

Mid-term Evaluation of the Unwrapped Project in the Lakes States, Sudan

Full Report

Oxfam GB Programme Evaluation

April 2007

Commissioned by: Oxfam GB

Evaluators: MICRODE Consult

Table of Contents

Content	Page #
Acknowledgement	2
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	3
Executive Summary	4
SECTION ONE: Introduction	8
Purpose and Scope of the Evaluation	8
Evaluation Informants	9
Background Information and Context	10
Approach and Methodology	10
Work Schedule	11
Difficulties Encountered	11
SECTION TWO: Overall Project Assessment [Findings]	12
Veterinary Services Component	12
Project Design	12
The Situation Prior to Oxfam's Intervention	13
Performance of the Component	15
Other Proxy Component Outcomes	16
Observations	17
Implementation Challenges	18
Conclusion	19
Recommendations	19
Restocking Component	21
Project Design	21
Analysis of the Project design	21
The Situation Prior to Intervention	21
Performance of the Component	22
Main Component Results	23
Other Proxy Outcomes	24
Observations	24
Conclusion	24
Recommendations	25
Promotion of Honey Production Component	26
Project Design	26
Analysis of the Component Design	26
The Situation Prior to the Intervention	27
Performance of the Component	27
Observations	29
Conclusion	30
Recommendations	30
Promotion of Ox-ploughing Component	31
Project Design	31
Analysis of the Component Design	31
The Situation Prior to Intervention	31
Performance of the Component	32
Main Component Results	32
Observations	34
Conclusion	34
Recommendations	35
SECTION THREE: Overarching Issues	36
APPENDICES	38

Acknowledgements

We wish to express our gratitude to the management of Oxfam GB Southern Sudan Programme for identifying and giving MICRODE Consult an opportunity to carry out the evaluation of the Unwrapped Project. We would like to express our utmost thanks to Ashford Gichohi, Gabriel Makuac, Clemensia Mwiti and Elizabeth Awate for their insightful ideas and opinions that greatly helped to chart the direction for field level information collection. We are equally grateful to all the staff of Oxfam GB in Rumbek for their commitment to the evaluation exercise, which was demonstrated by meticulous and timely support in logistical and hospitality needs.

Next we would like to record special appreciation to key informants from various Government departments, partner organisations, and collaborating agencies for their keen interest in the evaluation exercise and sparing time to give information that added a lot of value to the evaluation outcomes.

Special appreciation goes to Gabriel Kuc for his excellent performance in the tedious job of translating Dinka language to English and English to Dinka during the interactive sessions with the community members.

Finally, thanks to the many community members; project beneficiaries; chiefs, *Benywuits*¹ and CAHWs all who significantly contributed to the success of this evaluation in a number of ways and who may not be singled out individually. Their contribution is acknowledged and highly appreciated.

Japheth Mwongo.



MICRODE Consult
P.O. Box 2313 – 00100 GPO
Nairobi – Kenya
Tel: 254-2-714427
E-Mail: japheth@microdeconsult.com

¹ Cattle camp leaders (a cattle camp leader is responsible for the collective management of a group cattle herds belonging to closely-related families).

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACCRONYMS

AHA	Animal Health Auxiliary
ANV	Association of Napata Volunteers
APARD	Africa Partnership Aid for Rehabilitation and Development
CAHWs	Community Animal Health Workers
CBO	Community Based Organisation
CEAS	Church Ecumenical Action in Sudan
CULIDO	Cueibet Livestock Development Organisation
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organisation
KTB	Kenya Top Bar
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MARF	Ministry of Animal Resources and Fisheries
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisations
NPA	Norwegian Peoples Aid
OLS	Operation Lifeline Sudan
RULIDO	Rumbek Livestock Development Organisation
SINGO	Sudanese Indigenous Non-Government Organisations
SRRC	Sudan Relief and Rehabilitation Commission
UN	United Nations
VSF	<i>Veterinaires Sans Frontieres</i>

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Achievements of the Unwrapped Project

The Unwrapped Project is a livelihoods promotion initiative focusing on four components thus; provision of veterinary Services, restocking of vulnerable women headed households with goats, promotion of ox-plough farming technology through partnership arrangements with indigenous institutions, and promotion of honey production by traditionally beekeeping communities. The project started in May 2005 and was designed to build the community livelihoods financial and human capital. By the time of the evaluation in April 2007 the project had accomplished the following key achievements:

- Managed to implement many of the planned activities and achieved the desired outputs with variances (plus or minus) in the set performance targets. **(For details see the section on findings)**
- The veterinary services component has managed to internalise the concept of services cost recovery with so much success that no herder expects free animal drug or vaccines; they are always ready to pay what it costs to treat their livestock and indeed are affording to pay drugs at cost.
- Lack of drugs and prevalence of animal diseases which ranked as top problems to herders three years ago are no longer considered as problems by the same herders after Oxfam perfected the delivery of veterinary services through community based structures namely RULIDO and CULIDO. (See List of Acronyms)
- There exists a crop of reasonably competent animal health workers committed to providing veterinary services in association with the project yet they are not on anybody's regular employment including the Government or the NGOs; they have been trained to provide services for irregular and unpredictable commissions on service fees that are paid by livestock keepers.
- The project has contained livestock diseases to a manageable level that compares well with the neighbouring countries. Suspected livestock disease outbreaks are usually reported by the network of community-based animal health workers and preliminary investigations conducted within 12-36 hours against a set target of between 24-48 hours.
- The project has also developed beneficial collaboration relationships with the Government, the like-minded NGOs in livestock sector and community level herders' institutions.
- The project has provided 1,800 goats to 180 widowed women who are heads of livelihood vulnerable households to enable them to revive their lives and it is apparent that this intervention has given hope and renewed optimism to the beneficiaries.

- Poor widows who had no chance to own livestock now do through the goat restocking project component; this has upgraded their social status and observably bolstered their self-esteem and the necessary confidence to soldier-on with life.
- The milk from the goats though too little (the particular goat variety normally yields little milk), has however added nutrition value into their household diets particularly to the children.
- The project has directed attention to improving honey production, a highly potential livelihood resource that had not received significant attention in the past from either humanitarian or development agencies. This has ignited palpable community enthusiasm and anticipation of better living standards resulting from improved returns of their indigenous honey resource.
- In partnership with an indigenous organisation, the project has made a commendable contribution towards increased food production using ox-plough tillage technology. Increase in food production through use of ox-ploughs was vividly evident during the evaluation.
- Ox-ploughing has been commercialised by a few people who till land for others at a fee. This development is reducing the need for every household to own a plough or Oxen.

Key Project Results

1. All the four project components were ranked as high priority by community respondents during the evaluation and are viewed by Government officials as addressing livelihood issues that are core to the people of the Lakes State.
2. The community has fully accepted the cost recovery concept in the treatment and vaccination of the livestock, which is seen by the collaborating development agencies as the route to sustainability of the service.
3. The project has contributed heavily in assuring existence of healthy livestock in the Lakes State through its veterinary services component.
4. However, the project gender empowerment initiative through the goats re-stocking component did not achieve the intended results key in introducing equity concerns to the mainly patriarchal community of the Lakes State.

The Main Project Weakness

The project formulation and implementation is heavy on the veterinary component and consequently the achievements of the other project components, which are equally important in achieving the project goal of

improving community livelihood bases, have not matched the veterinary component.

This has not made the other project components irrelevant though, but the next project formulation process need to analyse a lot deeper project quality aspects such as the value of KTB hives vis-à-vis the difficulties that will be faced by the community importing the basic raw material until such a time that it will be possible to produce soft wood locally, the attendant costs, and sustainability; and also the provision of ox-ploughs which can easily be provided by the emerging private sector.

The Project Socio-political Operating Environment

The socio-political environment prevailing in the Lakes State particular to the weak structures of the nascent Government and its being in transition from debilitating civil war to recovery have led to:

- The project choice of interventions that have the potential to fast track recovery and rehabilitation of the community livelihood bases.
- The project working directly with community based institutions to establish systems mechanisms to deliver project benefits to the households.
- Limited engagement with the Government in the project implementation processes.

Key Recommendations

The key recommendations by the evaluation consultant for further consideration if the project will continue are:

- » Oxfam should encourage entry of private practitioners in the delivery of veterinary services even if it calls for establishment of a short-term working capital credit scheme to the local veterinarians who have demonstrated capacity and willingness to enter into private practice.
- » The next phase of the unwrapped project should consider developing a poultry-keeping component particularly targeting women beneficiaries.
- » The unwrapped project should re-evaluate to what extent in terms of value addition are the KTB hives in increasing incomes of Beekeepers vis-à-vis an organised honey marketing system.
- » Oxfam should always have a clear Cooperation Agreement with its programmes implementation partners spelling out roles and responsibilities of each partner and what each party is accountable for, to reinforce responsibility and clarity of limits.
- » Oxfam should consider investing in mentoring county level Government staff in its programme sectors through supportive guardianship for the ongoing initiatives to be sustainable with pre-agreed outputs for each party.

