numbers of women considering potential support from community leaders in case of a family dispute brought to court as positive and with the majority of interviewed community members expecting the same from their peers in the community. On the other side, findings related to the role played by community members in terms of utilization are quite contradictory to positive changes generated at the access level. The fact that the number of women dropping family law-related litigations has not changed and is due to the social deterrents (such as financial constraints, lack of family support and reconciliation,) reported both by baseline and endline studies, indicates that the program has not generated a tangible change in terms of social barriers to utilization. It is worth mentioning that while social pressure was no longer mentioned as a deterrent at evaluation time (in line with perceived increase of support from community members by women), the lack of support from families seems to still play a negative role in this regard. This could suggest that the programme strategy should be more focused on generating change within the family structure, which is the pillar of the three target societies.

It is clear that community leaders play a critical role in influencing individuals and communities, and can be a great source of support and leadership in helping communities move toward progressive support for women’s access to justice. WAJ partners are aware of the importance of having community leaders as allies. In consideration of this, they took relevant steps to establish continuous relationships and paved the way for joint initiatives. The positioning of religious leaders is of great interest.
Religious leaders have a powerful potential to challenge patriarchy and fundamentalism in faith communities from within. Through support and solidarity they can become part of a transformative process to eradicate patriarchy and other structural injustices that feed women’s discrimination. This approach should be extended to both male and female religious representatives, who are still influencing points of references both in Muslim and Catholic contexts. Importantly, the evaluation found evidence of existing progressive religious voices in all target countries. These individuals are very valuable resources in the community, since they are often some of the most willing to dialogue. In order to sustain and strengthen the progress made to reach and engage leaders at the community level, it is essential to continue building solid relationships with enlightened and powerful community figures, who could serve as good entry points or role models. Their contribution is seen as a major step to give consistency to social change and to strengthen advocacy efforts.

CHANGES – COMMUNITY LEADERS

- Increase awareness of women’s rights and PSL at the personal level.
- Support to awareness raising of women and men on women’s rights and PSL (religious leaders included women’s rights topics in sermons, educational leaders supported action in schools).
- Cooperation to target other peers.
- Take into account women’s perspective in family dispute reconciliations (particularly valid for religious leaders).
- Refer women to legal support (the number of cases is still relatively low but it is a sign of change).
- Women’s increased perception of community support during court experience.

The extent to which the WAJ project managed to impact lawyers and court officials is not straightforward. The major obstacles have already been mentioned in the previous sections of the report. Similar to the case of community leaders, the most successful strategies to attract these groups proved to be through either peer-to-peer approaches or through influential entry points. Interestingly, WAJ partners have succeeded in achieving valuable results in different ways. In Iraq, ASUDA could rely on strong entry points in the local court, who showed steady commitment throughout the project.

In Jordan, ARDD-Legal Aid managed to obtain an amendment of court procedures that brought tangible benefits for women (decreased time of proceedings and immediate access to financial dues). In Lebanon, JWF achieved a turning point in their relationship with the Bar Association, which is now proposing joint activities aimed at building knowledge of lawyers on a broad scale.

Across the three countries, there is evidence of changes in attitudes of legal practitioners and court officials who appear to be more inclined to support women in accessing pathways to justice, but these changes are related to the initiatives of a few individuals rather than changes in a more systemic dimension.

Individual change is common between the social and the institutional level but has yet to develop into a structured and more systemic dimension. This becomes clear if we consider that at the beginning of the project, social pressure/economical vulnerability/administrative issues were acting as deterrents mainly at the access level, resulting in limited numbers of women going to court; contrarily, at evaluation time, the deterrent role of these factors somehow shifted to the levels of utilization and quality, having the greatest impact on consistency of pursuing litigations, volume of litigations pertaining to family law, and number of verdicts in favour of women.
Assuming these findings indicate that social and institutional deterrents have been targeted by the project to a certain extent, as evidenced by the changes at the access level, their persistency within the target areas suggests adoption of a more specific and focused approach for the next phase that mitigates the deterrent nature of these factors at other levels.

Pursuing impact at the institutional level requires longer time than what was available for the project. For this reason, it may be strategic to continue working to engage these target groups and also to track changes in attitudes regarding more inclusive forms of justice accordingly.