Lessons Learnt

1. It is difficult for the beneficiaries of the goat restocking scheme to pass over the second generation off springs to other deserving members of their community as initially expected. Perhaps this is the consequence of protracted relief syndrome that can be addressed partially through development of human capital.
2. The community based institutions managing veterinary services (RULIDO and CULIDO) are slowly losing their clout with the existing community based animal health workers in favour of the Government and sooner than later may not withstand the Government pressure for the control of the delivery of veterinary services and the associated cost recovery funds.

Conclusion

Through the activities of the Unwrapped Project, Oxfam has proactively participated and has internalised to the communities the OLS initiated cost recovery system on veterinary drugs provided by NGOs. The positive development impact of effectively managing the cost recovery initiative in the veterinary sector within a relief-oriented environment is massive and difficult to quantitatively quantify. In this process, Oxfam has established itself as an excellent facilitator of sustainable development in the Lakes State.

The project formulation and implementation is heavy on the veterinary component and consequently the achievements of the other project components though equally important in the achievement of the project goal which is to contribute to improving household food and income security, have not matched the veterinary component.

In whole, the implementation shortcomings noted by the evaluation are largely inherent in the projects design than implementation lapses. *(See component findings)*

If there will be an immediate unwrapped project phase, it will be necessary to review the present programming priorities; particularly in regard to the effectiveness and efficiencies of goat restocking, provision of ox-ploughs, and the developmental value of KTB hive whose principal raw material until now is to be imported.

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION

The evaluation of the Oxfam unwrapped project was commissioned in March 2007 to assess the level of the project achievements; performance effectiveness, efficiency and promotion of gender equity over the period April 2005 to April 2007. The purpose of the evaluation was to provide the necessary comprehensive picture of the project design characteristics, implementation dynamics and challenges facing the Unwrapped Project and recommend the way forward. Therefore the evaluation exercise examined the project design, the implementation processes, the impact of the project to the targeted communities and the challenges it has to deal with. The evaluation also analysed the understanding and application of developmental approaches and strategies that are being used by the project implementation teams comprising of the Oxfam staff, State and County Government staff, and Oxfam partners.

The findings are meant to guide Oxfam in planning and implementation of the next project phases and other livelihood projects.

It recommends strategies and practices that can lead to achievement of higher programming impact, efficiency, relevance, sustainability and quality in the context of livelihood needs in the target areas of Lakes State.

Therefore this report is an account of the findings of the evaluation mission of the Oxfam Southern Sudan Unwrapped project that is being implemented in the Lakes State.

The evaluation covered all the project elements including the partnership and collaboration with the Government and other civil society organisations.

The project components of the Unwrapped Project include:

Rinderpest Eradication

- Purposive surveillance of rinderpest through Oxfam trained community based veterinary supervisors.
- Coordinating quarantine and ring vaccination whenever need arises.

Vaccination and Treatment of Livestock

- Periodical vaccination of livestock against the common diseases.

- Treatment of sick animals and control of parasites, intestinal worms, and liver flukes.

Training of Animal Health Workers

- Training of Community Animal Health Workers, Animal Health Auxiliaries and Stockpersons to competently carry out livestock vaccinations, treatment, meat inspection at slaughterhouses, and processing of hides and skins to meet industrial use standards.
- Community sensitisation and education on disease detection and prevention.

Promotion of Honey production

- Introduction of modern beehives - the Kenya Top Bar (KTB) hives - to the already practicing beekeepers by supplying a limited number of training and piloting hives.
- Training beekeepers in the operations of KTB hives and supplying honey harvesting gear.

Goats Restocking

- Provision of goats to selected widows as a step towards women empowerment.

Promotion of Ox-plough Farming Technology

- Provision of Ox-ploughs through an indigenous civil society organisation.

1.2 Evaluation Informants

The information and views on which this evaluation report is based comes from various main sources which include:

- (a) Beneficiaries of the Unwrapped Project.
- (b) Government officials at State; County, Payam and Boma levels.
- (c) Opinions and experiences of community leaders, including the Chiefs and *Benywuits*.
- (d) Opinions and experiences of NGOs, UN Agencies and CBOs operating in the area
- (e) Oxfam staff.
- (f) Observations and recommendations by the consultant.

In geographical terms, the evaluation covered Rumbek North, Rumbek Central, Rumbek South, Wulu and Cuiebet counties.

1.3 Background Information and Context of the Oxfam Unwrapped Project

The implementation of the Unwrapped Project began in May 2005 and ends in April 2007. The project set its goal at improvement of livelihoods to the majority pastoralist and the minority agriculturalists people of the Lakes State that were eroded to near zero by the effects of the civil war, consequently rendering the vast majority of the population to depend on external food aid.

The counties of the Lakes State where the unwrapped project is sited are inhabited by a population of approximately 794,490² people as at 2006 and this figure is soaring daily due to the influx of returnees who are coming back home now that the civil war between the southern and northern Sudan has ended. *(According to the State SRRC Director 9,305 returnees from the north registered in March 2007 to return to the Lakes and are expected any time)*

1.4 The Approach and Methodology for this Evaluation Exercise.

The approach adopted by the consultant included:

1.4.1 Consultations

Extensive email consultations were held between the consultant and the project implementation staff in the field to chart-out the direction and the practicalities of the evaluation mission.

1.4.2 Secondary data collection and analysis:

Secondary data was obtained from documents and literature on the Unwrapped Project that were provided by the implementing staff. They included project design documents, activity plans and relevant reports.

1.4.3 Primary data collection and analysis:

Using participatory approach, primary data was collected from dialogue interviews carried out with the projects beneficiaries, Oxfam staff members, Government officials both at State, County, Payam and Boma levels and staff of various NGOs, UN Agencies, and CBOs that work in the project area and collaborate with Oxfam as well as other independent community informants.

The evaluation data collection and analysis was highly participatory in all the cases. The Oxfam staff and in some cases staff of the partner SINGO and community based organisations such as RULIDO and CULIDO were part and parcel of the evaluation team, which made it possible to countercheck and verify information on the spot.

² Extracted from Lakes Summary of National Immunization Data Results

Because of the participatory nature of the method used, a good extent of the analysis work took place in the field in Rumbek through on-the-spot triangulation of information, further analysis sessions were undertaken at the end of each project element where preliminary findings were presented to the Oxfam staff for verification and validation.

1.5 Work schedule

The evaluation commenced on 26th March 2007 with the desk study and preparation of evaluation instruments. This was followed by field data collection which commenced on 2nd April 2007 and ended on 14th April 2007. Data analysis and writing of draft report took place between April 16th and 28th 2007.

1.6 Difficulties Encountered and Limitations of the Evidence Collected

Given the realities of the Southern Sudan, it cannot be said that any daunting difficulties that limited the outcomes of this evaluation mission were encountered by the consultant.

All the activities that were planned and desired were undertaken therefore making the findings and analysis presented here sufficiently representative and depicting the actual situation and conditions of the Oxfam Unwrapped project.

2.0 FINDINGS

2.1 Veterinary Services - Vaccination and Treatment of Livestock

It is estimated by the SRRC that more than 65% of the population in the Lakes State depends solely on livestock as their only livelihood base and 95% as one of their livelihoods bases. Consequently livestock is clearly the main source of livelihoods for the majority in the Lakes State and likewise the importance attached to veterinary services by all the Lakes stakeholders.

2.1.1 Project Design

Veterinary services are a component of the unwrapped project but have been going on in the project target areas much before the coming into being of the unwrapped project.

Overall Objective of the Component: - According to the project design documents, the overall objective of the veterinary services component of the Unwrapped Project is:

To contribute to improving household food and income security of vulnerable communities living in the Lakes State and their ability to influence institutions that will improve access to basic services.

The specific objectives are:

- To contribute in increasing community financial capital through improved livestock production at the primary producers level.
- To contribute in building community human capital through developing skills, knowledge and capabilities.

The means to the objectives is: - Prevention, control, and treatment of the common livestock diseases in the Lakes State in order to increase the benefits of the livestock resources to the community.

The Component Strategies and Approaches include:

- To train multilevel community based animal health workers. The frontline echelon which lives within the community is trained to mainly diagnose and treat the common livestock diseases while the higher echelons are trained in animal health systems management in addition to higher clinical skills. They serve as referral category.
- Establishment of County based community led institutions (RULIDO & CULIDO) to manage the veterinary services component of the project.
- Establishment of cost recovery system with the livestock keepers.
- Coordinating with VSF-Belgium in the eradication of Rinderpest.

→ Providing the community based animal health workers with the enabling basic logistical facilities.

Analysis of the component design: the veterinary services component has salient strengths that have a direct bearing on the implementation processes, Impact, and sustainability. They include: -

- i. Cost recovery element that has initiated the process of sustainability of veterinary services in the region and has purged relief dependency syndrome in this regard setting an evidence-based example of self-reliance that can be emulated by other public service sectors in Southern Sudan.
- ii. Establishment of community based institutions (RULIDO & CULIDO) to manage the animal health care delivery system that has created strong community ownership of the livestock health care system.