In addition to the traditional approaches used by WAJ partners to attract lawyers and court officials, it might be useful to think creatively of ways that could raise their interest and attachment. One possible way could be developing initiatives to champion support provided to women through awards (e.g., Champion Justice Award/Pro Bono Champion Award/Certificates of Honor). Best practices show that these are cost-effective initiatives that bring about changes by establishing virtuous mechanisms. They can be seen as a strategic entry point for accelerating buy-in among target groups.

**CHANGES – LAWYERS/COURT OFFICIALS**

- WAJ partners have succeeded in achieving valuable results in different ways.
- In Iraq, ASUDA can rely on good entry points in the local court, who demonstrated steady commitment throughout the project.
- In Jordan, ARDD-Legal Aid managed to obtain an amendment of court procedures that brought tangible benefits for women (decreased time of proceedings and immediate access to financial dues).
- In Lebanon, JWF has achieved a turning point in their relationship with the Bar Association, which is now proposing joint activities aimed at building knowledge of lawyers on a broad scale.
- There is evidence of changes in attitudes of legal practitioners and court officials who appear to be more inclined to support women in accessing pathways to justice, but these changes are related to the initiatives of a few individuals, rather than changes in a more systemic dimension.

The **policy level** is the last layer where changes were pursued. It is not surprising that results in this area of engagement are not in an advanced status, considering the overall timeframe of the project and the fact that the most consistent advocacy work has been implemented in the third and final year (largely in the last quarter). For this reason it is not possible to report on immediate impact at this level, and therefore analysis will focus instead on the process that has been undertaken. The pathway to advocacy and policy reform was very well designed and developed by Oxfam and the national partners. WAJ partners managed to build alliances with a variety of stakeholders, but they are still in the process of strengthening these partnerships at this stage. The main challenge is to build a common vision and to move toward the achievement of shared advocacy objectives. Since CSOs were expected to have a primary role in this process, it will be useful to reinforce partnerships in this perspective.

From a communication point of view, WAJ managed to have relatively good media exposure, considering the resources available for this activity, and was successful in bringing the project to the attention of the public. All local partners are encouraged to review their strategies and action plans based on lessons learnt from experiences in this phase, define a customized approach and focus on one or more objectives that are workable and realistic. Oxfam’s role is crucial to give consistency to the advocacy efforts and to amplify campaign messages. Oxfam’s support can be provided in the following ways: 1) Back up local partners in building advocacy actions in a focused way; 2) Contribute to bringing national experiences into a regional dimension and developing a joint initiative at the regional level; and 3) Develop regional communication tools that will sustain and supplement the advocacy action and will give it visibility on a broader scale.
As mentioned at the beginning of this section, the model of change proposed by Oxfam reflects the complexity of dynamics entailing the interrelation among the individual, community, institutional, and policy levels. The following frame summarizes the different elements that have contributed to create a positive change in terms of women’s access to justice, as per Oxfam’s result chain matrix.

The matrix clearly shows how actions at each level have generated outputs and outcomes resulting into changes at impact level. As confirmed both by the endline and final evaluation, the strongest outputs and outcomes have been generated at the personal level resulting in robust changes in terms of access. Activities carried out at the community and institutional levels have indeed produced outputs and outcomes in terms of utilization and quality, even if to less systemic extent. Changes generated at the policy level are still hard to measure, since the process is in its early stage.

THE POSITIVE CHANGE ELEMENTS FRAME
ACCORDING TO
OXFAM’S RESULT CHAIN MATRIX
Women’s Access to Justice in MENA Region

### Outputs
- 75% of surveyed women across the 3 countries are aware of their legal rights (45% “fair”, 30% “good”, Graph 2, Endline) in family laws, and 63% knows related legal procedures (52% “fair”, 7% “good” Table 10, Endline)
- 2,558 low-income and vulnerable women in programme areas have received free legal consultations (+113%), 212 women received legal aid (-21%). There have been 173 free follow up cases (+40%)
- 673 community leaders have participated to trainings on women’s rights. 73% of surveyed women expect a positive support from community in case a family dispute brought to court. Three men’s forum are established
- 242 lawyers attended awareness raising sessions on women’s legal rights and +152% of surveyed lawyers evaluates its knowledge of PSL as good
- Officials attended 24 roundtables on legal justice for women.
- National and regional levels advocacy strategies with detailed policy goals and advocacy targets are developed by civil society organisations. Advocacy strategies and regional research study are available
- 3 mechanisms for regional learning and networking among partners for improved practices and replication models on women’s access to justice are established. Namely, two regional learning workshops and one regional study tour implemented