The major design weaknesses in this component are:

- i. Failure to factor in engaging the emerging Government proactively at decision making capacity in the strategic and operational management of the component which otherwise could lend a valuable hand in mentoring the Government for eventual management of the service.
- ii. The design has not set collaboration parameters by way of mutually agreed upon Memorandums of Understanding (MOU) with key partners in the component namely Government, RULIDO and CULIDO. Lack of such agreements can lead to unwarranted deviation from the project focus by any of the parties to the utter dismay of the other parties. The evaluation exercise has established that the Government has started poaching the best of the personnel who were hitherto managing both RULIDO and CULIDO and putting unacceptable demands on the cost recovery money. So far there is no instrument to counter or regulate such moves.

Nevertheless, these design errors of omission cannot be said to have lessened the potential impact of the project but if not addressed can affect sustainability of the Oxfam initiated veterinary services delivery intervention.

2.1.2 The situation of Veterinary Services in the project area prior to Oxfam intervention

From the accounts of the Government officials and community leaders, it is Oxfam that initiated the livestock veterinary services in the area way back in 1995 and has since then sustained and improved on it. Animal health services were previously provided by the government but stopped in 1983 when the civil war broke out.

Rinderpest was prevalent and Oxfam took a leading implementation role in its control in the Lakes State through mass vaccinations and surveillance. Mass vaccination of rinderpest ceased as from year 2002 and the region is no longer classified as infected; it is classified as a surveillance zone which is a step to potential final eradication.

The 2006 rinderpest sero-surveillance by VSF Belgium did not find any cases of rinderpest in the Lakes State.

The impact of the veterinary services intervention was summed up by a CAHW in Rumbek thus:

Quote

“When Oxfam left after a disagreement with SRRA on MOU, we almost lost our entire livestock to diseases, even a number of people died of eating meat of diseased animals, I can't forget that time”

Table 1: Ranking of what were the livestock sector problems 3 years ago from the herders perspective

Problem	Lack drugs	Animal Diseases	Lack of Water	Lack of CAHWs	Tick infestation	Score	Rank
Lack of drugs						4	1
Animal diseases						3	2
Lack of water						2	3
Lack of CAHWs						1	4
Tick infestation						0	5

Table 2: Ranking of the current livestock sector problems from the herders perspective

Problem	Lack Water	Insecurity	Lack of Markets	Expensive drugs	Tick infestation	Score	Rank
Lack Water						4	1
Insecurity						3	2
Lack of Markets						2	3
Expensive drugs						1	4
Tick infestation						0	5

Note

A comparison of 3 years ago ranking and current ranking of the sector problems by herders clearly shows that the level of livestock vaccination and treatment has risen remarkably.

2.1.3 Performance of the Component

S/N	Planned Outputs	Level of Achievements
	Financial Capital	
1.1	Livestock disease outbreaks are reported and preliminary investigations are done within 24-48 hours.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o CAHWs have been sufficiently trained and sensitised on management of disease outbreak and the necessary supervision/referral system is in place for collection of serum samples for advanced investigations. o It was confirmed by the State Deputy Director in-charge of animal Health and Disease control that the project has routinely achieved even better than planned in reporting and conducting preliminary investigations of disease outbreaks. Quote "CAHWs live with herders at the cattle camps and anytime there are signs of an epidemic serum samples reach here within an average of 12-36 hours from the time telling symptoms are spotted."
1.2	Active and purposive surveillance system for rinderpest and other endemic livestock diseases in place and maintained throughout.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Rinderpest eradication in the Lakes State is coordinated by VSF Belgium but Oxfam is a key implementation actor on the ground through its strong animal health care delivery structures of community based animal health workers; many trained through the Unwrapped Project. These are the structures that are being used for direct surveillance of rinderpest including community education on rinderpest. o The 2006 rinderpest sero-surveillance by VSF Belgium did not find any cases of rinderpest in the Lakes State.
1.3	At least 250,000 livestock in the project area are vaccinated and treated against major diseases annually. <i>(However this output target was revised by the Christmas catalogue to a total of 100,000.)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o According to the available records at Oxfam field office and at both RULIDO and J[CULIDO 78,331 livestock had been vaccinated and treated as at February 2007, two months ahead of the close of the project period. It is expected by the officials of the MARF that the 100,000 target will be achieved by end of April 2007.
1.4	To establish 4 community managed drug shops.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o This output was not achieved; no community managed drug shops had been established. It was explained that the project funding principles did not allow investment in drug shops
1.5	To establish 3 auction centres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o This output has not been achieved; no new auction centre has been established. It was explained that the project funding principles did not allow investment in auction centres.
	Human Capital	
1.6	10 stock persons join the community-based animal health delivery structure to provide technical and supervisory support.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o 8 AHA and 2 stock persons have been trained. All male.
1.7	45 new CAHWs are trained and active in animal health service provision	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o 45 new CAHWs (3 of them women) were trained for 2 weeks in February 2007 o 50 of the existing active CAHWs underwent a 5 day refresher course (6 of them women). Cumulatively there exists about 100

		active CAHWs ○ Of the 100 or so active CAHWs, only 9 are women ³ which the Government officials consider to be good enough in what is traditionally a male occupation.
--	--	--

Photo # 1: **A Herd of Healthy looking Cattle and healthy Children in a Cattle Camp in Cueibet**

[Photo Removed]

Note

One of the planned outputs of the Unwrapped Project was to have 60% of the livestock in Rumbek and Cueibet in good body condition. The herd above which is representative of the general situation clearly shows cattle that are in good body condition and it is therefore proper to state that the project component has fully achieved the set target.

2.1.4 Other Proxy Component Outcomes

1. Oxfam has maintained steady pre-positioned supply of the essential vaccines and drug which are dispensed through RULIDO and CULIDO a fact that has been stated by the herders and the Government officials. This strategy has enabled fast and efficient response to livestock disease outbreaks.
2. The intensive livestock vaccination and treatment coverage facilitated by Oxfam has led to substantive increase in the population of livestock over the last 2 years as indicated by the

³ Few women are trained as CAHW partly because they lack education entry requirements and the job is generally viewed as a “man’s” job

increasing animal turn out at the auction centres and the increasing number of herds. This is according to the Deputy Director of Animal Health in the Lakes State which was collaborated by the herders themselves in the cattle camps.

3. Due to the cost recovery strategy in the implementation of this intervention, the herders have shed off relief reliance in respect to veterinary services to their livestock and are always ready to marshal the required resources for vaccination and treatment of their livestock.
4. Due to lack of adequate element of community education and dialogue in the implementation of this component, a substantial proportion of herders are treating their livestock on their own, in most cases administering under-doses and in worse scenarios using the wrong medication including drugs meant for human usage. In an environment with weak regulatory mechanism such as the Lakes State, this practice has the potential to create drug resistance bugs which would have disastrous consequences on the future of the livestock economy.
5. Failure by the project to establish the 4 community managed drug shops and the 3 new auction centres after sharing the proposal with the government and community leaders is mirroring Oxfam suspiciously. Some of the people interviewed implied that funds earmarked for drug shops and auction centres could have been diverted to other uses. This came out vividly from the Government officials at both state and county levels, and the RULIDO, and CULIDO members.

2.1.5 Observations

- o The evaluation exercise was conducted during the dry season when grass is considerably less yet the livestock looked reasonably healthy.
- o Oxfam is acknowledged by the Government, UN Agencies, other NGOs and the community as the leading player in animal health sector in the Lakes State.
- o Despite its relatively weak capacity, the Government is keen to take over charge of the animal healthcare services from the community institutions that have been managing the service with the support of Oxfam.
- o The Government has already absorbed the Stockpersons who were the most senior technical managers of the community based veterinary service delivery system as County level veterinary service heads and put them on a regular salary while others have joined the Government in other capacities. Given that the CBOs do not have any regulatory authority and their power is only in managing the funds generated by the drugs supplied by Oxfam,

they can unceremoniously be shunted out of the lime-light disrupting the on-going service delivery.

- o The potential of livestock in bolstering livelihoods is highly underutilised; the evaluation team saw many bulls degenerating with age and losing their value at the cattle camps. In the evaluation meetings with the community and herders particularly the women, food was rated first as what they lack most followed by medical services for their children yet their husbands owned cattle in the range of 20 - 100. With effective commercialisation and reorientation of cultural perspectives, livestock has the potential to substantially contribute to self-reliance in livelihoods and poverty reduction.
- o Livestock products: utilisation of livestock products such as milk, hides and skins, horns, and hooves in improving livelihoods has not been optimised as yet. A lot of raw hides and skins and horns were seen in dump sites in towns and cattle camps. The volume of the milk produced in the Lakes State is low and disproportionate to huge population of milk cows in the region. Tea shops in the big and small towns use imported powder milk and upon inquiry, they claimed that fresh local milk was not available. This was corroborated at the cattle camps where a herd of about 700 - 1,000 cattle was said to produce only an average of 40 – 50 litres of milk per day and the people at the cattle camps don't have surplus to take to the villages. This is an area for the Government and its development partners to ponder if the economic potential of the livestock sector is to be fully realised.
- o Veterinary extension services are grossly inadequate. The current crop of CAHWs basically concentrates on curative needs and is not well equipped to deal with disease preventive aspects of the service other than the vaccinations. This was explicit from their refresher training programme and the general sanitation environment at the cattle camps where they live and carcasses of animals that had died of sickness were scattered. (see photo 2 below)

Photo # 2: **A carcass of a bull that died of unknown disease at a cattle camp**

[Photo Removed]

2.1.6 Challenges Encountered in the Project Implementation Process

It was established that the project had to deal with the following challenges in the delivery of veterinary services:

- Insecurity due to inter-clan and inter-tribal skirmishes and inter and intra governmental politics that raged for the better part of the year 2006. This affected disease control, production, and marketing of livestock.
- Inadequate human, financial, and physical capital to support veterinary public health services that would require extensive extension and supply network services.
- Inadequate cheaper mechanism for preventing and controlling diseases such as controlled livestock movement and quarantine which can only work if the Government structures are established and functioning.
- Inadequate legal regulatory framework for veterinary services including procedures for dispensing drugs and meat inspection.
- Inadequate infrastructure for the cold chain support in the remote but needy livestock sites making access to vaccines and drugs by CAHWs laborious and at times of conflict a high risk undertaking.

2.1.7 Conclusion

In delivery of veterinary services, the project has fully delivered in 5 out of its 7 planned outputs. Only 2 of the planned outputs could not be implemented due to donor funds restrictions. (See 2.1.3 above) Nevertheless the project has reinforced and internalised the concept of the cost recovery that has made veterinary services financially 50% self sustaining⁴ unlike any other social service in Southern Sudan. No doubt this has far reaching positive development impact and likewise the next project phases if any should centre project activities on similar strategies.

2.1.8 Recommendations

- ☑ Oxfam can achieve a lot in improving veterinary services in the Lakes State by tapping on the power of synergy from the many actors already in this sector that includes; the Government, FAO, VSF, NPA, Local NGOs, Private Sector Practitioners and the community. Oxfam being a significant and old timer in the sector should advocate for formation and energising of a Livestock Production Forum in the Lakes State by all the actors where livestock production strategies will be harmonised and the destiny of the sector charted out. This should consider appropriate approaches to

⁴ According to the directorate of animal resources cost recovery funds can meet 50% of drugs and vaccine needs.

developing human resources capacity of the Government personnel and development of efficient and effective working policies and systems.

The objective to be achieved should be to target all the available sector resources to the mutually agreed sector priorities without duplication or contradicting interests by the actors. This can be implemented through a jointly agreed action plan and results to be achieved by each actor.

- ☑ Given that ultimately the delivery of any social economic service is essentially the function and responsibility of the Governments, Oxfam should lead the likeminded actors in encouraging and facilitating the Lakes State Government to assume active responsibility over the management of livestock production currently being handled by RULIDO and CULIDO. The Government should be urged to allocate a budget, develop sector policies that will stimulate growth including effective commercialisation of livestock keeping, and establish regulatory mechanism for control of diseases that will be exercised by veterinarians.
- ☑ Oxfam should gradually shift its partnership ties from RULIDO & CULIDO to the State Government and strengthen it to carry out the roles and responsibilities that were hitherto for RULIDO and CULIDO. This should be in a reformed manner where Oxfam transcends from hands-on roles to facilitative and capacity building.

This is because:

- First and foremost management of livestock health care is a function and responsibility of the Government.
 - The Government will render the necessary budgetary support
 - The Government rather than the community based institutions has the mandate to create the necessary enabling policy environment for the sector.
 - The Government can leverage the necessary resources for more comprehensive intervention in the sector including infrastructure development, value enhancement of livestock products and market expansion, which the community based institutions cannot do.
- ☑ Since it may take time to establish a working methodology with the Government specifically in regard to the management of the on-going community based veterinary services delivery system, a gradual shift can be considered but with an elaborate tripartite agreement with the community institutions currently overseeing the system (RULIDO & CULIDO) and the Government on the project implementation modalities that clearly spells out the roles and responsibilities of each party and to which extent they will be accountable. In this arrangement the Government should assume the responsibility of steering the destiny of the veterinary services while Oxfam focuses on developing the capacity of the human resources and facilitating formulation of sound policies.

- ☑ Oxfam should consider a programming strategy that will promote private sector participation in the delivery of veterinary services such as training the existing AHA and Stock Persons in entrepreneurship skills and encouraging them to venture into private practice to supplement the public sector initiatives. If need be, one or two show cases can be identify and venture capital be provided on a repayable loan arrangement or setting up a venture revolving loan fund as a programming intervention.
- ☑ The next project phase should factor in veterinary public health education activities as a strategy to support the on-going vaccination efforts to reduce disease prevalence and to reduce the cost burden of drugs and vaccines.
- ☑ Due to the low milk yields of the Dinka cows and the need to improve on livestock products, the project should consider introducing higher milk yielding breeds on a small pilot basis such as crossbreeding them with Borans which are as environmentally tolerant as the Dinka cattle but several times superior in milk yields.
- ☑ Oxfam should undertake to lobby the State Government to institute stiff punitive laws against livestock thefts to make the practice utterly unattractive.

2.2.0 The Restocking Project Component

The goat restocking programme was started by Oxfam in Cueibet County in 2002 long before the Unwrapped Project began. The activities of the Unwrapped Project in this regard were a replication of an intervention that had been going on. In total, Oxfam has provided 2,500 breeding goats under the restocking initiatives. The evaluation dealt more with the Unwrapped Project than the former though both programme areas were visited.

2.2.1 Project Design

The unwrapped project set to restock 180 vulnerable women headed households with breeding goats, a replication of the earlier goat restocking initiative in Cueibet and train 60 women in low cost poultry production techniques.

The overall objective of the restocking project component is:- to increase the financial capital of vulnerable women-headed households.

The specific objectives are:-

- To empower 180 vulnerable women headed households with productive assets in form of 1, 800 breeding stock of goats to be able to establish a stable base for their lives in Rumbek Central.
- To have 60 women increase their household incomes and improve their dietary value by learning low cost poultry production methods.

Strategies and approaches to goats restocking intervention include:-

- Formation of a community based committee to oversee the running of the goat assets multiplication and distribution scheme.
- Providing 10 mature goats; 9 female 1 male to each carefully selected vulnerable woman headed household for breeding.
- A requirement by the scheme that the initial beneficiaries equally restock other vulnerable women headed households by passing over a proportion of the off-springs of their breeding stock to them.
- Oxfam to provide vaccines and drugs back-up to the beneficiaries of the goat scheme free of charge.

2.2.2 Analysis of the component design: There are major design weaknesses that have a direct bearing on the implementation processes, Impact and Sustainability of this component: -

- i. The targeted women beneficiaries of the restocking scheme were in reality being stocked for the first time and indeed not being restocked for none owned goats or similar productive assets prior to the project intervention. In the circumstance the project in a way overlooked the necessary orientation of the first time owners of productive assets on the enterprising and management skills of such productive assets and the wholesome empowerment objective of the scheme including the gender perspective. Lack of orientation on the empowerment objective made the women goat beneficiaries to continue seeking permission from their male relatives when disposing off the goats. Also, changing the gender roles and perspectives in 2 years was not realistic.

2.2.3 The Situation of the Goat Beneficiaries Prior to the Intervention

- All the goat beneficiaries were widows with dependant children and no tangible livelihood assets because customarily upon death of the husband all his wealth and dependants are inherited by close relatives.
- They had resigned themselves to fate having been made to believe they are largely supposed to be dependent on their communities for survival. But they should be forgiven as the society is too rigid and usually pushing women and in particular widows to the periphery of decision making in regard to wealth creating assets.
- They were first and foremost selected to benefit from the goat restocking scheme because they lived in their matrimonial homes according to custom without material support from the adult male in-laws but who still may exercise control over them including conjugal rights.

2.2.4 Performance of the Component

S/N	Planned Outputs	Level of Achievements
	Financial Capital	
2.1	At least 180 vulnerable women headed	o The project managed to restock only 90 vulnerable women

	households benefit from the goat restocking scheme.	headed household in the first year and the balance 50% in the second year.
2.2	180 beneficiaries of the goat restocking scheme are trained in goat husbandry.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o 180 women beneficiaries of the goats restocking scheme were trained in goat husbandry methods whose standard content includes; aspects of feeding, housing, milking and milk hygiene, reproduction cycle and management of diseases. o The training content does not touch on all the important assets management skills and empowerment sensitisation including the gender viewpoint.
2.3	Distribution of the second generation of goats to the second tier of beneficiaries from the off-springs of the initial beneficiaries.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Distribution of the second generation of restocking goats has not taken place, restocking committees say there are no goats to redistribute, the net stock available is either less than what was distributed or has minimally increased due to death, thefts, or disposed off by the beneficiaries. o 15 beneficiaries who were sampled randomly and a combined stock of 148 goats out of 150 given.
2.4	4 poultry production demonstration farms are established.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o This planned output never started. It was explained that the initiative was put on hold upon the outbreak of bird flu in Juba and parts of northern Sudan.
2.5	60 women are trained in appropriate poultry keeping techniques.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o This planned output did not take place. It was explained that the initiative was put on hold upon the outbreak of bird flu in Juba and parts of northern Sudan.