### Short-term outcomes
- +66% of surveyed women in target countries have accessed legal services (Graph 1, Endline)
- There is evidence of CL leading awareness raising events in the 3 target areas. However, there is evidence of contradictory elements (level of knowledge/perception of status of women’s rights)
- Lawyers syndicates and bar associations contributed to the provision of free legal services for vulnerable women in the three countries. However, increase is not significant.
- Better attitudes and practices of police and judicial officials towards women’s access to justice in the three countries. However, this did not reflect into increased number of favourable verdicts for women.
- CSOs influence policy reforms on women’s access to justice in the Middle East. The evaluation assessed that process is in its initial stage.

### Long-term outcomes
- Quality of services has improved by 50% (Graph 1, Executive summary) with 65% of women in the community and 65% of women with court dealings reporting a positive satisfaction with the court experience (Tables 15 & 16 Endline)
- Reform family laws deliver greater access to justice for poor and vulnerable women in the Middle East - The process is in its early stage.

### Impact
- Change is happening, at each level: more consistent at the individual level, less systemic at the social and institutional level, and only initiated at the policy level.
- In regards to access, utilization and quality, data show positive changes at all levels, even if more significant progress has occurred in terms of access. Data show the following variance rates are: Access: +113% Utilization: +130% Quality: +50% (Graph 1, Endline)
09
CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES

The project addresses a number of important cross-cutting issues in line with international definitions and policies. The project adopts a human rights based approach (HRBA) which mainstreams human rights in its design and implementation. According to the UN definition, a HRBA is a process, which applies a number of core principles aimed at enjoying human rights by all. In this specific case the project incorporates a general respect for the international human rights framework and a non-discrimination and prioritisation of vulnerable groups policy (including empowerment and participation). It does that by promoting community participation and mobilisation through the empowerment of selected people to play an active role in promote access to justice especially when it comes to hard-to-reach sections of the community (conservative religious leaders for example). The dynamics of these strategies have already been explained in previous paragraphs.

Gender equality and non-discrimination are fundamental human rights promoted in a number of international conventions and in national constitutions. The elimination of gender inequalities and women’s empowerment are therefore regarded as very important cross-cutting issues both of which are embraced by this project. The current approach to mainstreaming gender equality is the result of a long process of reflection by the international community. It is, in fact, now recognised that to increase gender equality both men and women have to be equally involved in activities to create a better understanding of the problems with the aim of eventually working together to set strategies and goals towards of a de facto equality. Notably, this perspective has been taken into the right account throughout the implementation timeframe. It is important that further efforts are made to consolidate this approach.

Good governance is another key cross-cutting issue including important factors such as: the degree of involvement of all stakeholders, accountability, transparency and efficiency. These factors have already been discussed individually in other sections but what it is important to highlight here is that they are crucial cross-cutting issues as well. In general, the organisation implementing the project proved to be respectful of their stakeholders’ views, opinions and accountable to the beneficiaries and communities served. In addition, the implementing agency exercised responsible and transparent resource management.

Social Values were also taken into consideration during the implementation of this project. As previously explained, this type of project can have a deep impact on traditional societies. Therefore, respect for family values were highly stressed with communities and beneficiaries. The strategy adopted by the staff was mainly to openly discuss issues in order to identify appropriate responses, so as to promote community acceptance. Many details have been taken into account such as appropriate places to organise informative sessions, appropriate modalities to respect privacy and confidentiality required by local customs and beliefs.