Photo #3: A beneficiary of the goat restocking scheme with what has remained of the original breeding stock

[Photo Removed]

2.2.5 The Main Component Results

1. Poor widows who had no chance to own livestock now do, this has upgraded their social status and observably bolstering their self esteem and the necessary confidence to soldier-on with life.

2. The milk from the goats though too little because the particular goat variety normally yields little milk has however added nutrition value into their household diets particularly to children.
3. The goats have not multiplied as anticipated and the growth of household stocks have either stagnated or dwindled. Of the 15 beneficiary randomly sampled the highest had a stock of 19 goats while the lowest had 3 goats. Ideally a stock of 9 female goats and 1 male should optimally grow to 37 and minimally to 28 in one year. However it should be noted that the evaluation sample size was statistically small and may not have been fully representative.
4. It has not been possible to distribute the second generation of goats as expected even from the Cueibet beneficiaries who received 1,600 goats from the scheme between years 2002 and 2005 simply because the goats are not there due to various reasons that include weak husbandry methods, consumption, and bad asset management.
5. 15 beneficiaries sampled during the evaluation out of 180 beneficiaries under unwrapped project said that they still seek approval of their male relatives to sell the goats or to exchange them with a heifer or a bull.
6. Restocking beneficiaries either get a male relative to sell a goat for them or have to give lengthy explanations at the auction centres in order to be allowed to sell them since women are not normally allowed to attend livestock auctions. This limits the intended project control over the goat assets by women.

2.2.6 Other Proxy Component Outcomes

1. The intervention has created a sense of cohesion and sisterhood among the widows. It was established that they identify with their fellow widows and have even formed support groups; some had even offered to represent the cases of others who were absent at the evaluation meetings. ***(This is an opportunity to expound on gender concerns in terms of ready entry points for gender equity sensitisation)***

2.2.7 Observations

- o Both the restocking committees and the restocking beneficiaries look at the restocking scheme just like one other of the general relief interventions that have been going on in the area; hence all manner of ploys to avoid giving off goats' off-springs for redistribution. They would like to see Oxfam buy and distribute more goats than spread what they have.
- o All the 180 goat beneficiaries are women while the restocking committees who select beneficiaries and are tasked with the responsibility of overseeing redistribution are predominantly men.

- o Other than bolstering their self-esteem, the restocking beneficiaries have not benefited much, either because of inexperience in livestock husbandry or limited enterprise orientation or both. This can be explained by the fact that none has been able to double their stock even those who were given goats five years ago.
- o In its present form and circumstances, the restocking project is incapable of self-elasticity that would cause the desired multiplier effect to contribute to improving household food and income security. Oxfam has identified the component weaknesses and will be dropped in the next project phase.

2.2.8 Conclusion

Given the amount of the investment in this intervention vis-à-vis the level of outputs and taking into account that it is meant to be a growth oriented not a relief intervention, the intervention has not succeeded and it is necessary for Oxfam to internally re-evaluate its worth. The evaluation consultant was informed that Oxfam has recognised the weaknesses in this component and is planning to drop them in future programme intervention.

2.2.9 Recommendations

- ☑ The project should consider lifting the suspension of the promotion of poultry keeping that does not have direct 'handouts' instead of goat restocking intervention.
- ☑ Continue supporting veterinary needs of the restocked goats but drop the need to get goats' off-springs for the second generation distribution.
- ☑ Discontinue goats restocking as an intervention to improve household food and income security.
- ☑ Embrace women empowerment and design truly women empowering interventions that conform to available funding prerequisites to activate the latent potential of women in improving livelihoods.

2.3.0 Promotion of Honey Production

Honey is a major resource and a leading traditional livelihood base for the Jurbel and Bongo communities of Wulu County and Ngap Payam, yet its resourcefulness remains largely underdeveloped. The latent economic potential of honey in Wulu was in the past noticed by CEAS who were working in the area in 1996. CEAS then made spirited attempts to sensitise the community on commercialising the honey resource but the efforts did not go far because by that time insecurity due to civil war was high and the cash economy almost non-existent.

In Wulu, the average annual honey production by the traditional methods is approximated at 175 litres per beekeeper and the county has a population of about 80,000 with 13,000 households of which 90% produce some amount of honey.

2.3.1 Project Design

The overall objective of the component is to increase the financial capital of the community by supporting the primary producers to improve on honey production and processing.

The specific objectives are:-

- 200 Beekeepers acquire improved skills in honey production and processing; and are organised into cohesive efficient honey producing and marketing associations.

Implementation Strategies and Approaches include:

- Introduction of the more efficient and bee friendly Kenya Top Bar (KTB) hive for training and demonstration.
- Introduction of bee friendly honey harvesting gear that includes gloves, the smoker, and protective clothing.
- Training in the manufacture and operations of the Kenya Top Bar hives.

2.3.2 Analysis of the component design: At the face of it, the component implementation approaches are adequate to improve honey production several folds. However, the prime motivator for large-scale production of any product beyond subsistence production is marketability for profitable monetary returns.

- A large amount of honey is currently being produced in the traditional methods without the use of the enhanced production methods such as KTB hives or protective clothing.
- Honey production being a major traditional livelihood base, nearly every Jurbel household keeps bees and what is crowded and insufficient is the market outlets for the available and any increased

stocks for Beekeepers to earn an income that can improve their living standards.

2.3.3 The Situation of Honey Production in Wulu Prior to Oxfam Intervention

To capture the situation of honey production prior to the Oxfam intervention, the evaluation team interviewed a group of 13 (6 Women, 7 Men) beekeepers; the Senior Inspector of Animals Resource and SRRC County Secretary. The following was articulated.

- ☛ Honey production is a traditional Jurbel livelihood occupation and therefore the project is not introducing the activity but leveraging on-going initiatives. Likewise KTB hives are not totally new in the community, CEAS attempted to introduce them in 1996/7 but the effort was not sustained and it fizzled out.
- ☛ The community has been using the traditional methods of distilling honey that include boiling and squeezing and selling the same within Wullu and at times to Rumbek when it is peaceful.
- ☛ The most significant uses of honey outside of domestic consumption are ceremonial, such as paying bride price and making traditional beer. Other market outlets outside the community have been very limited due to the past war and now lack of marketing skills, organised marketing structures, and competition from equatoria. One second-hand dress has been exchanging for 10 litres of honey while the same dress can be bought at US \$ 7 in cash.

2.3.4 Performance of the Component

S/N	Planned Outputs	Level of Achievements
3.1	Provide 40 KTB hives for training demonstrations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 20 KTB hives have been provided for training demonstrations
3.2	200 beekeeping households learn and adopt improved honey production and processing skills and double their income from honey.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Only 100 beekeepers in wullu have so far been trained in operating the KTB hives and taught how to harvest honey in their traditional hives using a smoker. Beekeepers in Ngap are yet to be trained in all this. ○ There has not been any honey processing training outside of the known traditional ways of processing honey.
3.3	Provide honey processing equipment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Honey processing equipment were not provided, only honey harvesting gear (20 sets) were provided less the boots whose whereabouts are to be investigated by the livelihood manager. ○ The project implementation staff interprets the honey harvesting gear to mean honey processing equipment. Honey processing equipment refers to honey refining and bee wax moulding equipment. A clarification on what was intended is necessary.
3.4	The trained beekeepers are supported to form associations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Beekeepers have not yet been facilitated to form associations. So far they operate in clusters of 5 members which are necessitated by the sharing of one KTB hive and a set of honey harvesting gear provided by the project for demonstration purposes.
3.5	A resource person is engaged to conduct training and provide follow-up.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ A resource person to conduct training and follow-up was engaged.

Photo # 4: **A member of the Beekeepers that was trained by the project donning honey harvesting protective cloths provided by the project**

[Photo Removed]

Note

The boots are missing

Photo # 5: **A KTB demonstration hive atop a tree in Wulu**

[Photo removed]

Note

All hives KTB or the traditional variety are normally hanged high up trees to avoid being burnt by the frequent bush fires that ravage the area frequently.

2.3.5 Observations

- ⌘ Already a lot of honey is being produced in Wullu using the traditional hives and harvesting methods.
- ⌘ The honey produced in Wullu can qualify to be classified as the high value organic honey given that the bees in the area feed from natural vegetation devoid of chemical and synthetic matter.
- ⌘ The project has introduced KTB hives which require to be manufactured with soft wood that is not locally available and has to be imported from Uganda while the traditional hives are made from locally available bamboo. In order to escape the frequent bush fires all the hives traditional and KTB are hanged high up on the tallest trees available.

- ⚙️ The project intervention has set 20 demonstration clusters mainly to train local Beekeepers on how to operate the KTB hives and use of protective clothes that are not available locally to 6,000 households of Beekeepers in 2 Payams. 20 demonstration hives are unlikely to have noticeable effect in 6,000 households
- ⚙️ Doubling or tripling honey production will not necessarily translate to increased incomes unless there is corresponding market expansion for the produce that pays what is value for the inputs of the beekeepers.
- ⚙️ Currently honey production is not a problem at all to the community of Wullu, the problem is marketing what they have and earning a fair price for their produce. 13 Beekeepers (6 women and 7men) randomly sampled for the evaluation had honey stocks ranging from 20 to 80 Kgs for women and 40 to 180 Kgs for men all produced using the traditional hives.