In conclusion, the project covered a number of cross-cutting issues that constituted an added value to its design and implementation.
**Sustainability**

Overall considerations - Over the course of the project individual change makers have emerged at each level in support of women’s access to justice. Changes in target groups were observed at the individual, community, and institutional levels. Not only did they develop technical expertise related to PSL, but also confidence in sharing this knowledge, engaging in efforts to promote the WAJ project initiatives, and courage to stand for women’s rights. Individuals have worked in both informal and formal activities ranging from awareness raising and community involvement, to legal counsel and representation. In developing a strategy to further promote sustainable change at the policy level, it may be wise to look to these change makers who have emerged as leaders among their peers. Additional training and support that provides them with the resources they need to successfully lead advocacy efforts at the policy level will increase the impact of the WAJ project and further develop change makers’ capacity to advance policy that supports women’s access to justice.

**Benefits** - This project has created a wealth of knowledge amongst individuals which is expected to last over its completion. It primary includes awareness raised amongst women and men, and knowledge built amongst community leaders, lawyers, law students and court officials. The skills acquired by the paralegal are another important resource that will remain at disposal of local communities. In considering future approaches that support the sustainability of WAJ goals, it may be strategic to focus on ways in which future efforts can support and further engage paralegals and law students, two groups that demonstrated commitment to the vision of WAJ. Investing in the paralegals’ role and functions can be seen as an effective way to further sustain the local ownership of the initiative. The commitment of some law schools to incorporate PSL in the legal clinics is also a window for ensuring sustainability. The legal awareness booklet also contributes to sustainability; as the information and guidelines are available, posting it online, and leaving some copies at key place in the communities, help in sustaining the access of women who face challenges in access to the necessary information.

**Approach** - The model of change implemented through this project encompasses a combination of approaches and methodologies that will be a reference resource for WAJ partners. They will be able to draw from this experience lesson learnt that will be of guidance for other intervention. The social acceptance built around this project, the variety of relationships established, the number of partnerships developed are all elements that are expected to last in medium term. The project contributed to build a social network that links different actors and competences. Thanks to this women are more likely to access remedies for their violations. Consolidating the social network will contribute to make the social support to women normative and to ensure that this process will last over the time. Linked to this social dimension, the role of CBOs/CSOs is strategic.
11
LESSON LEARNT AND CONCLUSIONS

The evaluation fully endorses the model of change proposed by WAJ project, assuming that all four layers (individual, social, institutional and policy) equally contribute to the change making vision. While recognizing the validity of the model of change at the strategic level, this project experience revealed challenges and opportunities in relation to the used approaches, which necessitate to continuously adapting to the complex cultural, social and institutional dynamics both at the national and regional levels. The extent to which the proposed model of change translates into practice in a successful way largely depends on how the project manages to respond to the evolving scenarios in a focused way. Another element of success will be to ensure that adequate operational capacity (in terms of financial and human resources) is in place to sustain the identified strategy and approach.

The importance of investing in human resources is a key lesson learnt deriving from this project experience. It directly contributes to improving the quality of the performance and strengthening major aspects such as local credibility, accountability and ownership. The evaluation analysis highlighted how decisive was the role of the project staff, including management staff, paralegals and lawyers, in determining the success of the project. It is essential that the project builds on this achievement and develops toward two directions: 1. Institutionalize the role of key staff such as paralegals and lawyers, defining mutual roles, competence, and interaction at the level of legal awareness raising, mediation and networking. 2. Strengthen staff capacity both at the knowledge building level (suggested areas based on evaluation are: behavioural change process, including different stages of change and way to measures them, mediation/reconciliation, inter-relation between PSL and religious matters) and integration of new staff members (such as social workers, M&E officers or liaison officers).

WAJ partners had the opportunity to explore different approaches to seek the engagement of beneficiaries and key target groups in a view of pursuing progress change at the individual, social, institutional and policy level. Building upon lesson learnt deriving from this experience is pivotal to defining and consolidating good practices in the next future. Increased efforts are required to identify good entry points in the sphere of social and institutional engagement and consolidate positive alliances with key stakeholders that play strategic roles, particularly at the advocacy level.

LOOKING TOWARDS PHASE TWO

The results of the three-year project show that change is happening with varying scope at each level: more consistent at the individual level, less systemic at the social and institutional level, and only initiated at the policy level. While findings related to access, utilization and quality show that the programme has generated strong change at the personal level, progress in terms of social and institutional deterrents preventing an effective utilization of the legal system is less straightforward. Indeed the same elements acting as deterrents at the social and institutional level recorded by the baseline study were still found to play a negative, if slightly different, role by the evaluation. At baseline time, social pressure/economical vulnerability/administrative issues were acting as deterrents mainly at the access level, resulting in limited numbers of women going to court; at evaluation time, the deterrent role of these factors somehow shifted to the utilization and quality level, primarily impacting consistency of pursuing litigations and volume of litigations pertaining to family law. Although findings show the project has been successful at addressing social and institutional deterrents at the access level, their persistency at the utilization and quality level suggests the need to adopt a more specific and focused approach in the next phase to ensure these deterrents are fully addressed at every level.
It is important that the causes for this diversity in range of impact are taken into account for the continuation of the project and that the next phase builds upon the achieved results in the following ways:

- Consolidate the intervention at the individual level in terms of awareness raising, knowledge building and behavioural change in the long term.
- Address social and institutional deterrents affecting utilization and quality of services for women.
- Increase advocacy efforts toward the achievement of workable objectives both at the national and regional levels.

The evaluation strongly recommends the continuation of the project into a second phase for three main reasons:

1. The project is highly relevant to the needs of women in each of the target locations.
2. The three year phase allowed the initiation and the early roll-out of the model of change proposed by Oxfam in the target locations. A second phase is essential to further improve approaches, consolidate results, and give consistency to the previous work.
3. A second phase would assist the project in moving forward to undertake in-depth shared analysis and learning on a regional dimension. This would be an opportunity to draw lesson learnt and further define best practices.

With regard to the partnership, Oxfam is planning to undertake a partnership review in the case that a second phase is confirmed. Although the importance of assessing and validating quality performance on a periodical term is recognized, it is recommended that possible changes to project partnerships in Lebanon, Iraq and Jordan for the next phase project are cautiously considered by OXFAM. The rationale supporting this consideration is that having different partners on board would significantly question the consolidating approach envisaged for the project continuation.

In reference to the involvement of Egypt, analysis of favorable and unfavorable factors related to the establishment of the WAJ project in the country is seen as the first step. If the project was pursued here, the selection of a partner would be carried out through a composite procedure, based on international standards (UN Women). The process would include the following stages: mapping of national organizations, crosschecking information through the direct feedback of key informants, first organizational assessment, advanced organizational assessment, final selection. It is essential that the overall process be undertaken in close coordination with the donor.
12 FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS

DEVELOP A MORE FOCUSED APPROACH THAT BUILDS UPON THE PROGRESS MADE AT EACH LAYER - In order to be consistent with the dynamics of change emerged during this project phase it is highly recommended to develop a focused approach that will pursue more systematic change. In detail, it will be useful to:

• Develop a common vision about change making amongst all partners (e.g. different stages leading to behavioural changes) and agree on shared ways to measure changes.
• Determine elements preventing women from an effective utilization of the legal system at the social and institutional levels.

In doing so, it is anticipated that the project action will seek to:

• Invest in human resources (partner organizations/project staff) in the sphere of knowledge building and operational capacity.
• Develop and utilize resources to identify gaps and track changes. In this regards, it will be relevant to carry out a structured mapping (both in the initial and final phase of the project) that will cover the behavioural change dimension and the incidence of deterrents at the social and institutional levels. The mapping exercise will necessitate a quantitative and qualitative approach and should be anchored in an accurate context analysis.
• Increase the utilization of peer-to-peer methodology at different levels: (i) awareness raising events/discussion groups; (ii) involvement of key target groups such as community leaders, lawyers and officials; (iii) experience sharing opportunities.

EXPLORE POSSIBILITIES TO STRENGTHEN SERVICES CURRENTLY PROVIDED TO WOMEN (including awareness raising sessions and legal counseling/representation) by integrating in-depth discussion opportunities, psycho-social support and/or referral to existing economic empowerment programs in the targeted areas. This is seen as a strategic element that will help advance progress toward behavioural change and will be beneficial to improve utilization of legal services amongst women.