2.3.7 Conclusion

Promotion of honey production among the Jurbel community is a good idea but the current pressing need is lack of an organised honey marketing system that earns the Beekeepers a worthwhile income. The KTB hives are modern and easy to operate but expensive and unsustainable when the main raw material, the timber has to be imported and is bound to be expensive and unattractive to Beekeepers who are used to hives that do not cost them money to make. However if the hives' soft wood raw material can be produced locally, the project would have all the justification to promote the KTB hives.

What is really lacking in the community is not honey harvesting skills but honey processing skills including, wax extraction, honey refining, and packaging for urban market consumption in such places as Rumbek, Juba or even export markets. The current packaging in jerry cans misses the market segment of small scale consumers who cannot afford or do not need a jerry can but just half a Kg. This consumer segment is large and rapidly expanding than the large skill jerry can consumer.

The other priority need by the Wullu beekeepers is an organised honey marketing system that is capable of creating marketing efficiency and reasonable producer prices.

2.3.8 Recommendations

- ☑ The project should consider providing the simple and appropriate technology honey processing and bee wax moulding equipment such as; weighing scales, filters, and wax moulds in a cost recovery scheme akin to the livestock vaccines and drugs.
- ☑ Alongside honey processing, the project should also consider promoting extraction and marketing of the honeybee wax which is a by-product of honey and generally fetches higher unit prices than honey.
- ☑ The project should focus more into organising the beekeepers into viable production and marketing entities that can access and disseminate market information to members than on KTB hives that are clearly not sustainable and add little net value into the production efficiency.

2.4.0 Promotion of Land Tillage with Ox ploughs

As much as the communities in the Lakes State are primarily cattle keepers, crop production plays a key role in guaranteeing household and community food security. Thus any intervention to improve crop production is of high impact value in bolstering livelihoods.

Customarily crop production in the Lakes State is of small scale subsistence nature with an average farm size of 1 hectare per household.

It is against this background that Oxfam partnered with a local indigenous NGO, Africa Partnership Aid for Rehabilitation and Development (APARD) to promote increase in land tillage using Ox-plough technology in Rumbek East, Rumbek Central, Cuibet counties. Since inception as ANV in 1995, APARD as at 2007 had cumulatively provided slightly over 4,000 Ox-plough to farmers in the Lakes State. FAO estimates over 6,000 Ox-ploughs have been distributed in the Lakes State by various agencies over time.

2.4.1 Project Design

The overall component objective is to increase financial capital of the communities by supporting primary crop producers through a partnership arrangement with indigenous institutions.

The implementation approaches include:-

- To partner and provide agricultural support services and facilities such as Ox-ploughs through indigenous institutions.

2.4.2 Analysis of the component design: Working in partnership with indigenous institutions in the delivery of household agricultural services has high precision in beneficiary targeting and is cost effective.

- ◇ APARD has long and sterling track record (Since 1995) in promotion of Ox-plough technology and therefore the ideal partner in this intervention.
- ◇ The intervention is only to supply Ox-plough but lacks in crop husbandry support which is a more critical factor in increasing crop production in the project area.

2.4.3 The Situation of Ox-plough Technology Prior to the Project Intervention

- APARD has been in the business of promoting ox-plough technology for a long time and has been distributing an average of 400 ox-ploughs per year.
- For a long time there has been many organisations interested in providing APARD with ox-ploughs; some as a one off intervention and others have long term relationship with APARD. However few have shown interest in supporting crop husbandry and post harvest extension services despite the obvious big need illustrated by limited farmer education on needs such as appropriate pest control methods; post harvest storage methods; use of ox-ploughs in weeding; and crop diversification.

2.4.4 Performance of the Component

S/N	Planned Outputs	Level of Achievements
4.1	150 Ox-plough are being used by subsistent farmers to increase crop production.	o Sufficient funds were availed to APARD to procure and distribute 150 ox-ploughs to farmers. An Oxfam staff supervised actual distribution of ploughs.
4.2	450 subsistent farmers acquire skills to utilise ox-plough technology	o APARD trained 450 farmers in usage of Ox-plough technology.

2.4.5 Main Component Results

1. There has been conspicuous increase in food crop production in the areas where ox-plough land tillage is popular. During the evaluation mission, expansive farm lands were seen and a lot of grains in household stores and at the market places.
2. Less heavy input of farm labour is required by farmers using Ox-ploughs and hence even households that have few able bodied members have managed to consistently achieve household food surplus.
3. Ox-ploughing has been commercialised by a few people who till land for others at a fee. This development is reducing the need for every household to own a plough or Oxen.

Photo # 6: Millet and Sorghum in store of an ox-plough beneficiary

[Photo Removed]

Photo # 7: Ox-ploughs heaped in one of APARD stores ready for distribution

[Photo Removed]

2.4.6 Observations

- ◇ There is a good number of Ox-ploughs in the community (estimated at over 6,000) against estimated 15,000 ha of cultivated land. (Source FAO)
- ◇ From the accounts of the agriculture key players including the Government, FAO, APARD and SRRC it is apparent that resources available for agriculture extension services in crop husbandry, crop protection, post harvest crop management, crop diversification, and marketing are below what is bare minimum. Without these services land tillage on its own will not increase food security.
- ◇ APARD is shifting its attention more towards crop diversification extension services than Ox-ploughing that includes vegetable growing and fruit tree planting. Currently APARD is not quite enthusiastic to receive grants for ploughs only without support for the extension services that are called upon by the use of plough. *Off the cuff, that is one of the reasons why they did not respond to the call for proposals by Oxfam in 2006 though other pressures were also in play.*

Oxfam followed the call for proposals with a meeting to confirm that the funding would cover all project costs such as training and office administration not just the Ox-plough hardware

- ◇ Currently APARD sells ploughs to the end user at Sudanese Pounds 40,000 (about US \$ 100)
- ◇ Plough spare parts are sold at cost by APARD and other private entrepreneurs.
- ◇ Private sector entrepreneurs are supplying a lot of equipment and machinery in Rumbek town including motorcycles at very competitive prices. This demonstrates that there is private sector ability to supply ox-ploughs if NGOs were not giving them free.

2.4.7 Conclusion

The ox-ploughs supplied under the component have contributed to increase of the amount of crop that is being produced in the target area as well as crop production efficiency.

The relative importance of providing ox-ploughs will vary from one area to another. For instance in Rumbek East where it has been the headquarters of APARD for the last 12 years, providing ploughs there may have lesser value than some other places. Oxfam may achieve higher impact of the ox-plough intervention by pointing to partners the locations where its investment should be targeted and if not to drop the intervention all together.

Moreover given that APARD is reselling the freely donated ox-ploughs for 40,000 Sudanese Pounds each, and farmers are buying, then it is prudent for Oxfam and other development agencies to identify other crop production support niche and leave ox-ploughs to the rapidly growing private sector.

2.4.8 Recommendations

- ☑ Oxfam should consider dropping provision of ox-ploughs and instead partner with APARD in pioneering promotion of fruit tree and vegetable growing which APARD is diversifying in and which they consider to be seriously lacking in the Lakes State.
- ☑ Oxfam should consider supporting the Government through technical assistance to develop viable agricultural promotion policies and practices at the grassroots levels e.g. demonstration initiatives and training.
- ☑ Improve on monitoring the utilisation and effectiveness of investments to partners including the Government.

3.0 OVERARCHING ISSUES

In overall terms the evaluation took note of the following crosscutting project implementation issues.

3.1 Service Delivery

The evaluation process examined the project operating environment to establish indirect factors that come into play in the project implementation processes and in the achievement of the desired impact.

- **Services:** The Unwrapped Project is delivering socio-economic services that are appropriate and are contributing to improving not only household livelihoods but also productivity of the general community of the Lakes State, filling in a critical gap that is due to war historical factors and the genuine limitations of the current Government. Both the project and Oxfam enjoy wide acceptability by the Government, community, partners and collaborators.
- **Challenges in service delivery:** The project implementation teams including staff and partners such as community based veterinary personnel are routinely pressurised by the Government and community to provide services way above their niche. This includes demands to provide relief food, water, means of transport etc. This can be attributed to lack of seasoned public administrators in the Ministry of Agriculture and the Veterinary departments that the project is working closely with.
- Lack of clear policies and regulatory instruments particularly in the management of veterinary affairs is another challenge to the project that can only be ameliorated by supporting the Government to develop its capacity in policy formulation and implementation.

4.0 Final Conclusion

Through the activities of the Unwrapped Project, Oxfam has proactively participated and has internalised to the communities the OLS initiated cost recovery system on veterinary drugs provided by NGOs. The positive development impact of effectively managing the cost recovery initiative in the veterinary sector within a relief oriented environment is massive and difficult to quantitatively quantify. In this process, Oxfam has established itself as an excellent facilitator of sustainable development in the Lakes State.

The project formulation and implementation is heavy on the veterinary component and consequently the achievements of the other project components though equally important in the achievement of the project goal which is improving household food and income security, have not matched the veterinary component.

As a whole, the implementation shortcomings noted by the evaluation are largely inherent in the projects design than implementation lapses. (See *component findings*)

If there will be an immediate unwrapped project phase, it will be necessary to review the present programming priorities; particularly in regard to the effectiveness and efficiencies of goat restocking, provision of ox-ploughs, and the developmental value of KTB hive whose principal raw material is to be imported.

5.0 Key Recommendations

- » Oxfam should encourage entry of private practitioners in the delivery of veterinary services even if it calls for establishment of a short-term working capital credit scheme to the local veterinarians who have demonstrated capacity and willingness to enter into private practice.
- » The next phase of the unwrapped project should consider developing a poultry keeping component particularly targeting women beneficiaries.
- » The unwrapped project should re-evaluate to what extent of value addition are the KTB hives in increasing incomes of Beekeepers vis-à-vis an organised honey marketing system.
- » Oxfam should always have a clear Cooperation Agreement with its programmes implementation partners spelling out roles and responsibilities of each partner to what each party is accountable. This will help reinforce responsibility and clarity of limits.
- » Oxfam should consider investing in mentoring county level Government staff in its programme sectors through supportive guardianship for the ongoing initiatives to be sustainable.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Terms of Reference

Background and context

The implementation of the Oxfam unwrapped project in the Lakes and Western Equatoria States of Southern Sudan started in May 2005 and ended in December 2006 in Western Equatoria, while it will continue up to April 2007 in the lakes. As a whole, Southern Sudan has a long history of underdevelopment and conflict. Since independence of Sudan in 1956, there has been a civil war, apart from a period of peace between 1972 and 1983. Millions of people have been killed, displaced or became refugees. The prolonged conflict has created what is described as a chronic, complex emergency whereby development has been prevented, infrastructure destroyed and trade and transport routes disrupted. Schools and health facilities are almost non-existent, and administrative structures are minimal with limited resources. In order to bring the civil war to an end, the Government of Sudan (GoS) and the Sudan Peoples Liberation Movement/Army (SPLM/A) held peace talks in Kenya from July 2003 that culminated in a comprehensive peace agreement (CPA) that was signed on 9th of January, 2005. The progress of the peace process has led to the spontaneous return of hundreds of thousands of internally displaced persons from the north to the south during 2004-2005. Spontaneous returns have continued into 2007.

While the CPA is still holding, local South-South conflicts continue in much of the South and the Lords Resistance Army is becoming an increasingly destabilizing presence in areas near to Uganda and DRC. In the Lakes, intra-ethnic conflict over grazing land and water points, as well as cattle raiding, escalated in 2006 and affected project activities. While an outbreak of avian influenza (bird flu) was confirmed in Juba in led to the suspension of poultry promotion activities.

Problem statement

Due to the civil war, livelihoods of the communities in the Lakes State deteriorated gradually as life has been under constant threat. This disrupted and severely eroded the traditional coping mechanisms, thus leading to a state of hopelessness, low food production and the tendency to rely on relief supplies. Breakdown of veterinary services – still largely relief oriented - poses a big threat to livestock, which is the main livelihood source for the community. The necessary social institutions and networks that would enhance the community's capacity for ensuring increased food production, livelihoods viability and sustainability have been lacking due to the conflict.

Furthermore, the return of those displaced, whether internally or as refugees, following the signing of the comprehensive peace agreement, presents additional challenges to food security due to increased competition of available resources. Spontaneous returns have already started to a small extent. The United Nations Sustainable Returns Unit estimate that 180,000 people will transit through the programme area and at least 30,000 will settle and integrate with the resident population. In order to promote a sustainable return process and integration, it was imperative that livelihood assets are reinforced among the resident communities.

The project targets pastoral communities whose livelihood has been grossly undermined by civil strife. Livestock keeping is the main source of livelihood in the project area. When food is scarce, livestock are exchanged/traded to enable households acquire grain. The rich support poorer groups with livestock to exchange for food during hunger times. Livestock is the most livelihood asset and is an important source of meat and milk, especially during hunger time. Interventions that enhance viability and sustainability of the livestock production system in the Lakes and builds on local knowledge and capacity make the project extremely relevant to the target group.

In addition, the continuing and widespread use of oxen to till crop fields has a significantly increased the size of land under cultivation and subsequently the crop yields among the contact and surrounding farmers. This positive impact of the ox-plough technology is expected to increase in the coming seasons as the number of adopters increase.

Moreover, promoting appropriate crop production methods such as the use of oxen ploughs will provide opportunities for livelihood diversification so as to reduce over-dependency on livestock keeping.

Providing productive assets to women-headed households will reduce vulnerability and enhance self-reliance within the poor socio-economic groups, while building honey production and marketing skills among marginalized groups will promote their food and income security.

Equality in gender relations and diversity

The poorer socio-economic groups account for 15-35%, representing about 20,000 households in the target area. Due to limited own resources, the poor depends on kinship support, sale of labour and wild foods for subsistence, especially during the hunger period (May-July). Women constitute the majority in this category and have limited access to resources than men who control wealth in form of cattle. Women and children may own small animals but mainly depend on men for distribution of assets and other valuable resources. The control of assets/cattle is at the discretion of men who may recall cattle for dowry and other needs. Discussions with women have shown their need to own assets and eventually be self-reliant. Case stories reveal

economic ventures such as petty trade from which women earn income to buy one or two cows. In comparison, men are minimally vulnerable, except in an event of cattle raiding where they stand to lose cattle and other assets they own. Restocking schemes that empower women with assets in form of goats will continue to draw project's support.

In addition, women are major actors in livestock production through their various chores in tending to livestock such as looking after the young stock, milking and nursing the sick. However, it is the men who make most socio-cultural decisions. The project will challenge the status quo by involving women in community dialogue and encouraging their active participation in community-based organization and networks.

Furthermore, women grow 80% to 90% of all food consumed locally. Women farmers (therefore) need better access to credit, agricultural extension services, and training⁵. Special effort will therefore be made through APARD to ensure that women are included when recruiting and training contact farmers and that training and extension methodologies are gender-sensitive.

Changes sought for greater empowerment of poor pastoralists

The project is currently being redesigned to fit within the broader Oxfam GB's 15-year regional pastoral programme initiated in year 2000 for HECA, whose goal is ***"Pastoralist women and men in the region are leading a secure and sustainable life, integrated into political, social and economic systems at national, regional and global levels"***. This is in recognition of the need for a more focused and unified approach to addressing livelihood issues affecting pastoralists in the Horn, East and Central Africa (HECA) region. Of particular concern is the need to strengthen their capacity to influence national and regional policies that would lead to increased formal investment on pastoralism and its recognition as a viable source of livelihood. At the local level, the project is adapting to meet the needs of the more mobile group of the semi-nomadic pastoralists who inhabit Rumbek and Cueibet Counties. The project primarily seeks to empower indigenous structures so that the community is able to take care of their own affairs and the resources they command and advocate for more holistic and integrated development interventions.

Opportunity for OGB partners and allies to build an effective project

OGB has been engaged in relief and development work in the project area since 1994 and has developed a modest wealth of experience to draw upon in future programming. OGB is also a strong member of OLS, which provides a forum for joint decision-making and policy formulation whereby other members are strong allies. OGB aims to build the capacity of local organizations and counterparts to implement livelihood programmes.

⁵ UNFPA. Food for the future: Women, population and food security. UNFPA publication, 1996

Overall objective

The overall objective of the project is to contribute to improving household food and income security of vulnerable communities living in the Lakes State of the Bahr El Ghazal State of southern Sudan and their ability to influence institutions that will improve access to basic services.

Project purpose

The project aims to contribute to improving household food and income by supporting the largely pastoralist Dinkas to increase crop and livestock productivity, and access to markets by strengthen sustainable food production and self-reliance mechanisms among vulnerable communities living in the Lakes State, including both returnees and host population. The main approach for improving livestock productivity has been to develop and support two community-based organizations in the Lakes to deliver animal health services to livestock keepers. The projectIt also seeks to empower women through goat-restocking schemes for vulnerable women-headed households and by promoting poultry production⁶ so as to as improve household diets and women's income. It also targets minority groups comprising of Jurbel and Bongo tribes that depend significantly on beekeeping with honey production and marketing training. The purpose of the project is to strengthen sustainable food production and self-reliance mechanisms among vulnerable communities living in the Lakes State, including both returnees and host population.

Impact objectives

The project aims is to achieve the following impact objectives:

- The financial capital of the communities in the Lakes State is increased by supporting primary producers to improve crop, livestock and honey production and by establishing goat restocking schemes for vulnerable households, especially women-headed ones.
- The human capital of the people living in the Lakes State is developed through building of skills, knowledge and capability for ensuring sustainable and viable food production.