Such approach recalls the idea expressed by the second MTR recommendation Twin track approach: [i] improve, valorize and strengthen alternative conflict resolution avenues for married couples; while [ii] Addressing women’s socioeconomic vulnerabilities by establishing synergies with economic and/or pro-poor initiatives in the area. The final evaluation sees the opportunity to increase efforts at the prevention level by focusing on pre-marriage (e.g. awareness raising of couples in pre-marital stage) through the active engagement of paralegals and lawyers and the close collaboration of community leaders and court officials.

CONTINUE PROMOTING THE ENGAGEMENT OF BOYS AND MEN - The project demonstrated to take into consideration the MTR recommendation Integrate men paralegals to outreach towards men within project targeted communities. Having said that, it is recommended that the project consolidate efforts in this direction, making benefits of available best practices (e.g. engaging men in Jordan).

CONTINUE TO WORK AND IMPROVE THE ADVOCACY ACTIVITIES AT ALL LEVELS - Advocacy remains a powerful tool in enlisting the support of stakeholders for programme implementation and sustainability. WAJ partners already achieved good results in terms of coalition building with powerful allies. Nevertheless, their work can be further improved revising, for example, their strategies both at national and regional level. Their approach should be fine-tuned towards more measurable, achievable and realistic/resourced objectives and Oxfam’s role as a catalyst should be more consistent. Oxfam’s experience and credibility in the region opens
up to the potential for more efficient action at national, regional and international levels. In fact, local partners can and should be better supported/guided in their advocacy actions at national level, specifically in terms of tailored and focused actions towards realistic and time-bound objectives. Moreover, given the similarities in the region pressure to achieve change at the regional level can be exerted on regional institutions and other relevant actors. Finally, advocacy efforts also at the international level as well should be considered. Access to justice has been an on going concern for the CEDAW committee, for example, and in light of the challenges faced by women in the region, there is great need for strategic partnerships with the CEDAW committee and other important international bodies to further enhance women’s access to justice.

DEVELOP/REVIEW TOOLS TO (I) REINFORCE PLANNING SYSTEMS AND (II) BETTER DEFINE THE PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN OXFAM AND IMPLEMENTING PARTNERS in order to ensure more fluid project management. In the first case, strengthening local ownership of the project would enable Oxfam to reduce time and resources spent on micro-management and invest more efforts on other areas of engagement (such as advocacy). This is a two-sided process that requires increased flexibility for local partners to conduct the project management in their own context and major responsibility of local partners to respond of their in house project management in compliance with shared working procedures. In the second case a partnership framework would clearly define mutual roles, responsibilities and tasks and would be of reference for all the key operational staff.

REVIEW APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND ASSETS RELATED TO SURVEYS/ASSESSMENTS - The endline analysis revealed that while information pertaining to the personal levels of access (being women or community members) is the result of a triangulation of 3 different studies, the assessment of both social and institutional level relies on a two-perspective model only. The institutional level for instance involves perspective of lawyers and court officials (not including judges in fact), while other relevant stakeholders could have been involved in order to tailor a more effective strategy. The fact that number of verdicts of family litigations in favor of women has not improved during the project life for instance, supports the recommendation of diversifying and expanding the range of institutional stakeholders.

Similarly, the assessment of the social dimension has relied on two-perspective model only which has not supported a more comprehensive mapping of related deterrent factors. Including women who had previous dealings with court, for instance, could have enriched the analysis of practical obstacles faced during court proceedings acting as deterrent for continuation of litigation.

On a general level, it is recommended that proper planning of time, human and financial resources is taken into consideration for the future, since these factors are extremely relevant to ensure quality performance and outcomes.
Oxfam GB Gender Equality Hub promotes gender equality in the Middle East and North Africa region. Our aim is that women can realise and voice their rights, enjoy a life free from violence with mechanisms for social and legal protection, and become equal contributors in the development of their respective communities, hence breaking the cycle of violence and exclusion. In our work, we link up our direct assistance to poor women with national, regional and global advocacy and campaigning work. Our advocacy work is informed by research. We have more than 16 partners in the region. Our partnership approach is based on acknowledging the added value of national partners, and promotes trust and mutual support.
For further information, please visit Oxfam website at www.oxfam.org.uk

Project implemented in partnership with:

© Oxfam GB 2014
Oxfam is a registered charity in England and Wales (no 202918) and Scotland (SC039042)