Outcome objectives

The project aims to promote community-based approaches as a sound method of providing basic services to remote rural communities that are constrained by insecurity, poor access, lack of mobility, minimal infrastructure and trade, lack of skilled persons, poor administrative structures and climatic extremes. Enhanced community organization, grass-root decision-making and community participation are key ideas and practices that the project will demonstrate to OLS and counterpart agencies so as to influence policy

⁶ Poultry production activities were planned to start in October 2006 but have been put on hold after a confirmed outbreak of bird flu in Juba in August 2006.

changes among relief and development actors. Promotion of sustainable agricultural practices is expected to contribute significantly to environmental soundness.

Specific project outputs

- Livestock disease outbreaks are reported and preliminary investigations done within 24 to 48 hours
- At least 100,000 livestock in Rumbek and Cueibet vaccinated and treated annually against major endemic diseases by the end of April 2007
- 12 skilled animal health auxiliaries join the community-based animal health delivery structure and provide technical and supervisory support to CAHWs.
- 90 community animal health workers receive refresher training.
- 45 new CAHWs are active and proficient in animal health service provision.
- 4 community-managed veterinary drug shops are established
- 3 livestock auction centres are established
- 4 poultry production demonstration units are established
- At least 60 women and their households utilize low-cost poultry production techniques to earn income improve diet
- At least 180 vulnerable women-headed households are benefiting from restocking.
- At least 450 contact farmers double their crop yields.
- At least 200 bee-keeping households adopt improved honey production and processing skills and double their income from honey sales.

Main activities of the project

- Livestock disease surveillance, procurement and disbursement of drugs and vaccines, treatment and vaccination of livestock on cost sharing basis.
- Training and equipping community animal health workers.
- Facilitating the training of animal health auxiliaries
- Organizational capacity building for local livelihood partners
- Training contact farmers on oxen ploughs
- Distribution of oxen ploughs
- Training on apiculture
- Distribution of apiculture kits
- Restocking - procurement and distribution of goats
- Training restocking beneficiaries on goat husbandry.

Intervention strategy

The intervention strategy has been largely developmental because the area has been relatively stable since it fell under the control of SPLA in 1997. Though, the government has not presented a roadmap vis-à-vis the role of

aid agencies in the development of Southern Sudan, the relationship of aid agencies with the new government is continuously developing better ways of working with appropriate partners such as local groups, indigenous NGOs and small businesses. These partners are being redirected towards cost recovery, reinvestment of profits as a way of empowering them and stopping dependence on Oxfam.

Until the government framework for veterinary healthcare is rolled out, Oxfam is focusing on bringing the community veterinary healthcare organisations it supports into line with acceptable standards by building the capacity of the animal health staff, establishing a functioning cost recovery system and cementing an adequate drug supply chain—with the aim that by the end of 2007 these entities will be self-sufficient or integrated into a government structure. As the Ministry of Animal Resources and Fisheries of the Government of Southern Sudan establishes itself over 2006/7 Oxfam will assess if it is appropriate to support building the capacity of civil servants in local extension offices.

Peace building and conflict mitigation is an integral element to these initiatives, which contribute to a decrease in local conflictsDon't among communities.

Task for the evaluator

Oxfam GB Southern Sudan Programme needs external support in evaluating the project achievements against the set progress and objectives and the impact of the 2-year Unwrapped project. Specific objectives of the evaluation are:

- Assess effectiveness of the project based on the set objectives/targets.
- Assess the extent to which objectives/targets and refined objectives/targets were achieved
- Evaluate the appropriateness of the activities and indicators with respect to problem analysis in the proposal and any other subsequent amendments.
- Relevance of the project with respect to the approach used such as the Community Management Model on the delivery of animal health services
- Review the level of community participation in project planning and implementation whether the project adequately addressed gender equity.
- Capture to what extent the project adequately addressed/promoted gender equity.
- Assess the level of coordination with other stakeholders (INGOs, UN, SINGOs, GoSS, SSRRC, local authorities, etc.)

- Examine cost effectiveness in the delivery of the project activities/impact and give suggestions on improving cost effectiveness in terms of human, material and financial resources
- Assess the level of coordination with other stakeholders, examine cost effectiveness in the delivery of the project activities and identify factors for achievement of the project objectives.
- Assess the sustainability of project with respect to the replication process and long-term partner engagement i.e. government, COBs and local NGOs activities undertaken and give recommendations suggest for enhancement.
- Assess impact of the project on the socio-economic aspects of the beneficiaries lives
- Capture the challenges faced, lessons learnt and emerging best practices during the implementation of the project.
- Advise on best practice to building and working with local livelihood partners.
- Make recommendations on the ways of working with the emerging government so as to feed into the next Unwrapped project.
- Suggest other appropriate modifications to the project design so as to feed into next Unwrapped project.
- Clarify the way forward for livelihood programming in Lakes.

Management

The evaluator will report to the Livelihoods Project Manager with a dotted line reporting to the Programme Manager for Bahr el Ghazal Region.. The Livelihoods Project Manager will be responsible for coordinating the movements of the evaluator at the field level and any other logistical needs.

Methodology

The consultant will be expected to use appropriate methodologies that are consistent with the current development approaches (including participatory rural appraisal methods) and holistically address the evaluation objectives, and provide a clear write up of the methods employed. The methods will have to be presented to and agreed by the management before the commencement of the evaluation. The following possible approaches for conducting the review shall apply:

- Review of the 2-year Unwrapped project proposal, logframe and progress reports.
- With support of Oxfam GB programmes in Lakes, consult with key informants (including Oxfam, INGOs, SINGOs, UN, local leaders, MoAF and MoARF and SSRRC) and beneficiaries to collect data
- Collating and analyses of field assessment data.
- Presentation of findings to programme team and feedback from programme team.
- Production of draft and final report.

The first draft of the report will be due on 10th April 2007. The Programme Manager, Livelihoods Project Manager, Livelihoods Programme Coordinator, will review this draft. Feedback will be given by 17th April 2007 and the final report that must incorporate/address comments/feedback will be submitted on the 23rd April 2007. FINAL PAYMENT WILL ONLY BE GIVEN AFTER OXFAM GB IS SATISFIED WITH THE REPORT.

Expected Output

A comprehensive report is written covering methodologies, project achievements, appropriateness of the intervention, cost effectiveness, constraints, lessons learnt, emerging best practices, recommendations and the way forward for improvement in the next Unwrapped project.

Timeframe

The task will take a total of 3 weeks (21 days) as follows:

Activity	# Days	Dates
Consultative and briefing meetings with Oxfam GB in Nairobi	1	26 March
Literature review and development of the evaluation tools	2	27-28 March
Field level data and information collection (Rumbek)	10	3-13 April
Data analysis and writing draft report	4	16-19 April
Debriefing/Dissemination meeting/circulating draft report	1	20 April
Final report	3	26-28 April
TOTAL	21	

- Travel Nairobi-Rumbek on Delta Connection – 2nd April 2007
- Travel Rumbek-Nairobi on Delta Connection – 14th April 2007

Competencies of the evaluator

- Experience in evaluation and review of livelihood/integrated programmes particularly in Southern Sudan.
- Understanding of the Southern Sudan context
- A relevant qualification in any one of the following areas; Agriculture, livestock production, community development, development study, livelihoods)
- A minimum of three years experience in community development programmes of which at least 2 years should be in an emergency environment.
- Willingness to travel at short notice and often in difficult circumstances.
- Well developed interpersonal and team skills and proven ability to be flexible in demanding situations.
- Commitment to Humanitarian Principles and action.

- Demonstrated experience of integrating gender and diversity issues in livelihood programmes.
- Demonstrated experience in evaluating (beyond percentages and numbers) the impact of programmes that work towards addressing gender discrepancies
- Working knowledge of Oxfam and Oxfam programmes (desirable)

Documents provided

- Lakes Unwrapped proposal for 2005-07; narrative, proposal, workplan and logframe.
- Lakes Unwrapped 2005-07 budget
- Unwrapped 6-month progress report for May to October 2005
- Unwrapped 6-month progress report for November 2005 to April 2006
- Unwrapped 6-month progress report for May to October 2006
- Oxfam security guidelines

List of Evaluation Respondents

Appendix 2: Community Groups Interviewed

[Table Removed]

Appendix 3: Organisations Interviewed

[Table Removed]

Appendix 4: Government officials

[Table Removed]

Appendix 5: Oxfam Interviewed

[Table Removed]

© Oxfam GB 2007

First published online by Oxfam GB in 2010.

This document is part of a collection of programme evaluations available from Oxfam GB in accordance with its evaluation policy.

This document was originally written for internal accountability and learning purposes, rather than for external publication. The information included was correct to the evaluator's best knowledge at the date the evaluation took place. The views expressed in this report are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect Oxfam's views.

The text may be used free of charge for the purposes of advocacy, campaigning, education, and research, provided that the source is acknowledged in full. The copyright holder requests that all such use be registered with them for impact assessment purposes. For copying in any other circumstances, or for reuse in other publications, or for translation or adaptation, permission must be secured and a fee may be charged. Email publish@oxfam.org.uk

For further information on the issues raised in this document email phd@oxfam.org.uk

Oxfam is a registered charity in England and Wales (no 202918) and Scotland (SC 039042). Oxfam GB is a member of Oxfam International.

www.oxfam.org.uk